

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING

HELD:

Tuesday, December 13, 2011

LOCATION:

Council Chambers

Scranton City Hall

340 North Washington Avenue

Scranton, Pennsylvania

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL:

JANET EVANS, PRESIDENT

PAT ROGAN, VICE-PRESIDENT

ROBERT MCGOFF

FRANK JOYCE

JOHN LOSCOMBE

NANCY KRAKE, CITY CLERK

JAMIE MARCIANO, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK

BOYD HUGHES, SOLICITOR

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and moment of reflection  
2 observed.)

3 MS. EVANS: Roll call, please.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Here.

6 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

7 MR. ROGAN: Here.

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Here.

10 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce. Mrs.

11 Evans.

12 MR. ROGAN: For the record,  
13 Mr. Joyce I believe is speaking to somebody  
14 in the hallway and Mrs. Evans will be here  
15 later. Please dispense with the reading of  
16 the minutes.

17 MS. KRAKE: THIRD ORDER. NO  
18 BUSINESS AT THIS TIME. We have no clerk's  
19 notes this evening either, Mr. Rogan.

20 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. Do any  
21 council members have announcements to make?  
22 Reverend Simmons, since you were first on  
23 the other list we'll allow you to come up  
24 first.

25 MS. SIMMONS: Good evening, Council.

1 My name is Reverend Kathryn Simmons, and I'm  
2 a life-long Scranton resident. Before I  
3 begin saying what it is I came here to say  
4 tonight, let me tell you that no one knows  
5 better than the AME shelter board of  
6 directors what it is to run a system with no  
7 money or very little and to keep yourself  
8 together and not lash out, so I give  
9 compliment to the council for you being so  
10 kind tonight.

11 And I must tell you that I'm  
12 overwhelmed with the people who came here  
13 tonight who have spoken already because  
14 there was no unkind personal remarks made.  
15 There were remarks made about finances,  
16 there were remarks made about administrative  
17 duties, but there was nothing personal that  
18 was said. And I'm going to tell you  
19 something, as I work across the city these  
20 past 25 years that's one of the reasons  
21 people don't come to council meetings  
22 because they don't want to hear the hatred  
23 and the belligerence that comes when people  
24 get up and here and talk about things that  
25 are necessary and leave the other things

1           alone.

2                         Now, I came here this evening to  
3           talk to you again about those in need. We  
4           are still in need and still accepting all  
5           donations, and for those who want to donate  
6           you can call 570-342-4117, and I will tell  
7           you where our drop-off site is.

8                         Someone called me this past week to  
9           state how upset they were that I had  
10          described Scranton as heaven. They told me  
11          that there is no such place here, but you  
12          and I know better. People who have lived  
13          here a lifetime know that there, indeed, is  
14          a heaven found here. You see, to all those  
15          listening I again repeat Scranton is heaven  
16          for it is a place where all spirits,  
17          humanistic or otherwise, are waiting to help  
18          those in need. No matter what turmoil there  
19          is the answer is always found through love  
20          and hope given to us by the citizens of this  
21          fair city. Even when cries of distrust and  
22          apathy are screaming out, some human spirit  
23          will step forth to come and keep us focused  
24          on our faith and ourselves and our fellow  
25          residents.

1                   I'd like to share a short story with  
2                   you and maybe then you will understand what  
3                   it is that I'm saying to you. Several years  
4                   ago at the AME shelter a young gentleman  
5                   came in, he had to be talked into coming.  
6                   It was a night where the city was considered  
7                   code blue. There was a bad storm in midst  
8                   and we had to go out and talk this gentleman  
9                   into coming into the shelter. He is a  
10                  homeless person who desires to live outside.

11                  When he finally did come in he sat  
12                  with me and I tried to talk to him about why  
13                  he found it a great necessity to sleep out  
14                  on the street, live down by the river, live  
15                  in a camp, and he told me that he was a  
16                  Vietnam veteran and he needed to be outside  
17                  where the spirits of those he had killed or  
18                  witnessed being killed could hear him from  
19                  his words of sorrow ask for forgiveness.  
20                  The walls of buildings block out those  
21                  messages he said, but the streets carry the  
22                  words right to them.

23                  I walked around my desk and gave him  
24                  a hug and, yes, he was dirty, he smelled,  
25                  his skin was rough and his clothes were not

1           suitable as some would say, but as he let go  
2           I asked why Scranton? Why did you come  
3           here? And he said, "Well, when I came back  
4           from Vietnam I went home to Austin, Texas,  
5           where I was born but I couldn't find what I  
6           was looking there so I started to travel on  
7           and I have traveled and traveled from one  
8           place to another searching, searching."

9                     And I said, "And what is it exactly  
10           it is you are searching for?"

11                    And he said, "An earthly heaven."

12                    And he said, "I've found it finally,  
13           it's called Scranton, Pennsylvania."

14                    If this young man could begin a  
15           journey some 35 years ago and find his  
16           solace here in the streets of Scranton, why  
17           can't we come together and find solace  
18           amongst ourselves. We need to learn to work  
19           together. Some of us hide because we are  
20           afraid of those who might lash out at us.  
21           Others, we don't have all of the answers,  
22           and there is nothing wrong with that,  
23           nothing wrong with that at all, but we must  
24           be comforting to each other. I thank you.

25                    MR. ROGAN: Thank you, Reverend

1 Simmons.

2 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.

3 MR. ROGAN: Andy Sbaraglia.

4 MR. SBARAGLIA: Andy Sbaraglia,  
5 citizen of Scranton, fellow Scrantonian.

6 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

7 MR. SBARAGLIA: I usually don't make  
8 a lot of comments about people who speak,  
9 but I can tell you this, anybody that has a  
10 love for this city gets emotional about the  
11 city, there is no doubt. I in turn get  
12 emotional, too. I have been here for all my  
13 life except when I was deployed in service.  
14 Other than that, I never wanted to go  
15 anywhere. I loved this city. I love the  
16 people in this city and I believe in holding  
17 people who got elected to office to be  
18 accountable for their voting record. I  
19 believe in that. But I don't believe you  
20 should act like a mad dog or something like  
21 that, but you should bring it up and you  
22 should bring it up. It may sound  
23 derogative, I'm not saying it won't, but  
24 whatever the reason, if you love this city  
25 you got to do it. There is no question of



1           it.

2                        You heard me say I don't  
3           particularly think your budget is going to  
4           fly. I really don't, but that's my personal  
5           opinion because I don't believe you got all  
6           of the facts, so I believe you are going to  
7           have problems, but there is no question, but  
8           my love for the city says I have to say it.  
9           You must say what you believe in and you  
10          must fight for what you believe in. Like I  
11          said before, I always fought for open,  
12          honest and efficient government. I didn't  
13          ask nothing less because if I was elected  
14          they would get that from me, and I demand  
15          that from everyone else that gets elected.  
16          You got to have it. If you don't have it  
17          you don't really love the city.

18                        I mean, I have been here a long  
19          time. I seen a lot of changes. I seen the  
20          coal mines close, I seen -- well, the  
21          factories closed, a lot of stuff we really  
22          didn't have a say in the matter. It was  
23          done either economically or by the federal  
24          government. I don't approve of everything  
25          that was done to the city, but I do know one

1 thing, you got to have common sense when you  
2 draw up a budget. I applaud the unions.  
3 They came before you and gave their  
4 viewpoint. Why didn't the administration do  
5 the same? That's the sad part. Really the  
6 sad part. If you believe that you can run  
7 this city with 100 firemen then you should  
8 come before you and explain exactly how you  
9 are going to do it or like the DPW says  
10 there are certain drivers that have a  
11 certain qualification, a license and special  
12 license for the street cleaning and for the  
13 plowing. So be it. That has to be taken  
14 into account, either if you are going to lay  
15 off them people then you got to have some  
16 way of replacing them with qualified  
17 drivers. It's just got to be done.

18 Now, I ain't saying anything about  
19 supervisors. I thought we had one move  
20 there at the auxiliary that used to be up  
21 there at the parks. I thought he was moved  
22 to the DPW to be some type of a whatever,  
23 but the important thing is a safety issue  
24 was brought up. If you have plow drivers  
25 this late in the season we can't really be

1 changing them plow drivers. I don't know  
2 how many of them are qualified. I do  
3 believe that you are going to ask. You must  
4 ask regardless of what, you must ask how  
5 many of them people are going to be  
6 available to plow0 the streets or how many  
7 people are available to drive the fire  
8 engines or so forth and so on. I mean,  
9 their qualifications have to be addressed.

10 I'm just sorry the administration  
11 didn't come before you and give all of them  
12 things to you and explained in detail what  
13 persons can be let go or what type of people  
14 have to be retained.

15 I'm just sorry. I'm sorry you got  
16 to make all of them decisions in the blind.  
17 I really am. It's sorry people don't have  
18 the common sense. I wish Brian Reap was  
19 still around. He did have common sense and  
20 tried to explain everything even though they  
21 didn't listen to him, but at least he tried  
22 to explain and for some reason or other he  
23 got information. Yous people are blind. I  
24 guess only one person who sits up there is  
25 actually privy to all of the information

1           that's made available. Well, I give you my  
2           good luck. I give you God's blessing and  
3           whatever you got to do and I hope it works  
4           out for the best. Thank you.

5                     MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.  
6           Mr. Sbaraglia.

7                     MR. ROGAN: Lee Morgan.

8                     MR. MORGAN: Good evening, Council.

9                     MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

10                    MR. MORGAN: You know, I meant to  
11           come to a lot of meetings, I have been  
12           driving over 60 miles a day to work each way  
13           so my work schedule is really changed, it's  
14           really difficult to get here, but, you know,  
15           I have been paying a lot of attention, and I  
16           just come here tonight to ask the council,  
17           okay, to really seriously consider what it's  
18           actually talking about. I'm not for the  
19           mayor, I'm not against him, I'm not for the  
20           council, I'm not against them either. I  
21           just hope today that clearer minds would  
22           prevail.

23                    It's my understanding, and council  
24           would have a lot more of this information  
25           than I would, that the mayor's offering an

1 incentive for the top 20 people to retire  
2 and he is going to bring back all of the  
3 firemen he has laid off. He has applied for  
4 grants to fund the fire department. I just  
5 think that when you look at what's going on  
6 here, you know, when you look at the mayor's  
7 29 percent tax increase, all right, well, we  
8 have see serious problems, we can't pay our  
9 TANS. We are on very serious financial  
10 straights that council -- I'm not picking on  
11 council, the council cut taxes by a serious  
12 amount the last budget, I don't think we  
13 have recovered from it. We are trying to go  
14 out and get loans from banks and to be  
15 really honest with you they are basically  
16 turning their back on us.

17 Some things that should have been  
18 put on the agenda didn't make it, and maybe  
19 they should have, but I just think that if  
20 the mayor has agreed to bring back firemen,  
21 because we do need them, I don't agree with  
22 the cuts in the public works either. I'm  
23 not going to be really honest with you, I  
24 think this city is running bare bone. I  
25 really think that. I think that's what

1           happened is we have allowed an awful lot of  
2           borrowing to take place, not just by this  
3           mayor but other administrations, and look  
4           at, the American Anglican deal started on  
5           Mr. Connors' watch, and I'm not blaming Mr.  
6           Connors either, but look at all of the debt  
7           he probably took responsibility for when he  
8           took office.

9                        Look it, we can all sit here and  
10           blame everybody, we are in a really tough  
11           situation, but I think we need to look and  
12           be concerned about the elderly in case there  
13           is fire and they can't get out.

14                       Look it, taxes are hurting  
15           everybody. I mean, I'm pretty much at my  
16           limit and I'm only 53 years old basically  
17           and I sometimes wonder how much more I can  
18           take, but I just can't turn my back on the  
19           elderly, and all of the residents in this  
20           city don't forget we lost two children to a  
21           fire, and I know allegedly it was arson, but  
22           I just think that if the mayor is going to  
23           agree to reinstate the laid off firemen, the  
24           younger firemen, and allow older ones to  
25           retire with an incentive I think we should

1 seriously consider it.

2 I agree with some of the things that  
3 Andy said here in regards to the council's  
4 budget. I think it's time to step back and  
5 really look at this budget and, Mr. Rogan,  
6 you have talked about, you know, a  
7 willingness to work with the mayor and I'm  
8 just hoping, Mr. Loscombe, you know, I spoke  
9 to you at the debate about the necessity to  
10 maintain an adequately manned fire  
11 department and that we had a lot of serious  
12 problems in front of the city, my downfall  
13 was that I didn't have time to campaign. I  
14 campaigned for 16 hours in the last  
15 election, eight hours in West Scranton and  
16 eight hours in Minooka because I'm like  
17 everybody else I'm struggling through a  
18 change of employment to meet my obligations,  
19 but the last thing I want to do is I want to  
20 walk away from public safety.

21 We need our DPW, as Andy has talked  
22 about, the people who run the plows. I  
23 think we have degraded public works that  
24 most of the residents think they only pick  
25 of garbage, and to be truthfully honest with

1           you, we need to expand the role and we need  
2           to find answers, and maybe over the course  
3           of another year maybe council can sit down,  
4           you have got a year to sit down and try to  
5           come up with some concrete plans, reach to  
6           the state who I think pushed the war between  
7           the city's unions and the mayor, and I think  
8           that the state holds a lot of  
9           responsibility.

10                         But I would like to see council if  
11           the mayor has a signed agreement, which I  
12           have been told he does, to bring back the  
13           laid off firemen and he has applied for  
14           these grants I think that the council has an  
15           obligation to public safety, and I agree  
16           that a lot of people are really stretched  
17           thin.

18                         We have to start a new chapter here.  
19           We need a council that is willing to work  
20           with anybody and we need a mayor that's  
21           willing to work. So maybe you know what,  
22           maybe this is not an olive branch, maybe  
23           this is the council reaching out to the  
24           mayor and saying, "Well, do you really have  
25           this plan on the table and if you do you



1 know what we are going to give it a shot."

2 And then start communicating with  
3 this guy because what other hope do we have,  
4 and it's not about, you know, being for the  
5 mayor or against the mayor or being for the  
6 council or bringing down against the  
7 council, it's about the council being for  
8 the people and public safety and the best  
9 interest of the residents is really hard to  
10 make happen sometimes, but hopefully you  
11 will hear what I have said thank you.

12 MR. LOSCOMBE: Mr. Morgan, just  
13 quickly, have you seen a signed agreement  
14 from the mayor.

15 MR. MORGAN: From all indications  
16 you know what I think, Mr. Loscombe? I  
17 think that maybe, with all due respect to  
18 you, I think it's time to reach out to the  
19 mayor and ask him if such an agreement  
20 exists and I have been told it does exist.  
21 And I am told that the union knows it  
22 exists. Look it, I have been here a long  
23 time, I've talked to a lot of people and I  
24 generally know what's going on, and I have  
25 didn't come here to berate anybody or

1 mistreat anybody, all I'm saying to that  
2 counsel if that exists, if there is an  
3 agreement that exists like that where we are  
4 going to bring back all these laid off  
5 fireman, all right, that are younger and  
6 give the older firemen an opportunity to --  
7 like yourself, Mr. Loscombe, who may be  
8 working injured for all of these years, and  
9 they are going to get a chance to retire and  
10 give us a chance we are going to have to  
11 make some changes to the fire department,  
12 there is no doubt about, but you know what,  
13 in opinion this is a work in progress.

14 And I just think that with all due  
15 respect to you, Mr. Loscombe, I think you  
16 are a firemen, I think you out of all of the  
17 councilmen, I'm not singling you out, I  
18 think you understand what it means to get to  
19 somebody who maybe an invalid trapped in  
20 their house, the need for an immediate  
21 response to fire, the very importance of  
22 public safety I think you, sir, with all due  
23 respect to you, are the one person on this  
24 council that knows how important it is to  
25 have an adequately operating fire

1 department. Thank you, sir.

2 MR. ROGAN: Thank you.

3 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you. I'll  
4 address that in my comments.

5 MR. ROGAN: Doug Miller.

6 MR. MILLER: Good evening, Council.  
7 Doug Miller, Scranton. I just once again  
8 want to reiterate my statements from last  
9 night and, you know, commend the majority of  
10 this council for all of your hard work and  
11 effort in this budget making process.  
12 Certainly, you know, Finance Chair Frank  
13 Joyce, did an exceptional job with the Power  
14 Point last night. Very informative  
15 presentation to once again show council's  
16 willingness to put forth the openness and  
17 transparency that you did pledge and that we  
18 certainly haven't seen in this city for  
19 quite a long time. And again, I want to  
20 commend you for that.

21 You know, unfortunately, you know,  
22 we can't say the same about the  
23 administration. You know, their lack of  
24 cooperation has been apparent for ten years  
25 and their unwillingness to cooperate and

1 provide answers to your questions just goes  
2 to show where they are really at and how  
3 they truly feel about not only this city,  
4 but more importantly, the residents of this  
5 city, and I just think it's time for them to  
6 get their act together as we move forward in  
7 the new year, and I would just hope as we  
8 like to talk about the spirit of cooperation  
9 let's hope that it can fully come true and  
10 let's make that our New Year's resolution.

11 A few issues I have from last week,  
12 we talked about the Parking Authority and  
13 their budget that was on the agenda, if we  
14 even want to call it a budget. I think a  
15 kindergarten class could probably put  
16 something better together than this  
17 authority did and I just, quite frankly,  
18 find it to be appalling and just again shows  
19 a lack of the cooperation not only for  
20 members of the administration but the  
21 authorities, and we have had to deal with  
22 this for years. The arrogance of these  
23 authorities, Bob Scopelliti and his  
24 arrogance, and I just feel that these  
25 authorities need to start cooperating and

1           they need you to provide you with the  
2           documentation that you desire because it's  
3           all beneficial to the public. You are up  
4           here trying to provide the information and  
5           inform the public of what's going on with  
6           these authorities and they just refuse to  
7           cooperate and I just think it's truly  
8           uncalled for.

9                        I also want to respond and, you  
10           know, I typically don't like to, you know,  
11           respond to statements made by council  
12           members that I don't agree with this but in  
13           this case I feel I have to. You know,  
14           Mr. McGoff made a few statements last week  
15           defending Chief Davis and DPW Director Jeff  
16           Brazil during motions as I sat here in the  
17           audience and listened to a few of the  
18           statements here. First, Mr. McGoff tried to  
19           justify Chief Davis' failure to obtain a  
20           permits to install windows in his home. You  
21           know, you said that you looked into the  
22           matter and that Chief Davis in your  
23           estimation acted accordingly by obtaining  
24           the permit after he had already installed  
25           the windows.

1 Well, I think we need to get our  
2 facts straight and took a look at the proper  
3 procedure with permits. The purpose of the  
4 permit is to obtain it before you do the  
5 work not after, so, therefore, Chief Davis  
6 did violate the ordinances of the city and  
7 the LIPS ordinances and he should know -- he  
8 should know better as he is, as you did say,  
9 Mr. McGoff, and you did clarify and I  
10 appreciate it, that he is a licensed  
11 contractor in the city. Therefore, he  
12 should know the procedures on permits.

13 Regarding Jeff Brazil, you stated  
14 that you hoped the next director is as  
15 competent as Mr. Brazil was. You know, as I  
16 sat back and listened to that, again, as I  
17 said last night, a lot of statements I hear  
18 in these chambers especially by Mr. McGoff I  
19 sometimes have to ask myself, am I really  
20 hearing this? You know, when we talk about  
21 his actions and we talk about his failure to  
22 act on the non-city employees using our  
23 vehicles for personal driver's test. Not  
24 one, not twice, but three times. We want to  
25 just sweep that under the rug. That's the

1           mindset we've had in this town and that's  
2           why we are in the position we are in today  
3           because we have allowed politics and egos  
4           and games to interfere with what should be  
5           done.

6                         You know, I guess in Mr. McGoff's  
7           interpretation he finds that be competent  
8           and I guess, you know, that's your  
9           prerogative to feel that way, but I feel  
10          that that lack of action calls for a  
11          termination, but unfortunately, he was  
12          rewarded with a nice hefty pay increase and  
13          a nice little hefty job over at the Scranton  
14          school district because that's what we do in  
15          this town, we get rewarded, we get hefty  
16          jobs with enormous salaries. While the rest  
17          of the residents of this city struggle, we  
18          reward people who violate laws and  
19          everything else in the town.

20                        And finally, again, I don't like to  
21          respond to, you know, insignificant people  
22          but this in case I feel I must. Last night  
23          after our public hearing on the 2012 budget  
24          I was out here in the hallway with four  
25          other individuals, who I have as witnesses,

1 and unfortunately, I was unprofessionally  
2 approached by our Honorable Councilman Bob  
3 McGoff who approached me and made a  
4 statement that I need to put kids through  
5 college and I need to raise a family and  
6 then I can come up and criticize him and  
7 others. He also made the statement that I  
8 should try doing something successful and  
9 maybe I'll gain a little bit of credibility.

10 Well, I do agree with you,  
11 Mr. McGoff, we are in tough times and there  
12 are many families in this city struggling to  
13 meet their obligations and, yes, there are  
14 parents who, yes, do, in fact, struggle to  
15 put their kids through college and I respect  
16 the fact that you did that and you went  
17 through those tough times and you still go  
18 through the tough times because I see it. I  
19 see it on the streets. I see it in the  
20 people I talk to. I ran for office, I see  
21 it. I may not have been successful in my  
22 elections, I don't know if that's what you  
23 were trying to hint, but that's not  
24 important.

25 The fact of the matter is that you



1 want to talk about me being successful and  
2 having credibility, I have been involved in  
3 this city for ten years. I stepped up to  
4 this podium for the first time when I was 12  
5 years old. I have been involved in this  
6 city for a heck of a lot longer than you  
7 have, and I certainly, you want to talk  
8 about credibility, I do now and always will  
9 have more credibility than you will ever  
10 have and I resent you making that statement  
11 and I put my community and service record up  
12 against yours any day of the week because  
13 when I come to podium I represent the  
14 regular hardworking residents of this city,  
15 not the elite few, and I have gained their  
16 respect and I appreciate it and I'm proud to  
17 come up here and call myself a Scrantonian,  
18 but when you make comments that I need to  
19 raise a family and put kids through college,  
20 well, maybe if you and the mayor and  
21 everybody else didn't raise taxes 26  
22 percent, didn't allow this mayor to borrow  
23 and spend out of control and rubber stamp  
24 and allow him to just run this city  
25 recklessly, we wouldn't be in this position

1           today and we wouldn't have to make these  
2           statements and maybe, yeah, a young  
3           individual would be able to raise a family,  
4           but unfortunately because of you and a lot  
5           of other arrogant people we are in the  
6           position we are in.

7                         And all I just have to say to  
8           conclude is I have been involved for ten  
9           years, as I said, and I have come across a  
10          lot of I guess you could say so-called  
11          politicians, but I just have to say, Mr.  
12          McGoff, that you are by far one of the most  
13          unprofessional, immature and classless  
14          individuals I have ever come across and I  
15          thank you for your time.

16                         (Whereupon while Mr. Miller was  
17          speaking Ms. Evans takes the dais and joins  
18          the meeting.)

19                         MS. EVANS: Bob Bolus.

20                         MR. BOLUS: Good evening, Council,  
21          Bob Bolus, Scranton. I guess third time at  
22          the podium. Last night and tonight, I mean,  
23          there is not much more we can say that we  
24          haven't already said. You can look at DPW,  
25          and we didn't really address a lot of that,

1 but when you really take a look a what the  
2 DPW does it provides the city the men that  
3 go out when everybody is home in bed  
4 sleeping, keep in mind they are out plowing  
5 and cindering, and when you get up in the  
6 morning your roads are clean as best as they  
7 could do. So, you know, they are the unsung  
8 heroes that you don't see and you never get  
9 to meet, but they do do their job, and I for  
10 one who operates an emergency business and  
11 knows what it is when people have to get up  
12 at one, two o'clock in the morning and  
13 respond to something they are to be  
14 commended.

15 I think cutting people without  
16 paying attention to who is being cut I think  
17 falls squarely on the shoulders of the  
18 mayor. Maybe he needed to go around in a  
19 truck at night and see what they do or maybe  
20 went out and picked up some garbage once in  
21 awhile and see what the physical labor is.

22 Take a look at our fire department,  
23 I know where they come from, I know what  
24 their responsibilities are. As I have said  
25 in the past, I'm a volunteer firefighter in

1 Throop, I drive an engine up there, but  
2 nobody pays attention to what goes on, the  
3 volunteers or with the fire department, they  
4 just expect them to do their job. The same  
5 as our police department, yet this mayor has  
6 refused to look at the employees that he  
7 basically employs. He is responsible for  
8 it.

9 We look at the mayor and say, excuse  
10 me, but you are supposed to do your job and  
11 that's to run this city efficiently,  
12 effectively and not run us into debt. The  
13 debt we're in was brought on by prior  
14 councils patronizing this mayor, giving him  
15 free reign to squander the money. How many  
16 grants have we gone out and looked at?  
17 There is free money out there could have  
18 preserved the police, the fire, the DPW.  
19 That's what we pay taxes for. Yet I see  
20 somebody wanting to say, well, let's raise  
21 the garbage fee again.

22 Did you raise the fee on every  
23 nonprofit and KOZ in the city? No. Have  
24 you done anything to the nonprofits and KOZs  
25 in the city? Absolutely not? Do they have

1 a free ride? Absolutely. Do they have to  
2 deal with the real estate transfer tax?  
3 Absolutely not.

4 These are the things that have been  
5 ignored time and time again. If we are  
6 talking next year then today's the day we  
7 have to take the bull by the horns because  
8 whatever you are going to do with this  
9 budget you are going to do one way or the  
10 other. We have all talked about it, we have  
11 all beat everybody up on it. The bottom  
12 line is what's our end result going to be.

13 I asked Mr. McGoff the other night  
14 would he champion going after KOZs and  
15 nonprofits and put a fee on them in the  
16 city, whether it's a public service fee or  
17 something like that that they pay their fair  
18 shares. I'm not singling out any one person  
19 or any one business. They are all totally  
20 and equally responsible because they get a  
21 free ride on our tax dollars.

22 You know, as I said, our boat is  
23 sinking, we are in life boats and if you  
24 don't use the can in the life boat to bail  
25 the water the boat is going to sink. If you

1 don't use your assets here in this city, the  
2 city is going to sink and you have assets  
3 you just have to go utilize them. They are  
4 there for you to utilize.

5 There is a \$50,000 mention in here  
6 that if we had \$50,000 we could have did  
7 this with the \$50,000 that reserve something  
8 the other night. Well, I brought up about  
9 the \$50,000 bid that I put on the property  
10 here in the city, yet nobody has challenged  
11 Paul Kelly to come forward and produce a  
12 deed that he claims the city doesn't own  
13 this property. Nobody. Nobody in here has  
14 done that, yet there is 50,000. Whether  
15 there is a house built on it or not, when  
16 somebody ignores the rules and regulations  
17 and thinks they can take the people in this  
18 city for a free ride and get away with it,  
19 that's bad. That's just as nasty as it  
20 gets, but it's up to this council to do the  
21 job the administration doesn't.

22 So there is \$50,000 I put on a bid  
23 on the Hartman property, yet it's been  
24 ignored. How many times have I spoken about  
25 it? Nobody has brought anybody to task, and

1           that's only one little tip of the iceberg.  
2           All your vacant land, all of the nonprofit  
3           land, all the things that can be sold in  
4           this city, putting aside the tax sale that  
5           just is an undue stress on other people.  
6           These are the things you need that start  
7           looking at. The gas line, leachate lines,  
8           you have so many things out here to do, you  
9           just need to go ahead and do it.

10           MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Bolus.

11           MR. BOLUS: And I probably won't be  
12           here next week, but have a Merry Christmas  
13           and a Happy New Year. Thank you.

14           MR. LOSCOMBE: You, too. Thank you.

15           MS. EVANS: And Mike Vanorden.

16           MR. VANORDEN: Good evening. Mike  
17           Vanorden. I'm not a life-long resident of  
18           Scranton, I have been here for about eight  
19           years now. I come from the major city in  
20           New Jersey, Elizabeth, outside of Newark  
21           where the crime rate out there exceeds this  
22           by far, but they are coming. The gangs are  
23           coming, and they are coming in force and in  
24           numbers, and these people actually really  
25           need to consider not only keeping fireman

1           on, force the mayor's hand, do what you got  
2           to do, and keep these firemen on and keep  
3           these police on. You need more fire power  
4           out there because they are outgunned, they  
5           are out manned. I have seen it. I come  
6           from violence. I left the violence, I know  
7           what it's like.

8                         And, you know, I stand up for these  
9           DPW workers and firemen and the message to  
10          Mayor Doherty, Occupy Scranton, which I'm a  
11          member of, we are not going away. We are  
12          going to be a proverbial thorn in his side  
13          come hell or high water. We are not going  
14          to give up. Thank you.

15                        MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you. Mike, I'm  
16          glad to see you are dressed tonight.

17                        MS. EVANS: Dave Dobrzyn.

18                        MR. DOBRZYN: Good evening, Dave  
19          Dobrzyn, resident of Scranton and taxpayer.  
20          On this tax business, try and keep things  
21          open. If we can return people and get rock  
22          solid insurances from the mayor that these  
23          people won't be let go two months after you  
24          give him more money we can maybe afford to  
25          pay a little more money, some people can't,



1 I'm only talking as a personal private  
2 citizen.

3 And on this audit business, if at  
4 all possible an ordinance passed by four  
5 individuals up there that would terminate  
6 anybody later than 30 days. Terminate them.  
7 If they can't hand in an audit by say June  
8 30 or so it's time for them to go. This is  
9 ridiculous. This is what the problem is.  
10 You don't know how the money is even being  
11 spent, so how do you say, okay, more, when  
12 it's so tight.

13 My wife lost a job last year, like I  
14 said before, we are making six grand a year  
15 less for a 40-hour week, that's about 25  
16 percent of her salary is down the tubes and  
17 last Tuesday night I took the car, it's  
18 night shift, and I got a call and had to run  
19 back up to work to pick her up because she  
20 was furloughed for the evening. Mighty  
21 white of them.

22 On this cable mention, in order to  
23 get that job, I might add, we had to have  
24 cable service. You don't get a job anymore  
25 unless you have cable service for internet.

1 Now, you can go to Verizon, they told me \$16  
2 a month, it turned out that that and my  
3 phone bill turned into 85 a month and it was  
4 junk, so when I spend money on cable TV, and  
5 keep in mind that every year the city has an  
6 incentive to sell me down the river as a  
7 Comcast customer because the more I pay the  
8 more they get paid.

9 On these colleges and so forth, I  
10 think it's time for nonprofits, let PEL go  
11 over to them and talk to them. Why should  
12 we have good people being slandered and lied  
13 about and I felt that that was a blatant and  
14 outright lie last year and now there is  
15 other institutions that aren't paying like  
16 hospitals, well, guess what, I owe CMC my  
17 life. Dr. Juan, Dr. Baldassari,  
18 Dr. Cipriano, Dr. Batzel, Dr. Stall,  
19 Dr. Stivala, right on down the line, I owe  
20 these people my life because five years ago  
21 I was as good as a dead man. I wouldn't be  
22 alive today if that was so why should I  
23 complain about CMC not paying their fair  
24 share. They already gave their donation at  
25 the office.



1           for Congress and their tax breaks for jobs  
2           and so forth. Last year I heard  
3           Mr. McConnell state that he would extend  
4           unemployment for trade agreements, well,  
5           bawk, bawk, Mr. McConnell. I had a little  
6           thought last week on Mr. Herman and  
7           Mr. Edwards, Mr. Edwards took campaign money  
8           and used it to pay for his mistress, I  
9           wonder if Uncle Herman and took money and  
10          paid for his mistress and wined, dined and  
11          999'd her. Have a good night.

12                   MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who  
13                   cares to address council?

14                   MR. VITRIS: Sam Vitris, Scranton.  
15                   President of the Department of Public Works  
16                   union. I just wanted to reiterate tonight  
17                   some of the things we talked about prior to  
18                   this meeting, the public hearing, and it was  
19                   the deletion of the positions, mainly the  
20                   skilled positions in the Department of  
21                   Public Works, who are commercial driver's  
22                   license workers, who drive snow trucks, who  
23                   are very -- every position is important, but  
24                   these are vitally important to the safety of  
25                   the citizens when you take snow drivers out

1 of the budget. Not only snow drivers, the  
2 drivers for everything, and there is only so  
3 many snow drivers, so many commercial  
4 driver's licenses that we have down in  
5 Public Works and to eliminate them is  
6 irresponsible in my opinion.

7 You didn't lay ten of us off.  
8 Janet. The stuff that's being said I can't  
9 believe that's coming from up here, it's  
10 unbelievable. The lack of -- the appearance  
11 of the city comment that I made, you left  
12 out the best part. I did say for the better  
13 -- and we'll do the best we can, but you  
14 left that part out. The reason I said the  
15 appearance of the city is because I lived  
16 this in 1991. I had the conversation with  
17 you, respectfully, and I respect you, I  
18 really do just like I do all of city  
19 council, but I lived this in 1991 and I  
20 don't want to relive it again.

21 The retirement incentive, the buyout  
22 comment that Sam Vitris said that, you know,  
23 about the ten people we are going to lose,  
24 well, it was put to me like this, "You are  
25 going to lose ten positions. How could we

1 do it?"

2 And I said, "Well, I'm a union guy,"  
3 I says, "Well, I'd like to try it through a  
4 retirement incentive if we can."

5 I have watched other bargaining  
6 units do it, we never did, so I said I'd  
7 like to try it and the newspaper reporter  
8 said to me, "Well, will that affect  
9 services? Whether it's -- what's the  
10 difference, you lose ten this way through a  
11 layoff and you lose ten through a retirement  
12 incentive, no difference you lost ten  
13 positions."

14 I says -- he said to me, "Will it  
15 affect your service delivery?"

16 And I says, "It could."

17 But that was wasn't in the paper.  
18 So I'm up here, comments are being thrown  
19 from up there and only half of it is being  
20 said of what I said. Only half of my  
21 comments are being said, which is unfair.  
22 Anybody can do that to somebody who can't  
23 speak or isn't there in attendance. Anybody  
24 could, and they were two of the comments  
25 that I could recall, and you can cut it

1            anyway you want, it's not ten people you are  
2            laying off. It's not ten. You laid five  
3            off in January, you are laying -- they were  
4            casuals. You are laying seven off more  
5            casuals this January, you are laying nine  
6            union positions off, you are laying --  
7            you're not even counting the injured people  
8            we have, which is 11, that can't do daily  
9            services.

10                  You can talk all you want about the  
11                  garbage men that they don't work a full day,  
12                  they work their guts out for these taxpayers  
13                  and I don't get half of what Mr. Rogan says  
14                  from the people of this city. I hear good  
15                  things about them. I hear they work their  
16                  butts off for this city, that's what I hear.

17                  So if Mr. Rogan is getting -- is  
18                  going to use that as a way to punish this  
19                  union and punish the services of the people,  
20                  right, and I always said right from the  
21                  beginning that if you are a policy maker and  
22                  you willing to do it then take the blame for  
23                  it because we are going to get our  
24                  paychecks, every one of the DPW workers are  
25                  going to get their paychecks every two

1 weeks, but if the decisions that you make,  
2 and you make alone are going to be the  
3 reason whether we succeed as a service or we  
4 fail as a service and if we learned anything  
5 from the past, from 1991, and I can take you  
6 back day by day if you want, if you learned  
7 anything from it at all, and I assume this  
8 Mrs. Evans could recall it quite clearly,  
9 the layoffs that were in the Public Works  
10 Department in 1991 did absolutely nothing  
11 but punish the people of this city.  
12 Nothing. The people came back to work.  
13 There was grievance filed, three-quarters  
14 of a million dollars worth of grievances  
15 were filed because of bad decisions.

16 And you can talk about the casuals  
17 all you want, and I used an example before  
18 in my teacher -- or I'm sorry, and my  
19 daughter is a teacher, so I have great  
20 respect for teachers, I always did, they  
21 work hard, they are good union people, but  
22 when a teacher takes off what do they do,  
23 Mrs. Evans? Just, please, what did they do?

24 MS. EVANS: There is a substitute.

25 MR. VITRIS: Right. Okay.



1 MS. EVANS: But in addition to that  
2 --

3 MR. VITRIS: That's all I'm same.

4 MS. EVANS: In addition to that,  
5 there are many schools in which there is  
6 only one administrator and there are times  
7 when that administrator is not in that  
8 building due to circumstances that you  
9 enumerated, deaths in the family,  
10 conferences that have to be attended, and  
11 the work goes on quite smoothly. Why?  
12 Because each teacher knows exactly what his  
13 and her duties and responsibilities are each  
14 day. They have been doing the job for a  
15 long time, they are able to do it without  
16 having an administrator in the building  
17 because this job is ongoing daily just as  
18 your job is.

19 MR. VITRIS: Regardless, it's not  
20 here and it never was and it shouldn't be.  
21 The substitutes that we call them, casuals,  
22 whatever you want to call them, they are  
23 there to replace injured workers. It's no  
24 longer ten, Mrs. Evans. No matter which way  
25 you cut it it's not nine union positions,

1           it's 31 positions that we are going to be  
2           without. I want you to say that, 31  
3           positions. I know because I do the mat.

4                   MS. EVANS: And what was the math  
5           for the mayor's number?

6                   MR. VITRIS: Excuse me? Ten.

7                   MS. EVANS: What was the math for  
8           the mayor's number?

9                   MR. VITRIS: For the mayor's, ten.

10                  MS. EVANS: No, that would be 21.

11                  MR. VITRIS: No, ma'am. I disagree.

12                  MS. EVANS: If you are going to add  
13           the --

14                  MR. VITRIS: I have to -- okay, Mrs.  
15           Evans.

16                  MS. EVANS: If you are going to add  
17           the workers' comp cases onto --

18                  MR. VITRIS: I haven't --

19                  MS. EVANS: -- and I agree then add  
20           it onto city council's numbers you must also  
21           add those into the mayor's.

22                  MR. VITRIS: I will add them to the  
23           mayor's if that makes you happy.

24                  MS. EVANS: No, it's a matter of  
25           fact.

1 MR. VITRIS: If that makes you happy  
2 I will be a -- let's be happy and let's add  
3 them to the mayor's 21, council's 31.  
4 Right?

5 MS. EVANS: Yes.

6 MR. VITRIS: Okay, now we are all  
7 happy. The mayor got his blame, you got  
8 your blame, all right? But it's 31 no  
9 matter which way you cut it. It's 31 less  
10 jobs, and I'm saying this with all due  
11 respect. Don't do this to the people. If  
12 you want to negotiate privatization,  
13 negotiate with this union when the contract  
14 is up.

15 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Vitris.

16 MR. VITRIS: Excuse me.

17 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

18 MR. VITRIS: Okay. Thank you, too.

19 MS. EVANS: And the next speaker.

20 MR. JOYCE: I just want to make a  
21 comment before the next speaker comes up.  
22 I'm not sure he is aware of this and who is  
23 not, it's a response from Ryan McGowan to  
24 me, the mayor is copied on it as well as  
25 Mr. McGoff, Mr. Loscombe, and Mr. Rogan and

1 Mrs. Evans. In regards to buyouts they said  
2 there is ten individuals with 30 years of  
3 experience, there is 10 individuals with 20  
4 or 25 years of experience that may take the  
5 buyout as well.

6 Then, furthermore, that they are  
7 hoping to complete negotiations with DPW, so  
8 obviously it's -- from what I'm reading here  
9 they are indicating, okay, there is ten with  
10 30 plus years experience, there is another  
11 ten with 20 to 25 that they want to take  
12 this buyout, and then they said -- and then  
13 Mr. McGoff said that if the individuals  
14 didn't take the incentives there would be  
15 layoffs in the department early next year.

16 So under the mayor's situation he  
17 didn't state exactly how many would be laid  
18 off, but obviously they wanted to buyout 20  
19 not just ten, and that's an e-mail that I  
20 have this in writing from Ryan McGowan.

21 MR. VITRIS: Frank --

22 MS. EVANS: No, excuse me, you are  
23 not allowed to speak once you have been to  
24 the podium.

25 MR. VITRIS: Yeah, but you're saying

1 stuff that's not true.

2 MS. EVANS: The audience is not  
3 allowed to speak. Mr. Joyce, though, I just  
4 have one -- yes, you can provide it copy of  
5 that to Mr. Vitris, that would be fine, but  
6 in addition to that I just wanted to ask  
7 within the 2012 budget what is the amount of  
8 the money budgeted by the administration for  
9 DPW buyouts?

10 MR. JOYCE: \$100,000.

11 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

12 MR. ROGAN: I would also add that I  
13 know I have been highly critical of the DPW,  
14 especially the refuse division in the past,  
15 and I'm not going to say differently because  
16 the union represent is here tonight. One  
17 thing I have advocated for in the past, and  
18 maybe the union would agree to this when the  
19 contract comes up, is an efficiency study  
20 where somebody would ride along with the  
21 department and determine what kind of  
22 staffing is necessary, and I think if that's  
23 done by an outside source, numbers can be  
24 agreed upon between the union and the city.

25 MR. DOCKLEY: Good evening, Council.

1 My name is Sam Dock ley, retired captain of  
2 the Scranton Fire Department and I'm here on  
3 behalf of the firefighters. First of all, I  
4 would like to wish everybody a very Merry  
5 Christmas in the City of Scranton and here  
6 in the room here.

7 Second, I'm here to defend the  
8 firefighters being laid off. I want  
9 everybody to know one of those firefighters  
10 could be a man to save a life in a home. I  
11 don't know how long they're going to be laid  
12 off, the mayor has been lax in getting this  
13 grant, could have kept their jobs plus the  
14 police department. I seen it happen. We  
15 need manpower at a fire and a firemen needs  
16 the back up of firemen. Two men have to go  
17 in the fire. One guy goes down, he has no  
18 backup he could be dead, seriously hurt. I  
19 seen it happen in my 32 years on the fire  
20 department.

21 Manpower is important. Response  
22 time is important. I have here a list of  
23 companies that have been closed from  
24 December 7 and, Mayor, I hope you are  
25 watching and Chief Davis. On December 7 of

1           this -- go to Friday, Engine 10, 15, Truck 4  
2           and rescue was out. Four companies out of  
3           ten. The 8th, Engine 15, Engine 10, Truck 4  
4           and Rescue 4, four companies out of ten.  
5           Engine 9, Truck 4 and Engine 15. The 10th  
6           of December, Engine 7, Engine 10, Engine 15,  
7           Truck 4 and the rescue. Five out of ten  
8           were out of service. And today Engine 15  
9           and Truck 4 was out. I didn't get the last  
10          two days.

11                        I just wanted to explain to the  
12           people of this town here, I want them to  
13           call the chief's office when they see a  
14           company out of service and ask him why,  
15           Chief Davis. Chief Davis I'll defend is a  
16           good firefighter, but he is not defending  
17           his men. This man, the mayor we call, has  
18           no respect for anybody of life and homes.  
19           What's more important for him is getting his  
20           budget through, but money cannot replace a  
21           life and we are going to have a disaster in  
22           this town. He has a big problem now, he is  
23           going to have a bigger problem, him and  
24           Chief Davis.

25                        These boys and the firefighters I

1           have worked in the past I'll put up against  
2           any fire department, not in the United  
3           States in the world, and I'll put our boys  
4           here today against anybody, any company in  
5           the country. They are good men. They'd  
6           give their life if they have to. We have  
7           many of them that died in the past. My dad  
8           for one, for instance. I believe he gave  
9           his life for the city, two heart attacks on  
10          the job, plus others. A lot of them are  
11          injured.

12                        Yeah, we get paid, we have turnout  
13                        year around, but we still get seriously hurt  
14                        and you can get killed, but you need backup.  
15                        We don't start the fires, people start the  
16                        fires. I'm going to talk like a fire  
17                        prevention officer, I want the people of  
18                        city to watch their cigarettes. Their black  
19                        chimneys, they're cooking in the kitchen  
20                        with grease fires, this last week they had  
21                        two kitchen fires, grease fires, a mother  
22                        and children had to go to the hospital. We  
23                        have had many of them in my time. Mattress  
24                        fires, we have many of them, and also  
25                        heaters this time of year. Electric heaters



1 keep them away from your couch and your  
2 chairs, face them away three to four feet.  
3 Not facing the furniture, they will start  
4 the fire in the furniture. We seen it  
5 happen many times.

6 Also, like I says, we have an  
7 incompetent mayor, and I'm not afraid to say  
8 it, I think everybody in the City of  
9 Scranton knows it, you know it. You are  
10 doing a terrific job with what you have to  
11 work with. I don't know what can be done.  
12 I hope these men get back to the job. What  
13 a Christmas they're going to have. I'm sure  
14 Doherty is going to have a nice Christmas,  
15 that what are these boys going to have?  
16 Possible losing their homes, can't pay their  
17 rent or buy the food for the kids. That's  
18 nice.

19 If you give me another minute or two  
20 I'm going to tell you an incident. We had a  
21 fire at rear of 1300 Wyoming Avenue some  
22 years ago behind the old ice cream parlor  
23 there, it was a row of homes, brick units.  
24 I was working, our shift was working, alarm  
25 comes in for the rear of 1300, Lowden Hill

1 was their ice cream place if anybody is old  
2 enough to remember that, behind the ice  
3 cream was a unit of four, about three or  
4 four units. On the end was a family, but  
5 anyway we get there and a neighbor had  
6 spotted smoke coming out of window and we  
7 arrived on the scene and he is hollering his  
8 kids are in the fire. We had a compliment  
9 of men at that time, I mean a compliment of  
10 men, so myself and another firefighter broke  
11 in the door and found a couch on fire. We  
12 proceeded putting that out, full of smoke  
13 and heat, the neighborhood had reported a  
14 fire, tried to get a ladder up to the  
15 window, he couldn't get in, it was too hot  
16 and smoky. Although we had gear on we had a  
17 hard time.

18 Our firefighter men were getting  
19 ground ladders up to the window and trying  
20 to get in and parts of the stair casing  
21 going upstairs burned down and myself and  
22 the two firefighters had to keep close to  
23 the wall going up. Well, guess what, they  
24 were bringing out five children that were  
25 dead from the smoke.

1                   The oldest boy, Bob, was rushed to  
2                   Burn's hospital with severe burns, he died  
3                   two days later. The mother, myself and  
4                   another firefighter found in the bathroom.  
5                   Skin just peeling off her, we tried to get  
6                   here downstairs. We finally got her  
7                   downstairs, she was dead. Here is a man who  
8                   lost his whole family. Why? Because of a  
9                   discarded cigarette that was determined  
10                  later.

11                  This is what we have to go through.  
12                  We are not supermen, we are hardworking  
13                  firefighters that do our job and we do it  
14                  well.

15                  MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Dockley.

16                  MR. DOCKLEY: Thank you. I want to  
17                  wish everybody one more thing, I said it  
18                  before, God Bless Scranton, the county, the  
19                  state, and the United States of America.

20                  MS. EVANS: Thank you.

21                  MR. JACKOWITZ: Bill Jackowitz,  
22                  South Scranton resident and member of the  
23                  Taxpayers' Association, also a retired  
24                  master sergeant in the United States Air  
25                  Force, and you know what, the military has

1 no union, okay? The military personnel have  
2 been firefighters. Military personnel have  
3 been police officers. Military personnel  
4 have plowed roads and DPW, just like DPW  
5 workers do and pick up garbage. Military  
6 personnel do it away from home, away from  
7 their families and sometimes in hostile  
8 environments while they are being attacked  
9 and being shot at.

10 So, you know, I'll go back to what I  
11 said earlier, where are the leaders of the  
12 DPW, the police department and the fire  
13 department? Where is the leader of the  
14 city, the mayor? We are getting union  
15 representatives coming here talking about  
16 union and union and union, okay? We need to  
17 talk about the citizens. We need to talk  
18 about the residents, and we need the leaders  
19 of the city here. The union leaders are not  
20 the leaders of this city, the elected  
21 officials are the leaders of this city.

22 The mayor is the number one, he is  
23 the CEO of the City of Scranton. He should  
24 be here. His business administrator, he  
25 appointed that business administrator, the

1 business administrator should be here. He  
2 appointed the director of the DPW, that DPW  
3 director should be here. He appointed the  
4 police chief, he should be here. He  
5 appointed the fire chief, he should be here.

6 Without these people we can go  
7 around and around like we have for the last  
8 20 years and guess what, the bottom line is  
9 the City of Scranton is still distressed,  
10 the residents and taxpayers of this city who  
11 go to work and pay their taxes are  
12 threatened by streets and the city being  
13 dirty, by late responses to fire and  
14 possible fatalities, by crime on an upbeat,  
15 and we are not having enough of police  
16 officers to respond.

17 You know, we talk about backups, the  
18 police officers need backups. If they  
19 respond to a hostile situation, a man with a  
20 gun, a knife, a robbery, you need more than  
21 one police officer. You need backup. Same  
22 thing goes for the fire department, one fire  
23 truck or one or two firefighters cannot put  
24 out a fire. They need backup. Just like  
25 the DPW, they need backup, also.

1                   But you know what, the mayor is  
2                   responsible for all of this. Nobody else.  
3                   Why aren't they protesting the mayor's  
4                   house? Why aren't they in front of Chief  
5                   Davis' house? Why weren't they in front of  
6                   Chief Duffy's house? No, everybody wants to  
7                   come to Scranton City Council. Like the  
8                   supermajority is super and they can fly off  
9                   tall buildings and stop speeding bullets.  
10                  It doesn't work that way.

11                  The people who are responsible for  
12                  this city, believe it or not, are your  
13                  elected officials and, city council, you are  
14                  part of it because you are all elected  
15                  officials, but guess what, the mayor is the  
16                  number one man. Why aren't they protesting  
17                  the mayor? Why aren't they protesting his  
18                  appointed DPW, Jeff Brazil? Why aren't they  
19                  protesting his appointed police chief, Dan  
20                  Duffy? Why aren't they protesting his  
21                  appointed fire chief, Tom Davis? They are  
22                  not. They are the ones that need to be  
23                  here. They are the ones who make the  
24                  decisions and the choices, you guys make  
25                  recommendations and pass legislation. You

1 don't have hirer and fire power. The mayor  
2 does. Remember, we are a mayor controlled  
3 city and he has made that perfectly clear.

4 So the union leader should be  
5 protesting the mayor, not city council. It  
6 doesn't make sense to me. Again, I'm a  
7 retired military man, we didn't have a  
8 union, and I don't think the military will  
9 ever have a union. You know what, but our  
10 leaders, our captains, our commanders, our  
11 squadron leaders they were always behind  
12 their people. They would be in the foxhole  
13 with you. Where are our leaders? Why  
14 aren't they in the foxhole with our city  
15 employees? They are not.

16 And I tell you what, this really  
17 upsets me because I'm tired of hearing from  
18 union leaders, I really am. They do not  
19 control or run this city, the elected  
20 officials do and the appointed officials who  
21 are appointed by the mayor run this city.

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

23 MR. HARTMAN: Good evening, Council.  
24 Todd Hartman.

25 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

1 MR. HARTMAN: Taxpayer and resident  
2 of the City of Scranton properties, pay the  
3 wage tax me and my wife. It's the third  
4 time I have been here, and you guys know why  
5 I am here, I just happened to catch  
6 Mr. Bolus on the TV complaining about me  
7 again and the easement that runs through my  
8 property and Mr. Musti's property, which is  
9 my neighbor.

10 Years back this was fought in Court  
11 by at the time I believe their name was  
12 Price that lived next door to him. It was  
13 lost in court, appealed and lost. Now, what  
14 I understand of this, Mr. Bolus is trying to  
15 get someone to act on this, another  
16 attorney, I welcome that, because it was  
17 fought, lost and appealed and lost. If he  
18 was so umped into it he should get himself  
19 an attorney and fight that.

20 And, Mr. Loscombe, those signs that  
21 I heard came in in a bag they were on the  
22 neighbor's property not Mr. Bolus' and it  
23 was not in the right of way, they were  
24 removed by the neighbor and placed back on  
25 Mr. Bolus' property.



1                    Now, I don't like coming down here,  
2                    I don't want to waste your time. All this  
3                    is in litigation with Mr. Bolus. He  
4                    continues to come down here and harass you  
5                    guys about it. I understand that, he gets  
6                    his privilege to do that. I paid my taxes,  
7                    I paid my permits, I did what was necessary  
8                    of me to build a home in this community.  
9                    I'm being harassed by him constantly, okay?  
10                   I don't have the time to come down here  
11                   every week and sit here and go out and back  
12                   and forth with him, and I'm not going to do  
13                   that, I'm not going to waste your time and  
14                   I'm not that kind of person.

15                   Mr. Miller stated a week ago or two  
16                   weeks ago about Chief Davis putting windows  
17                   in his house without a permit. Well, if you  
18                   would like go up and see the windows that  
19                   Mr. Bolus put in his house without permits  
20                   which he says he lives in. He does not live  
21                   there. I live there, I know he doesn't live  
22                   there, and ask Mr. Bolus where he pays his  
23                   wage tax, ask him that question. Everybody  
24                   would like to know. He comes here every  
25                   week and complains about Todd Hartman and

1 his family. I'm getting a little tired of  
2 it. Put his money where his mouth is, let's  
3 keep it in Court and keep it out of council  
4 chambers. He has to tell everybody what our  
5 business is. I get the Times coming up over  
6 a broken water service supposedly that I  
7 broke on his property. That's Times'  
8 worthy. Evidently it must be. You know,  
9 I'm putting a fence up next year I'll grab  
10 my permit, maybe the Times will come up next  
11 year when I put the fence up and do a little  
12 thing in the paper.

13 But sorry to burden you, I just have  
14 to come down once in awhile and keep  
15 Mr. Bolus straight with the community and  
16 the citizens of the City of Scranton and I  
17 just want to be left alone by the man, but  
18 he continues to nitpick, but he doesn't live  
19 here, he lives had Clarks Summit, and maybe  
20 he should go to city council up in Clarks  
21 Summit and do his little thing up there  
22 maybe, or Throop or some place else like  
23 that. Thank you. You guys have a Merry  
24 Christmas.

25 MR. JOYCE: Thank you. You have a

1 Merry Christmas as well.

2 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who  
3 cares to address council?

4 MS. SCHUMACHER: Marie Schumacher.  
5 I have to start again with my concern over  
6 the fire department. People do dumb things.  
7 We are getting into that time of year where  
8 people's houses get cold, they try to save  
9 on whatever the main source of fuel is and  
10 they do dumb things. I'm one of those  
11 people. Last Friday morning forgetting that  
12 I had a dedicated line for a heater when my  
13 mom was alive to where I knew it would cause  
14 a problem or blow a fuse I was in one end of  
15 the house, the baby was asleep in the far  
16 end, I had plugged a heater in that had too  
17 much wattage for the outlet and the baby  
18 monitor shows a picture of the baby but it  
19 doesn't show anything else that's going on  
20 in the room and I all of a sudden I smell  
21 the acrid smell of insulation melting and,  
22 of course, I tracked it down to the heater,  
23 I shut the heater off, I pulled the plug and  
24 the wall was warm.

25 I called my electrician, he was on a

1 job and it was noisy, he wasn't able to talk  
2 to me, so I did what I felt I had to do, I  
3 called Engine 10 and Engine 10 said, "We'll  
4 be right now down."

5 They came down, they checked what  
6 needed to be checked and they got a heat  
7 sensing device to make sure there was  
8 nothing in the wall. They reassured me that  
9 I was safe until the electrician got there  
10 and there was nothing else going on, but  
11 this is the time of the year we are getting  
12 into where people do things. They don't  
13 realize that, you know, to look at the  
14 wattage of a heater and see if it could  
15 cause a problem. They use alternate methods  
16 of hearing and the calls are bound to  
17 increase and with this not knowing when  
18 these funds are going to come in from this  
19 grant, that's just scary. I mean, who  
20 knows, it could be November and we'll be  
21 down at less than 100 firefighters for 26  
22 square miles. It's just -- it's  
23 unacceptable and, I'm sorry, whatever we  
24 have to do we have to get that up to where  
25 we are safe. And so again, I want to thank

1 Engine 10 and the assistant chief who was  
2 there and I feel for them.

3 And now to another item is the  
4 transfer tax for the sale of the Moses  
5 Taylor Hospital, which has been approved, in  
6 the budget?

7 MS. EVANS: Yes.

8 MR. JOYCE: I would assume so.

9 MS. SCHUMACHER: Mrs. Evans said  
10 yes. SHE is shaking her head yes. Is their  
11 funding in the budget for ECTV?

12 MR. JOYCE: Yes. Actually, we did  
13 place some extra money into the contingency  
14 to assist ECTV with paying their rent.

15 MS. SCHUMACHER: Thank you.

16 MR. JOYCE: You are welcome.

17 MS. SCHUMACHER: Now, I'm having  
18 trouble again with the audit. For months  
19 now we have been told that we couldn't get  
20 borrowing without two things at least, well,  
21 there were more than two things, but without  
22 the audit, which we still don't have, and  
23 without a realistic budget.

24 MR. JOYCE: Correct.

25 MS. SCHUMACHER: And I hate even

1           saying this, but I'm not sure this budget is  
2           realistic with not knowing whether or not we  
3           are going to get these grants and we're  
4           relying on them, I just don't know, but if  
5           we can get the money and get through the  
6           year I guess, but we really, really have to  
7           start.

8                         And I would like a pledge from the  
9           council tonight that now that Mr. Hughes or  
10          Attorney Hughes mentioned the other day that  
11          there are -- that the University of Scranton  
12          is to be in an institutional zone and you  
13          all approved them moving out of their  
14          boundaries when you approved the two dorms  
15          on whatever side that is, north, east, I  
16          don't know, that side of Mulberry Street  
17          that I would hope that in the future you  
18          will commit to building -- the University of  
19          Scranton going up instead of out and keep  
20          the rest on the tax rolls. That would be  
21          helpful.

22                         And I have some things, I'm  
23          concerned about the Parking Authority of  
24          what happens to them. I know they took out  
25          a \$2.9 million loan that was to be paid for

1 with the monies from the loan they were  
2 getting to get when they bought the parking  
3 meters, which isn't going to happen, so do  
4 you know will they be able to pay the \$2.9  
5 million loan and if they don't want happens  
6 and what the obligation of the city  
7 taxpayers will be?

8 MR. JOYCE: In regard to the Parking  
9 Authority?

10 MS. SCHUMACHER: Yeah.

11 MR. JOYCE: Well, I think that's  
12 part of the reason why they are projecting  
13 at \$1.6 million deficit that we are actually  
14 on the hook for it in the operating budget  
15 itself. That money was added to the  
16 contingency fund. From speaking with our  
17 council solicitor, he believes that there is  
18 insurance that should pay for this type of  
19 default if they can't make the payment,  
20 however, in speaking with the business  
21 administrator he relayed his thoughts that  
22 the insurance company made then come after  
23 the city for the monies, so that money is  
24 actually in the operating budget and,  
25 unfortunately, the taxpayers of Scranton are

1 the ones that are on the hook for it.

2 MS. SCHUMACHER: So that 1.6 will  
3 cover the 2.9?

4 MR. JOYCE: Correct.

5 MS. SCHUMACHER: You believe, okay,  
6 and then I'll just finish with next week I  
7 would ask Mr. Rogan to report, I noticed  
8 Rejuvenescence Wellness Spa has a \$12,000  
9 federal tax lien in today's paper. I'd like  
10 to know since they have OECD money how  
11 that's doing and also since Outrageous moved  
12 out of the city if they repaid the loan that  
13 they have from OECD as well.

14 MR. ROGAN: We'll do.

15 MS. SCHUMACHER: Thank you.

16 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

17 MR. HUGHES: Madam President, if I  
18 can just make two quick comments. Number  
19 one, council had nothing to do with the  
20 University of Scranton getting the variance  
21 to move out of the institutional district  
22 into an R-2 zone. That was the Scranton  
23 Zoning Board. They went before the Scranton  
24 Zoning Board for a variance. The actual  
25 institutional district ends at Mulberry



1 Street. When they went across the other  
2 side of Mulberry Street they went and  
3 applied to the zoning board. Council had  
4 nothing to do with that, so that was not  
5 council, that's a matter of the zoning  
6 board.

7 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, I thought  
8 council negotiated that and that's how we  
9 got --

10 MR. HUGHES: No, no, no. We didn't  
11 negotiate it. When we negotiated it we went  
12 in and we went before Father Pilarz and they  
13 wanted the air rights over the alley. They  
14 wanted the city to give the air rights over  
15 the alley because they had it designed as  
16 one building. The condition was that we  
17 would sell the air rights over the alley so  
18 they could have one building. We would sell  
19 it at I believe for a quarter of a million  
20 dollars which would have been \$50,000, a  
21 quarter of a million dollars to sell the air  
22 rights.

23 Father Pilarz said, "We'll build two  
24 separate buildings so we don't have to give  
25 the City of Scranton any money for the air

1 rights, and that's why there is two separate  
2 buildings. It cost them more money to build  
3 two separate buildings than if they just  
4 went with the one, with the one building,  
5 but that was a result of the Scranton Zoning  
6 Board permitting that there and then they  
7 wanted to buy the air rights off of the City  
8 of Scranton which council had to approve.  
9 They said, fine, come up with more money  
10 because you have taken the tax base.

11 MS. SCHUMACHER: So the zoning  
12 actually came first then.

13 MR. HUGHES: Yes. Secondly, as to  
14 the \$2.9 million with the Parking Authority,  
15 that was never approved by Scranton City  
16 Council, that loan is not guaranteed by the  
17 city.

18 MS. SCHUMACHER: I understand that.

19 MR. HUGHES: It's my opinion that  
20 the City of Scranton taxpayers have no  
21 responsibility for that loan. That's  
22 strictly a Scranton Parking Authority loan,  
23 it's not guaranteed by the City of Scranton  
24 or the taxpayers of the City of Scranton.  
25 The Scranton Parking Authority has to sink

1 or swim with that loan on it's own, and  
2 that's Boyd Hughes' opinion.

3 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, I understand  
4 that, but, I mean, something will -- I mean,  
5 it's our Parking Authority so -- more next  
6 year.

7 MR. JOYCE: And just one quick  
8 comment that I wanted make about grants and  
9 whatnot, all of the numbers that were used  
10 in the budget as far as grants and savings  
11 from refinancing early and whatnot, these  
12 were all numbers that were confirmed by  
13 business administrator Ryan McGowan. These  
14 were double checked with the PEL. The mayor  
15 actually was the one that mentioned the \$1.4  
16 million by refinancing early on the meeting  
17 with the banks, so these are numbers that a  
18 number of the parties have confirmed, so I'm  
19 -- we're trusting those numbers.

20 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, I understand,  
21 they may come in in 2012, but it could be  
22 December of 2012 on that grant and not  
23 January 2012 and that's why I'm concerned.

24 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

25 MR. JOYCE: Correct, but our

1 intentions is for the firefighters to be  
2 reinstated on January 1, the ones that were  
3 laid off, not when the grant money comes in  
4 for the health care savings grant.

5 Now, the SAFER grant Mr. McGowan  
6 already stated to me that he wouldn't be  
7 adding positions back in for the SAFER  
8 grant, which is a whole separate grant,  
9 until the city actually received money for  
10 the positions.

11 MS. SCHUMACHER: But he did commit  
12 to the 13 immediately?

13 MR. JOYCE: Well, he didn't --  
14 that's a whole other thing. Obviously, the  
15 mayor is now the one who has the discretion  
16 to put those individuals, those hardworking  
17 firefighters back into the budget and he has  
18 the right to hire and fire as he sees fit,  
19 so that is his decision. It's our wish that  
20 he does and that was the intent of my motion  
21 last night.

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Please  
23 begin.

24 MR. MURRAY: Thank you. Good  
25 evening, Council. My name is Brian Murray,

1 I'm a city resident and taxpayer I am also a  
2 firefighter. I am the first of the 29 to be  
3 laid off. I understand that you have found  
4 funding for 13 of our guys, I will not be  
5 one of the gentlemen reinstated. I can't  
6 speak on behalf of our union, I am not an  
7 executive board member, but I am the  
8 organizer of the peaceful protest that we  
9 had outside last week. I did bring roughly  
10 100 taxpayers to council to show their  
11 support for public safety, and on behalf of  
12 myself and the supporters that did come, I'd  
13 like to say thank you for at least  
14 attempting to provide some semblance of the  
15 safety, although, I feel woefully  
16 inadequate, but at least attempting to  
17 provide some type of safety for my family  
18 and the citizens of this city. Thank you.

19 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

20 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

21 MS. FRANUS: Fay Franus, Scranton.

22 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

23 MS. FRANUS: That's what I like to  
24 hear, a firemen that appreciates the work  
25 that you have done, and it's very important

1           because the citizens owe all of you a great  
2           deal of gratitude for how you have looked  
3           out for them in your budget process and,  
4           Frank Joyce, I can't even begin to tell you  
5           how much we appreciate your knowledge. You  
6           pushed all of this through with hours and  
7           hours and days and days and weeks of work  
8           with Mrs. Evans' and Pat Rogan's help as  
9           well, but you have been the main one. Let  
10          me tell you, the people really appreciate  
11          all you have done.

12                        You came about last night with a  
13           proposal for the funding for the 13 firemen  
14           and also made a motion for that SAFER grant.  
15           Now, I just want to clarify, because I read  
16           in the paper this morning, that Mr. Judge  
17           thinks that council should do more. I mean,  
18           the truth council can't do anymore. You  
19           have stated that, but they don't seem to get  
20           it some of them. You have done everything  
21           you can do legally. You provided the  
22           wherewithal for Mayor Doherty to help put  
23           these firemen back and you looked out for  
24           the people's safety. Now, it's all in  
25           Mr. Doherty's hands, only his, but we want

1 to thank you for trying and lowering this  
2 tax increase for the citizens who may  
3 possibly or more than likely will be able to  
4 stay in their homes thanks to your hard  
5 work. Where as Mayor Doherty's budget, many  
6 would have lost their homes, so I hope  
7 tonight's vote you vote for the people like  
8 you always have and since you have been  
9 elected. And, Mr. McGoff, I hope you vote  
10 with them as well. Thank you.

11 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.

12 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who  
13 cares to address council?

14 MR. JOYCE: Chrissy.

15 MR. SLEDENZSKI: Frankie.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: We missed you.

17 MR. SLEDENZSKI: I'm in a fog, Jack,  
18 you know that, Jack. You know how life is.  
19 You know something, Jack, these firemen  
20 downstairs are doing a good job down there.  
21 Save their jobs, will you for me. Save  
22 their jobs for me. Every one of them  
23 downstairs, save their jobs. Save them. We  
24 need them around here.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: We are doing all we

1 can.

2 MR. ANCHERANI: Good evening.  
3 Nelson Ancherani, resident and taxpayer,  
4 recording secretary of the FOP, First  
5 Amendment Rights.

6 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

7 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

8 MR. ANCHERANI: At least I believe  
9 we have free speech and I'm voicing my  
10 opinion. Tonight, council, you are going to  
11 vet on your amended budget for 2012. You  
12 have a huge task. I wouldn't want to be in  
13 your shoes. No matter how you amend the  
14 budget you are going to have people happy  
15 with you or mad at you. Dammed if you do,  
16 dammed if you don't.

17 Last Thursday in Harrisburg I  
18 attended the Senate and House joint hearings  
19 on Act 47. I got to hear our mayor testify.  
20 He testified that in 2000 the city was  
21 sanctioned by the state for violating the  
22 city Recovery Plan. In 2000 Connors was the  
23 mayor. What I didn't hear him testify to  
24 was that the sanctioning came at his request  
25 when he was Finance Chair for council.



1                   He testified that a new Recovery  
2                   Plan was passed when he became mayor in  
3                   2002, and a referendum to be put on the  
4                   ballot was requested by the fire and police  
5                   unions and that 72 percent of the people  
6                   voted for the plan. What he didn't say was  
7                   that it was 72 percent of the people who  
8                   voted during that election who voted in  
9                   favor of the plan. We know how people in  
10                  this area come out to vote. They don't.  
11                  Most are apathetic, sad to say. People  
12                  think you can't fight city hall. Things  
13                  will never change. They are wrong. Look at  
14                  how many people turned out for the council  
15                  meeting last week. That is the way it  
16                  should be every week for every meeting.

17                  Did you ever, except in recent  
18                  history, see amended budgets and people  
19                  wanting to know how their tax dollars are  
20                  being spent? People don't want their tax  
21                  dollars thrown into the proverbial black  
22                  hole, never to be seen again. Prime example  
23                  of that is when the mayor was asked how much  
24                  the city spent fighting the unions over the  
25                  last ten years. His answer was over \$4

1 million. Over \$4 million fighting the  
2 police and fire unions over labor issues  
3 because he wanted to bring us to our knees  
4 and break our unions. If he bargained in  
5 good faith over the years we would not be  
6 looking at the possibility of the city  
7 facing a \$30 million payment to the police  
8 and fire unions because of stubbornness and  
9 broken contracts.

10 Over past years police and fire  
11 traditionally made concessions during  
12 bargaining and negotiating sessions when the  
13 city cried poverty. We always made  
14 concessions to help the city, but you never  
15 see any of that in the slimes.

16 Back to testimony, the mayor said,  
17 "In 2011, the City of Scranton, which is  
18 self-insured, was spending \$15 million on  
19 health care."

20 How do we know the figure is \$15  
21 million? During our bargaining sessions  
22 that were shot down by the mayor and even  
23 after we had agreed by shaking hands and  
24 still shot down by the mayor, the city would  
25 not tell us what health care costs were.

1           Why not? That's still the \$64,000 question.  
2           Don't forget in 2002 the mayor forced out  
3           many of the approximately 100 employees that  
4           left city employment while keeping their  
5           health care benefits for life, he also paid  
6           the new employees taking their places full  
7           health care and benefits. There is so much  
8           more to say but no time to say it in.

9                         Anyway, Mrs. Krake's testimony was  
10           excellent, as was Mrs. Evans and FOP  
11           President Martin's written testimony. So  
12           all you people in TV land Tuesday night  
13           council meetings are my night out. Make it  
14           your night out. You are what the city needs  
15           to make a difference. You can fight city  
16           hall and make changes, just don't be lazy or  
17           apathetic and think you can't make a  
18           difference. You can.

19                         And as for the spirit of the  
20           cooperation, we all know how contracts are  
21           honored under this city. Remember, American  
22           Anglican contract when the administration  
23           didn't Honor it. Taxpayers paid Scranton  
24           Sewer Authority a 56 percent rate increase.  
25           Police union contracts, is that why the city

1 has to pay upwards \$30 million? If the city  
2 honored contracts, we would not have  
3 arbitrations that cost us 30 million.  
4 Enough said. Merry Christmas and Happy New  
5 Year's.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And to you,  
7 also. Is there anyone else who cares to  
8 address council?

9 MS. KRAKE: 5-A. MOTIONS.

10 MS. EVANS: Mr. McGoff, do you have  
11 any motions or comments?

12 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. Thank you. I  
13 guess I'll address the budget at this point  
14 in time so that there's opportunity for  
15 response. A couple of the things that I  
16 looked at in the budget I'm pleased with,  
17 there are a couple of things that I had  
18 questions about, and a couple of things that  
19 I am not pleased with.

20 First, I'd like to address the tax  
21 revenue. When I look at a 4.8 percent  
22 increase in millage that does not reach  
23 \$13.9 million. It comes up almost a million  
24 dollars short. If we are going to increase  
25 the millage, it would appear that you need

1           an increase of about 10 or 11 percent to  
2           reach \$13.9 million in tax revenue, so  
3           that's the first thing that I had questions  
4           about. At first glance it looks like we may  
5           be -- close to \$1 million short.

6                     The second thing, in the additional  
7           revenues that were presented we talked about  
8           or Mr. Joyce talked about \$6.3 million, \$3  
9           million being in current monies in the bank  
10          and another \$3.3 million from the Single Tax  
11          Office. In speaking with Mr. McGowan, he  
12          told me that the number is closer to \$4.2  
13          million as opposed to \$6.3 million, and  
14          while we budgeted for 6.3 million, there is  
15          only 4.2 million available, approximately  
16          2.6 in the bank and the 3.3 that was  
17          supposed to be coming from the tax office,  
18          half of that has already been received and  
19          is included in the amount that is on hand in  
20          the general fund. So we are, again, looking  
21          at a shortfall there of somewhere around,  
22          you know, a little over \$2 million, and when  
23          we take a look at -- we couple that with the  
24          6.7 in unfunded debt, it doesn't appear as  
25          though there is enough money to pay the

1 bills that we need to pay, the unpaid bills,  
2 the TANS, SRA payment, it doesn't appear as  
3 though there is sufficient funding and it  
4 looks as though we are edging onto maybe \$3  
5 million in a shortfall, at least from some  
6 estimates.

7 And as far as the Scranton Parking  
8 Authority, we are putting \$1.6 million into  
9 the contingency, I believe the entire amount  
10 in the contingency is \$1.7 million.

11 MR. JOYCE: Correct.

12 MR. MCGOFF: And so if, in fact, we  
13 have to pay that 1.6 to the Scranton Parking  
14 Authority, you are looking at very little  
15 left in the contingency for any emergency  
16 situations. I don't know if that is -- if  
17 that's going to work.

18 And as far as another thing that I  
19 am concerned with is the -- are the cuts in  
20 DPW. Yes, I supported some of the cuts that  
21 were made, I did not support the cuts in all  
22 of the management positions that were made.  
23 I think it's impossible to operate something  
24 as extensive as DPW and the number of  
25 different facets there are to DPW without

1           adequate supervision and management. I  
2           think that, you know, with the cuts that  
3           have been made we are looking at very  
4           diminished services. I think it's  
5           inevitable any time that you cut personnel  
6           you are going to have diminished service.

7                         And the other thing that worries me  
8           is with the cut in this number of people of  
9           working, in case of an emergency how are we  
10          going to justify bringing these people in,  
11          an evening snow storm after these people  
12          have worked a full day and now bringing them  
13          back out for an emergency situation and a  
14          situation which they do not have to work.  
15          They can't be forced to work the overtime  
16          hours. I'm sure that many of them, you  
17          know, welcome some of the overtime, but you  
18          can't force that and so you are looking at  
19          the same situation that we had with the fire  
20          department that we -- you know, the  
21          complaints that, you know, we're sending  
22          people out there after working a full day  
23          and then asking them to put in another shift  
24          and then asking them to go back to work the  
25          next day, you know, in their normal jobs. I

1 just don't see how that is going to work and  
2 I'm told that, okay, maybe we can declare an  
3 emergency and hire, you know, private snow  
4 removal, but I'm told that according to the  
5 contract that once workers are laid off that  
6 by contract you can't call in private  
7 removal and so we are looking at, you know  
8 the possibility of the snow removal just not  
9 happening.

10 And as far as the casuals are  
11 concerned, I know we put in, you know,  
12 reduced the amount except for lifeguards, I  
13 would much rather see people working in  
14 refuse and other parts of DPW rather than  
15 funding lifeguards. Personally, if a pool  
16 didn't open this summer and we were able to  
17 put more people into providing the services  
18 that's needed, I would be happy. I don't  
19 know how we are going to fund for lifeguards  
20 when we are not willing to fund for people  
21 that are essential to the services that the  
22 city needs.

23 The last thing, the payroll cuts  
24 that were made, 10 percent cuts, I believe  
25 were absolutely unnecessary. Six positions



1                   were cut which amounted to a total of  
2                   somewhere around \$28,000.

3                   MR. ROGAN: \$51,000.

4                   MR. MCGOFF: \$51,000? I must have  
5                   missed some. I just don't think that that's  
6                   warranted. These people have had their  
7                   salaries reduced in the last budget, there  
8                   was no need to reduce them again. In many  
9                   cases you have, you know, people in  
10                  management positions not working or making  
11                  less than the subordinates and I just don't  
12                  think that that's necessary.

13                  And the other thing is that the  
14                  discrepancy that exists between the fire and  
15                  the police chiefs. \$13,000 discrepancy, I  
16                  believe is just to me it seems a bit  
17                  vindictive, and again, unwarranted, and I  
18                  think with all of these things that exist,  
19                  questions I have for the budget, I just  
20                  think there are too many questions that  
21                  exist and I think it needs to be revisited.  
22                  Thank you.

23                  MS. EVANS: Thank you.

24                  MR. JOYCE: I'll start by explaining  
25                  some of the questions, and I know that there

1 is probably other council members who  
2 spearheaded certain things like pay  
3 decreases. I know Mr. Rogan was an  
4 advocate, I think he might be able to  
5 explain as well. The real estate tax cut,  
6 if you look at Mr. McGowan's latest cash  
7 flow report it's indicated in current real  
8 estate tax that he projects we will bring in  
9 \$13.15 million this year. PEL they are on  
10 record stating that the former Mercy  
11 Hospital, which is now owned by a for profit  
12 company is going to bring in an extra  
13 \$200,000, so that's \$13,350,000. The amount  
14 in the budget for the real estate tax  
15 revenue is right up in the area of 14  
16 million, it's 13.9 something and change.  
17 There is a difference of about 600 and some  
18 thousand dollars and that 600 and some  
19 thousand dollars divided by the amount that  
20 we would be expected to receive last year  
21 following Mr. McGowan's cash flow report and  
22 the \$200,000 that PEL projects we'll see  
23 from the hospital, is 4.8 percent.

24 And on other matters, the additional  
25 revenues --

1 MR. MCGOFF: Is that 4.8 percent in  
2 millage?

3 MR. JOYCE: Yes. That \$600,000  
4 divided by the 13.35 million is a 4.8  
5 percent increase.

6 As far as the additional revenues, I  
7 spoke to Mr. McGowan on Friday. He told me  
8 that we have roughly \$3 million in the bank.  
9 He said that we -- and I spoke to Bill  
10 Courtright about this as well, that no money  
11 was sent from the tax office as of Friday  
12 and actually that Ryan McGowan had called  
13 Mr. Courtright looking to have him issue  
14 money to the city, however, their system was  
15 down and that he would need more time.  
16 Mr. McGowan stated that we had \$3 million in  
17 the bank at that time on Friday and that the  
18 only other revenue, according to Gerry  
19 Cross, from PEL, that would come in would be  
20 from the tax office.

21 The \$3 million that was current on  
22 Friday included the liquid fuels transfer  
23 which is about \$1.5 million, which is half  
24 of about \$3 million. However, in the  
25 numbers that I used the \$3.3 million that

1 was coming from the tax office wasn't there  
2 on Friday and that's, you know, in regard to  
3 that matter, that's where that information  
4 came from. So I wouldn't know if  
5 Mr. McGowan was telling me one story and  
6 telling you another story, but I'm going by  
7 what he told me as well as tax collector  
8 Bill Courtright.

9 The contingency concerns, I know  
10 that the \$1.7 million is there. We have  
11 \$100,000 in contingency this year and we  
12 haven't used that \$100,000 up from the  
13 contingency fund this year, so I know, I  
14 realize your concerns, but going by what we  
15 know this year we haven't used the  
16 contingency fund as of yet. Well, we have  
17 legislation taking some money of it tonight,  
18 but it certainly isn't up to the \$100,000  
19 and I'll let some other council members  
20 speak on some of your other concerns.

21 MS. EVANS: Councilman Rogan, do you  
22 have any comments or motions?

23 MR. ROGAN: First a few general  
24 comments and then I'll address some of  
25 Mr. McGoff's concerns. Mr. Vitris is here

1           today from the DPW union and Mr. Vitris used  
2           the word union multiple times and we have  
3           had many union reps from all of the other  
4           departments at these meetings and Mr. Vitris  
5           is here to represent his men. He does a  
6           great job representing the DPW. There is no  
7           questioning that, but at the end of the day  
8           city council has to represent all of the  
9           people of Scranton and cuts have to be made  
10          in every department. It's just the state of  
11          affairs that the city is in right now.

12                         And some of the concerns that were  
13           raised by speakers and by Mr. McGoff, the  
14           one manager under the DPW, and I know  
15           somebody else mentioned this and  
16           Mr. Jackowitz said about the military, when  
17           people go to work they know what their job  
18           is. It shouldn't matter where the manager  
19           is watching them or whether they are not  
20           they should still do their job. Chief Duffy  
21           is the only management position in the  
22           police department and he does a fine job.

23                         Next, Mr. McGoff mentioned snow  
24           removal, if refuse workers work a full day,  
25           DPW workers, and then have to remove snow,

1           now, I don't know if it was Director  
2           Brazil's idea last year or the mayor's, but  
3           I know at the end of the snow season last  
4           year they were removing garbage a day and  
5           doing all of the snow and I think by using  
6           that system there was -- they did a much  
7           better job of cleaning all of the streets  
8           and getting caught up on the garbage  
9           collection the next day, which I definitely  
10          think could be accomplished.

11                        Mr. McGoff also mentioned he would  
12          rather have garbage collectors over  
13          lifeguards and if it was a choice of not  
14          collecting garbage I would agree with you,  
15          personally I believe the DPW refuse division  
16          is overstaffed.

17                        You also mentioned that the 10  
18          percent cuts were unnecessary. I take full  
19          credit for these cuts. It was 10 percent  
20          across the board for all administrators, and  
21          I don't think they are vindictive at all.  
22          It was across the board, we even cut our own  
23          clerk's salary. It wasn't singling anyone  
24          out, it was a straight 10 percent, and I  
25          think when people are making larger salaries

1 people at the top also need to feel some --  
2 have some of the burden and not just the  
3 people on the bottom who have been cut from  
4 DPW, fire, and the police department.

5 One example when you mentioned the  
6 police chief making \$13,000 more than the  
7 fire chief, the police chief salary is based  
8 on or I believe the --

9 MR. JOYCE: Police officers work a  
10 40 hour work week.

11 MR. ROGAN: 40-hour work week. The  
12 firefighters work 48 so there is a  
13 discrepancy there as well when you bring it  
14 down to a per hour basis and it is a little  
15 bit different, but in general I think that  
16 Mr. Joyce and council as a whole did a very  
17 good job of representing what the people who  
18 contacted us wanted in this budget. It's  
19 not perfect, there is no perfect budget, I  
20 said it last night I'll say it next time,  
21 but the most of the important thing was that  
22 we were able to reduce the tax increase.

23 Mayor Doherty wanted to increase  
24 property taxes 29 percent, this budget only  
25 increases it 4.8 percent, and assuming this

1 passes and becomes law your taxes will still  
2 be lower now than the day we took office.  
3 And that is all I have for tonight.

4 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Councilman  
5 Rogan. Councilman Loscombe, do you have  
6 comments or motions?

7 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes, thank you. This  
8 city council started in 2011 finding out  
9 that we are over \$5 million in the hole due  
10 to the administration using the TANS to pay  
11 off money taken from Workers' Compensation  
12 Trust Fund. We have two major loans in  
13 default, one near default and one in default  
14 both for \$1.6 million each through the  
15 Redevelopment Authority and the Parking  
16 Authority. The mayor's own budget  
17 modifications last year added to the  
18 deficit. He added personnel and raises.

19 And one concern that's been  
20 mentioned several times here, and again,  
21 just in this discussion between Mr. McGoff  
22 and Mr. Joyce, without an audit it's hard to  
23 tell what Mr. Mr. McGowan has, you know, in  
24 the Business Administrator's Office and we  
25 are asked how can we do a budget without an



1           audit? Well, I give a lot of credit to  
2           Mr. Joyce because he has been doing a heck  
3           of a job with the numbers he has been  
4           getting, but those numbers are the numbers  
5           he is being provided and if they are wrong  
6           they are wrong because they were provided to  
7           him because we have no audit, but if we  
8           didn't formulate a budget we would have to  
9           abide by the mayor's budget if that was so,  
10          if we thought that budget was correct, but  
11          it's incumbent upon us to look at the  
12          numbers, listen to the people and do what he  
13          we have to do.

14                   The mayor left numerous revenue  
15          sources untouched last year and then the  
16          mayor's constant appeals has cost us a  
17          Supreme Court award of 20 to 30 million  
18          dollars. That's his appeals, not the  
19          union's. Nobody -- all of these I just read  
20          have been brought to us this year thanks to  
21          the administration, so you see we have a  
22          mess dumped on us and, you know, I anguished  
23          for the past couple of weeks myself how do  
24          we come up with a budget that is going to  
25          satisfy everybody. No budget is ideal.

1           There is winners and losers on both sides.

2                         But, you know, I stated previously  
3           that I wouldn't consider any budget that did  
4           not address our public safety shortfall.  
5           With that said, my colleagues have seen fit  
6           to do their best with some additional  
7           funding that has been discovered to the tune  
8           of \$600,000 through the prescription plan  
9           grant, something that has been available to  
10          us for the past couple of years, but ignored  
11          by this administration.

12                         The SAFER grants have also been  
13          available to increase public safety and  
14          again ignored by this administration. There  
15          is whole list of things here that have added  
16          up to this problem. Council has added to  
17          the problem, we have tried to alleviate it  
18          for the past two years. If we pass  
19          council's amended budget tonight will the  
20          mayor abide about it? I can't say for sure  
21          based on past history. I'm sure he will  
22          find ways to circumvent it. If council  
23          tonight agrees to go with the mayor's  
24          budget, that's a hard sell, too. I mean, we  
25          are losing a significant amount of public

1 safety plus the higher taxes, so I know how  
2 tired I am after the last two weeks, I can  
3 just imagine. I mean, and I know all of us,  
4 Mr. Rogan, Mr. McGoff, but Mrs. Evans and  
5 Mr. Joyce have been, I'll tell you, doing a  
6 phenomenal job working on the numbers and  
7 stuff like that, and based on my experience  
8 I have to put my faith in the numbers that  
9 have been provided here. Again, with no  
10 audit nobody can be blamed if we get another  
11 surprise like we did last year with the  
12 TANS, but I think they have tried to take  
13 into consideration maybe some surprises or  
14 whatever.

15 But I just feel that, you know,  
16 nobody or anybody that knows me, and I am  
17 the Chairman of the Committee on Public  
18 Safety, knows how I feel about it. I'm  
19 concerned about the public safety of our  
20 citizens, I'm concerned about the public  
21 safety -- or the safety of our police  
22 officers and firefighters, but we in this  
23 budget, the amended budget, have provided  
24 some tools to start to address some of the  
25 these problems, something that isn't in the

1           mayor's budget. DPW, I do have some  
2           concerns regarding the drivers and that I  
3           would like to, you know, we'll further  
4           discuss those with my colleagues here.

5           The people from Occupy Scranton I  
6           want to thank for working hard on the issues  
7           that they believe in, but I want to allude  
8           to something Mr. Morgan stated from this  
9           podium earlier, he stated that there was an  
10          agreement that the mayor had made to fund  
11          the additional 29 firefighters, and I tell  
12          you from a personal level I have been on the  
13          front of this for the last couple of weeks,  
14          I have been in constant contact with the  
15          Mr. Gervasi and as of late yesterday  
16          afternoon he had no signed agreement from  
17          the mayor and actually I went around to fire  
18          stations, I discussed this with some of the  
19          firefighters, and I have to say, and you saw  
20          them tonight, they thanked us for doing what  
21          we are doing. I received a very -- they  
22          told us, and this is right from the  
23          firefighters' mouths that I spoke to, and  
24          I'll quot a couple of them, that we  
25          represent 70,000 taxpayers here and we have

1 to do what's best for the taxpayers, so  
2 there is no selfishness on their part.

3 They have also told me that based on  
4 the history of this administration over the  
5 last ten years that if the mayor signed that  
6 agreement right in front of them they  
7 wouldn't trust it. So, you know, I have to  
8 take all of that into consideration, too.  
9 We have seen the history. And, you know,  
10 these are gentlemen that are affected. I  
11 spoke to gentlemen that were able to retire  
12 and, you know, it was a pretty good talk. I  
13 had retirees I have spoken to, I have spoken  
14 to other political -- or public officials,  
15 and when it comes down to it at this point I  
16 believe that city council's amended budget  
17 is in the best interest of everyone.

18 We are going to continue, do I  
19 believe that we still have a public safety  
20 concern? I definitely do. I am scared to  
21 death, but at least we are starting to  
22 address the problem. I wish we could find  
23 another \$2 million. Do we need the DPW  
24 workers? We need them all. Trust me, I  
25 have a family member that works there and I

1 know how hard they work. Police officers,  
2 we are short on them, but the problem is we  
3 have been trying to work budgets to modify  
4 these problems for the last two years  
5 unsuccessfully. We didn't create these  
6 problems. And last of all, we didn't  
7 decimate your public safety, the mayor did,  
8 and I believe it was Mr. Jackowitz that  
9 said, you know, bring your problems -- if  
10 I'm mistaken, bring your problems to the  
11 mayor's office that's where it all begins.

12 And, Mrs. Schumacher, trust me, I'm  
13 as concerned as you are, I mentioned it last  
14 week, I have an elderly mother that lives  
15 alone, you know, this is all close to my  
16 heart, but we have to make some hard  
17 decisions here and try and spread what we  
18 have to benefit 70,000 taxpayers, and I have  
19 to base my decision on what I think is best  
20 for everyone, and at this point I believe  
21 that the amended budget is the budget that  
22 best covers everybody in this city. It's  
23 not ideal, but I believe it's a lot better  
24 than the one that was presented to us by the  
25 administration and hopefully we can go from

1           there, and that's all I have to say. Thank  
2           you.

3                       MR. ROGAN: Thank you, Mr. Loscombe,  
4           Mr. Joyce, do you have any motions or  
5           comments?

6                       MR. JOYCE: Yes, I do. First of  
7           all, I want to say I don't want to see  
8           anybody lose their jobs in the city, whether  
9           it be in the administration, DPW, fire  
10          department, police department, I think  
11          everyone that works for the city is doing  
12          the best that they could at their jobs and,  
13          you know, it's ashame that people have to  
14          lose their jobs, but the city with the  
15          current state of the City of Scranton the  
16          cuts that were made are necessary and  
17          tonight I wanted to clear up some budget  
18          questions that some may have. I know I just  
19          explained this, but I want to reiterate  
20          again.

21                      The first one I want to clarify is  
22          the reduction of the tax increase from 29.1  
23          to 4.8 and how this number was obtained, and  
24          as I said before, by reading Mr. McGowan's  
25          latest cash flow report it's evident that

1 the city will receive approximately 13.15  
2 million in current real estate taxes at the  
3 current tax rate for this year.

4 Subsequently, PEL, Pennsylvania  
5 Economy League, stated that the city should  
6 expect to receive an additional \$200,000 in  
7 real estate taxes due to the former Mercy  
8 Hospital not paying real estate taxes since  
9 they were purchased by a for profit company,  
10 CHS. With this in mind, this is  
11 approximately 13.35 million that the city  
12 would realize at the current tax rate. The  
13 amount budgeted for current real estate tax  
14 in council's amendment is approximately  
15 \$13,970,000. If one were to divide the  
16 difference between the current projected  
17 rate -- by the current projected rate--  
18 between the current projected rate by the  
19 projected rate the result is 4.8 percent.

20 I did actually speak to Gerry Cross  
21 about this from the Pennsylvania Economy  
22 League and I did inform him where I received  
23 this or where -- how I came up with this  
24 figure.

25 The second matter that I wanted to



1 comment on tonight is the SRA loan being  
2 considered a prior year obligation.

3 Officially, I consult with our business  
4 administrator, Ryan McGowan, regarding this  
5 matter as to whether the SRA loan default  
6 can be considered a prior year obligation.  
7 He instructed me that he didn't know for  
8 sure.

9 My second step in the process was to  
10 reach out to Gerry Cross at PEL who  
11 instructed me that Matt Domines from DCED  
12 would be the best person to address this. I  
13 reached out to Matt Domines from DCED and in  
14 speaking with him he did not say that the  
15 default of the SRA loan could be considered  
16 a prior year expense, and further instructed  
17 to consult with our council solicitor to  
18 determine if the SRA loan default would be,  
19 in fact, considered a prior year expense.

20 With this in mind, I contacted our  
21 council solicitor, Boyd Hughes, who informed  
22 me that this could be considered a prior  
23 year expense. In fact, the SRA loan default  
24 was an unexpected expense from the letter  
25 sent to us by Rhoades and Sinon, the

1 attorneys representing Pennstar Bank, who we  
2 owe the \$1.4 million to. They had informed  
3 us of the default on May 19 of 2011. The  
4 default of the SRA loan is not a matter that  
5 is a 2012 expenditure as it is a matter that  
6 occurred in a prior year and was unexpected,  
7 a prior year to 2012 meaning.

8 The third matter that I'll comment  
9 on tonight are the DPW cuts. In today's  
10 Scranton Times' article, I know Mr. Vitris,  
11 who does a very great job at the DPW in  
12 defending his union, he did state that the  
13 union -- or that the cuts to the DPW will  
14 decimate the department. Over the past two  
15 weeks, Mr. Brazil, the current director of  
16 the DPW, also expressed some of his concerns  
17 which were broadcast on Channel 16 as well  
18 as WBRE Channel No. 28. As Mrs. Evans  
19 stated yesterday, when there was buyout  
20 incentive offers to eliminate ten employees  
21 there were no concerns that were reported to  
22 the news or the newspaper, that were  
23 published at least, regarding the Department  
24 of Public Works' functions, yet somehow  
25 there are now claims that the elimination of

1 a few more positions in management, in  
2 particular, will now decimate the  
3 department.

4 Now, first let me begin my saying  
5 that the mayor may have chose to layoff more  
6 DPW workers than we originally decided to in  
7 the 2012 budget amendments, and I'll quote  
8 the e-mail that I received from Ryan  
9 McGowan, our business administrator. "As of  
10 right now we are in current negotiations  
11 with the DPW. The only specifics that I can  
12 add is that there are ten individuals with  
13 30 years of service and ten individuals with  
14 20 to 25 years of service that may take the  
15 buyout. We are hoping to complete  
16 negotiations of all jobs that were budgeted  
17 for next year with the understanding that if  
18 no individual took the incentive there would  
19 be layoffs within the department next year."

20 Interesting enough, from  
21 Mr. McGowan's correspondence, it's evident  
22 that the administration could have very well  
23 planned to buyout of 20 DPW employees. When  
24 a buyout was mentioned, everything was fine.  
25 However, when positions were cut instead of

1           being bought out all of a sudden, you know,  
2           there is concerns of this decimating the  
3           department, which doesn't seem to make a lot  
4           of sense.

5                         In addition, the nine union  
6           positions that the DPW -- that were  
7           eliminated in the DPW were suggested by  
8           Councilman McGoff who serves as the DPW  
9           chair. The four nonunion positions that  
10          were cut were suggested by other council  
11          members, and personally in my opinion  
12          thought buyouts are nice incentives for  
13          people to retire they often include a cash  
14          benefit or a health insurance benefit such  
15          as health insurance for life.

16                        Let me tell you something, this is  
17          very costly for the city. As I stated in a  
18          previous meeting, the city currently funds  
19          the health insurance costs of 638 retirees.  
20          This amounts to a cost between 7.5 and 8  
21          million dollars to the city taxpayers each  
22          year. The City of Scranton cannot afford  
23          such expenditures no matter what union we  
24          are talking about, whether it be the DPW,  
25          police, fire. Because think about it, if we

1 had that \$8 million back or \$7.5 million  
2 back or even half of it, we wouldn't even  
3 have to cut employees.

4 In amending the 2012 operating  
5 budget, there were many conversations that  
6 were conducted between our BA, Ryan McGowan,  
7 and I as well as Gerry Cross and I, and I  
8 also had a conversation with Matt Domines  
9 from DCED, as I stated before. I'd like to  
10 thank our business administrator, Ryan  
11 McGowan, for providing me with the  
12 information that I asked for when asked,  
13 though I realize that it is part of his job  
14 to provide information to council when  
15 asked, I'm hoping it's a step in the right  
16 direction in order to establish a  
17 collaborative effort to improve the City of  
18 Scranton between the administration and  
19 council and I hope the administration  
20 continues to communicate with council in a  
21 more effective manner in the future.

22 I'd also like to thank Gerry Cross  
23 from PEL, though PEL has been the subject of  
24 criticism, PEL has been helpful in providing  
25 the information regarding some of the

1 amendments that were made last night. I had  
2 various conversations with Mr. Cross  
3 throughout the whole budget process.  
4 Hopefully, PEL can be of more assistance to  
5 us in the future and providing alternative  
6 sources of the revenue that could be pursued  
7 in order to shield Scranton taxpayers from  
8 increases in taxes in future years.

9 As you know, I stated that there are  
10 many measures that have to be done on a  
11 state level in order to generate more  
12 revenue such as instituting a payroll  
13 expense tax or something to the order of the  
14 commuter tax or Mr. Doherty's idea of  
15 implementing a countywide sales' tax that  
16 with be split up amongst municipalities and  
17 counties.

18 Now, finally tonight though, I  
19 wanted to thank my colleagues for their  
20 input into the budget amendments. The  
21 budget process this year was a process that  
22 involved many individuals. I'd like to  
23 begin by thanking Councilman McGoff for  
24 suggestions and also his dedication to the  
25 future success of the rental registration

1 program. Though Councilman McGoff and I do  
2 not agree on every issue, he put forth a  
3 good effort on providing amendments and I  
4 tried to incorporate as much his amendments  
5 as I could.

6 I'd also like to thank Councilman  
7 Rogan for his examination of the budget and  
8 recommendations of the cost saving measures  
9 along with his fiscally conservative views  
10 and his persistent to save the taxpayers of  
11 Scranton as much as can be saved.

12 I'd also like to thank Councilman  
13 Loscombe for his dedication to public safety  
14 and doing as much as he can to ensure that  
15 the residents of Scranton remain safe in the  
16 midst of Scranton's financial situation.

17 And finally, I'd like to thank  
18 Councilwoman Evans for her recommendations.  
19 Councilwoman Evans throughout the whole  
20 budget process met with our tax collector to  
21 discuss matters in his office, and also  
22 corresponded with John Rogers from Northeast  
23 Revenue Services. She provided many  
24 amendments that were enacted and spent a  
25 great deal of time on the budget while still

1 managing to keep up with all of the  
2 additional obligations of being our council  
3 president, and there are a lot of  
4 obligations of being a council president  
5 that many people don't realize as opposed to  
6 regular council members. Her dedication to  
7 the residents of Scranton was evident in her  
8 efforts.

9 Throughout the budget amendment  
10 process, Councilwoman Evans and I had  
11 various conversations and it's apparent that  
12 she truly cares about the residents of  
13 Scranton and should be commended for her  
14 efforts. Overall, I just want to thank all  
15 of my colleagues for their active role in  
16 the budget process, and that's all.

17 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Joyce.  
18 Good evening. I wish to begin by thanking  
19 City Council's Finance Chair, Frank Joyce,  
20 for his diligent meticulous work in the  
21 development of council's amendments to the  
22 mayor's 2012 proposed budget and his  
23 outstanding public presentations delivered  
24 on December 3 and December 12, 2011.  
25 Throughout the budget process, Councilman



1           Joyce remained in constant contact with the  
2           business administrator, the Pennsylvania  
3           Economy League, the State Department of  
4           Community and Economic Development, and the  
5           banking community, among others. Thus, the  
6           amendments to the mayor's proposed budget  
7           have been advised and/or confirmed by the  
8           aforementioned parties.

9           Mayor Doherty handed this council a  
10          devastating budget that contained a 29  
11          percent tax increase, the sale or lease of  
12          the parking meters to the SPA, the  
13          elimination of the 29 firefighters, as well  
14          as a failure to address all 2011 unpaid  
15          bills. Through his diligent work,  
16          Councilman Joyce successfully addressed all  
17          of the issues placed before this council and  
18          he deserves our recognition and gratitude,  
19          not only on behalf of Scranton City Council,  
20          but on behalf of all of the residents and  
21          taxpayers of this city.

22          In addition, these council  
23          amendments represent the input of all five  
24          council members. I thank my honorable  
25          colleagues for submitting their amendments

1 and by so doing it was evident that on many  
2 issues such as the cuts to the DPW, the  
3 lowering of the mayor's tax increase and the  
4 funding of fire department positions, that  
5 there were at least three council members  
6 and most often more in agreement.

7 Although, these amendments and the  
8 2012 budget are not perfect and no  
9 participant in their development received  
10 100 percent of his or her proposals, they  
11 are a successful collaboration among the  
12 administration, city council, the  
13 Pennsylvania Economy League and others.

14 Mayor Doherty handed this council a  
15 ravaging budget for city taxpayers and his  
16 four major financial messes. In response,  
17 city council's amendments lowered the  
18 mayor's tax increase of 29.1 percent to 4.8  
19 percent for the taxpayers of Scranton,  
20 eliminate the sale or lease of the  
21 city-owned parking meters to the SPA by  
22 including 6.7 million in borrowing for 2011  
23 unfunded debt, and includes \$600,000 from a  
24 prescription health care savings grant for  
25 which Mayor Doherty intends to apply in

1 order to fund the reinstatement of 13  
2 firefighters.

3 Equally important, city council has  
4 cleaned up each of the four Doherty messes  
5 by agreeing to borrow \$6.7 for 2011 unfunded  
6 debt, including \$120,000 in the budget to  
7 repay OECD's debt to HUD, hire Northeast  
8 Revenue Service to collect tax delinquencies  
9 and retain 1.6 million in the 2012 budget  
10 for the SRA's debt, and placing \$1.6 million  
11 into the contingency account for the  
12 Scranton Parking Authority for use only if  
13 indisputably necessary and with council's  
14 approval.

15 Further, 2011 unpaid bills such as  
16 those for the \$500,000 of services for MEM  
17 are funded in council's amendments.

18 In today's Scranton's Times,  
19 business administrator McGowan questions  
20 where the SRA loan can be included in the  
21 back bills, however, as Mr. Joyce stated in  
22 his comments, the loan payment was due in  
23 full in December 2011 and both the  
24 administration and city council retained  
25 copies of the numerous letters sent

1 throughout 2011 by Rhoades and Sinon, the  
2 firm representing Pennstar Bank, indicating  
3 that the funds were due and it would declare  
4 the city in default.

5 In addition, payments from Northeast  
6 Revenue Services began to be provided to  
7 Pennstar Bank in the Fall of 2011. Thus, it  
8 seems quite evident that the SRA loan is,  
9 indeed, a 2011 debt.

10 Additionally, city council did not  
11 alter overtime projections for any city  
12 department. Interestingly, when DPW  
13 retirement incentives were on the mayor's  
14 table, there was no talk by the DPW that  
15 work would be affected. However, since city  
16 council removed \$100,000 in buyouts from the  
17 budget, the DPW union president says it  
18 can't do it's work.

19 Now, just to return briefly, I know  
20 we discussed substitutes, and it also  
21 occurred to me that probably in every  
22 school -- well, we'll use in city district,  
23 in every school each day there are never  
24 enough substitutes. In fact, at the  
25 beginning of the year teachers are asked to

1 sign a list to serve as the substitutes, and  
2 that is very often what happens. When a  
3 colleague is off sick it is that person's  
4 colleagues who come in and take over each  
5 one of those classes all day long, so it is  
6 a matter of workers covering for other  
7 worker's.

8 City council and I particularly have  
9 great confidence in the ability of DPW  
10 employees to get the job done for city  
11 taxpayers just as the police, fire, and  
12 clerical employees have done as their  
13 numbers were cut. Our city is in financial  
14 crisis, and as the mayor said, we must do  
15 more with less.

16 Further, council's amendments  
17 include a new parking tax which was  
18 recommended by the Pennsylvania Economy  
19 League. The tax will be levied on parking  
20 garages throughout the City of Scranton,  
21 thereby providing that nonprofits will  
22 contribute to their host city in some way.

23 Just as city council proposed new  
24 revenue generators for our city in both the  
25 2011 and 2012 budgets, it intends to pursue

1 other new revenues in the coming year to  
2 hold the line on Scranton taxes while the  
3 city struggles to pay the significantly  
4 increasing debt service due to the tens of  
5 millions that must be borrowed to pay police  
6 and fire in fulfillment of the Supreme Court  
7 decision.

8 With the input of the PEL and the  
9 administration, city council will work  
10 toward implementing a payroll tax, commuter  
11 tax and amusement tax for the 2013 budget.

12 In the immediate future, however,  
13 the administration should implement a  
14 parking program such as StreetSmart in order  
15 to increase on-street parking and ticket  
16 revenue if it is going to continue to pay  
17 the Scranton Parking Authority debt.

18 Otherwise, the city will be unable to save  
19 the Scranton Parking Authority from  
20 financial collapse because it has it's own  
21 mounting significant financial obligations.

22 Finally, I took an oath to serve and  
23 represent all Scrantonians and I have done  
24 so fairly and honestly without favoritism or  
25 malice. Our city is in a financial crisis

1 that will extend into the next several  
2 years. It would be irresponsible to  
3 unrealistically inflate financial figures,  
4 reinstate all city employees, and include  
5 wish lists into a budget that unquestionably  
6 requires the most solid figures that are  
7 currently available and cuts. Scranton city  
8 council is the financially conservative  
9 responsible branch of city government.

10 I have done what I know to be the  
11 right thing for our city and it's good  
12 people whom I care for, respect, and serve,  
13 and on behalf of council I would like to  
14 wish everyone a very blessed and Merry  
15 Christmas, Happy Hanukah, Joyful Kwanza and  
16 a healthy and happy new year. That's it.

17 MS. KRAKE: 5-B. NO BUSINESS AT  
18 THIS TIME.

19 SIXTH ORDER. 6-A. READING BY TITLE  
20 - FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 60, 2011 - AN  
21 ORDINANCE- AMENDING FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 52,  
22 2010, AN ORDINANCE ENTITLED "GENERAL CITY  
23 OPERATING BUDGET 2011" BY TRANSFERRING  
24 \$14,300.00 FROM ACCOUNT NO.  
25 01.401.13090.4299 (NON-DEPARTMENTAL

1 OPERATING EXPENSES - CONTINGENCY) \$4,000.00  
2 TO ACCOUNT NO. 01.011.00071.4140 (POLICE 10%  
3 EARLY RETIREMENT) AND \$10,300.00 TO ACCOUNT  
4 NO. 01.011.00078.4140 (FIRE 10% EARLY  
5 RETIREMENT) TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO COVER THE  
6 REMAINING COST FOR POLICE AND FIRE EARLY  
7 RETIREMENT PAYMENTS THROUGH THE PERIOD  
8 ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2011.

9 MS. EVANS: You've heard reading by  
10 title of Item 6-A, what is your pleasure?

11 MR. ROGAN: I move that Item 6-A  
12 pass reading by title.

13 MR. JOYCE: Second.

14 MS. EVANS: On the question? All  
15 those in favor signify by saying aye.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

17 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

18 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

19 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

20 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
21 have it and so moved.

22 MR. JOYCE: I make a motion to  
23 suspend the rules to move 6-A to Seventh  
24 Order for final passage.

25 MR. ROGAN: Second.



1 MS. EVANS: On the question? All  
2 those in favor?

3 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

4 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

6 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

7 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
8 have it and so moved.

9 MS. KRAKE: SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A.FOR  
10 CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR  
11 ADOPTION-FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 59, 2011-  
12 AMENDING FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 74, 1993 (AS  
13 AMENDED), ENTITLED THE ZONING ORDINANCE FOR  
14 THE CITY OF SCRANTON, BY AMENDING SECTION  
15 306 TABLE OF PERMITTED USES BY DISTRICT;  
16 SECTION 307 B.4. TABLE OF LOT AND SETBACK  
17 REQUIREMENTS BY DISTRICT; 601.A.5.  
18 MIXED-USED ADAPTIVE REUSE; TABLE 6.1  
19 OFF-STREET PARKING REQUIREMENTS; SECTION  
20 602.E. LOCATION OF PARKING.

21 MR. ROGAN: I would make a motion to  
22 table Item 7-A.

23 MR. JOYCE: Second.

24 MS. EVANS: On the question?

25 MR. ROGAN: Yes. I did have a

1 conversation with Mrs. Evans yesterday about  
2 this and there was problem with -- well,  
3 number one involved the advertising  
4 requirements, and secondly, there have been  
5 questions raised by members of the  
6 neighborhood and I would like to get all of  
7 that sorted out to make everything runs  
8 smoothly and hopefully this project will go  
9 forward.

10 MR. JOYCE: Yes, and I would also  
11 like to say that I have been contacted by  
12 some neighbors of the lower Greenridge area  
13 and they don have some concerns about the  
14 project, and I think it would be in our best  
15 interest to table this piece of legislation  
16 as well and I will be voting to table it.

17 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans, just a  
18 question, will this have to be reintroduced  
19 in 2012 or will it come back in Seventh  
20 Order.

21 MS. EVANS: I believe it will come  
22 back in Seventh Order. I spoke with  
23 Attorney Jones by phone about all of this  
24 and he has been through these types of  
25 situations before and so it is with his

1           agreements that this is going to be  
2           postponed until January 10 at which time  
3           there will be a public hearing conducted at  
4           6:00 and the item will be returned to the  
5           table. I believe that once an item is  
6           placed on the table that is tabled it can be  
7           remain therein indefinitely until such time  
8           as council would put it back on and take a  
9           final vote.

10           MR. MCGOFF: I just didn't know if  
11           there was an end of the year problem.

12           MS. EVANS: I don't believe so, no.

13           MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

14           MS. EVANS: Anyone else on the  
15           question? All those in favor signify by  
16           saying aye.

17           MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

18           MR. ROGAN: Aye.

19           MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

20           MR. JOYCE: Aye.

21           MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
22           have it and so moved. The ice have and so  
23           moved. Item 7-A is now tabled.

24           MS. KRAKE: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION  
25           BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE FOR

1 ADOPTION-RESOLUTION NO. 55, 2011- ACCEPTING  
2 A ONE HUNDRED (100.00) DOLLAR DONATION FROM  
3 NEI AMBULATORY SURGERY, INC. PRESENTED TO  
4 THE CITY OF SCRANTON FIRE DEPARTMENT.

5 MS. EVANS: What is the  
6 recommendation of the Chair for the  
7 Committee on Finance?

8 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the  
9 Committee on Finance, I recommend final  
10 passage of Item 7-B.

11 MR. ROGAN: Second.

12 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll  
13 call, please?

14 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

16 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

17 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

18 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

20 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

21 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

22 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

23 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare  
24 Item 7-B legally and lawfully adopted.

25 MS. KRAKE: 7-C, FORMERLY 6-A, FOR

1                   CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE -  
2                   FOR ADOPTION - FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 60, 2011  
3                   - AMENDING FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 52, 2010, AN  
4                   ORDINANCE ENTITLED "GENERAL CITY OPERATING  
5                   BUDGET 2011" BY TRANSFERRING \$14,300.00 FROM  
6                   ACCOUNT NO. 01.401.13090.4299  
7                   (NON-DEPARTMENTAL OPERATING EXPENSES -  
8                   CONTINGENCY) \$4,000.00 TO ACCOUNT NO.  
9                   01.011.00071.4140 (POLICE 10% EARLY  
10                  RETIREMENT) AND \$10,300.00 TO ACCOUNT NO.  
11                  01.011.00078.4140 (FIRE 10% EARLY  
12                  RETIREMENT) TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO COVER THE  
13                  REMAINING COST FOR POLICE AND FIRE EARLY  
14                  RETIREMENT PAYMENTS THROUGH THE PERIOD  
15                  ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2011.

16                   MS. EVANS: What is the  
17                   recommendation of the Chair for the  
18                   Committee on Finance?

19                   MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the  
20                   Committee on Finance, I recommend final  
21                   passage of Item 7-C.

22                   MR. ROGAN: Second.

23                   MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll  
24                   call, please?

25                   MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

2 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

3 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

6 MR. JACKOWITZ: Are we going to  
7 speak to it?

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

10 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

11 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare  
12 Item 7-C legally and lawfully adopted. The  
13 vote was already underway, I'm sorry, I  
14 forgot that. I apologize.

15 MR. JACKOWITZ: Can we speak now?

16 MS. SCHUMACHER: It's too late, they  
17 already voted.

18 MS. EVANS: Would you like to speak  
19 now, Mr. Jackowitz?

20 MR. JACKOWITZ: Yeah. Yeah. Bill  
21 Jackowitz. I guess I'm really disappointed  
22 that the citizens were not allowed to speak  
23 on this. I mean, I'm not even a council  
24 member and I knew that, so I know you are  
25 not going to change your vote and I just

1 hope that each one of you when you made your  
2 vote you made your vote in fairness and in  
3 fairness to the taxpayers, not the unions,  
4 not the firefighters, not the police  
5 officers, not the DPW people, but the  
6 taxpayers and ones who pay their salaries  
7 and I really hope each one of you did do  
8 that and made a fair vote for the taxpayers  
9 and the citizens. I still don't see how you  
10 did it without having an audit because we  
11 have no idea what the audit is going to.

12 MR. MCGOFF: That wasn't the budget.

13 MR. JOYCE: No, that wasn't the  
14 budget.

15 MS. EVANS: Mr. Jackowitz, yes, if  
16 you could just confine your thoughts to that  
17 one particular piece of legislation which  
18 was --

19 MR. JACKOWITZ: Oh, I am. I'm  
20 talking about the budget you just voted for  
21 and you didn't --

22 MS. EVANS: But this is not the vote  
23 for the budget. This is the current year  
24 budget, it's transferring money from the  
25 contingency into --

1 MR. JOYCE: Into two separate  
2 accounts for --

3 MS. EVANS: -- into two separate  
4 accounts for --

5 MR. JACKOWITZ: But how do you know  
6 the money is even there to be transferred if  
7 you don't have an audit?

8 MS. EVANS: -- through the period  
9 ending December 31, 2011.

10 MR. JACKOWITZ: But without an audit  
11 how do we even know the money is there to be  
12 transferred?

13 MS. EVANS: Well, the legislation  
14 was sent down by the administration who is  
15 overseeing the funding.

16 MR. JACKOWITZ: I agree, but they  
17 have sent down things in the past that  
18 haven't been kosher, so to speak. And  
19 again, I will state again I don't see how  
20 you could do this without having an audit in  
21 front of you because we don't know if the  
22 money is there. We might get surprises  
23 coming January 2012 that we -- well, since  
24 it's a surprise we don't know it's coming,  
25 do we? But, again, I hope you did it in



1 fairness.

2 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

3 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much for  
4 your input.

5 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else?

6 MR. JOYCE: I would like to make a  
7 motion to take File of Council No. 56, 2011,  
8 as amended, from the table.

9 MR. ROGAN: Second.

10 MS. EVANS: On the question? All  
11 those in favor signify by saying aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

13 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

14 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

15 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

16 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
17 have it and so moved.

18 MS. KRAKE: 7-D, FORMERLY TABLED,  
19 FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON  
20 FINANCE - FOR ADOPTION - FILE OF COUNCIL NO.  
21 56 -2011, AS AMENDED - APPROPRIATING FUNDS  
22 FOR THE EXPENSES OF THE CITY GOVERNMENT FOR  
23 THE PERIOD COMMENCING THE FIRST DAY OF  
24 JANUARY 2012, TO AND INCLUDING DECEMBER 31,  
25 2012, BY ADOPTION OF THE GENERAL CITY

1 OPERATING BUDGET FOR THE YEAR 2012.

2 MS. EVANS: What is the  
3 recommendation of the Chair for the  
4 Committee on Finance?

5 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the  
6 Committee on Finance, I recommend final  
7 passage of Item 7-D, as amended.

8 MR. ROGAN: Second.

9 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll  
10 call, please?

11 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

12 MR. MCGOFF: No.

13 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

14 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

15 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

17 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

18 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

19 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

20 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare  
21 Item 7-D, as amended, legally and lawfully  
22 adopted.

23 In the event of the mayor's veto of  
24 the budget, council will meet once more in  
25 December for the override vote. If there is

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

no further business, I'll entertain a motion  
to adjourn.

MR. JOYCE: Motion to adjourn.

MS. EVANS: This meeting is  
adjourned.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

---

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR  
OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER