

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING

HELD:

Thursday, June 28, 2012

LOCATION:

Council Chambers

Scranton City Hall

340 North Washington Avenue

Scranton, Pennsylvania

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL:

JANET EVANS, PRESIDENT

FRANK JOYCE, VICE-PRESIDENT

ROBERT MCGOFF

PAT ROGAN
(Not present)

JOHN LOSCOMBE

NANCY KRAKE, CITY CLERK

KATHY CARRERA, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK

BOYD HUGHES, SOLICITOR

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and
2 moment of reflection observed.)

3 MS. EVANS: Roll call, please.

4 MS. CARRERA: Mr. McGoff.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Here.

6 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan. Mr.

7 Loscombe.

8 MR. LOSCOMBE: Here.

9 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Joyce.

10 MR. JOYCE: Here.

11 MS. CARRERA: Mrs. Evans.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans, Councilman

13 Rogan asked me if I would read something
14 prior to the meeting.

15 MS. EVANS: Certainly.

16 MR. MCGOFF: In a communique from
17 Councilman Rogan, he asked me if I would
18 read this. It says, "Unfortunately, a
19 longstanding commitment necessitates my
20 absence this evening. However, rest assured
21 I am keeping a close eye on the ongoing
22 proceedings and will stand by my belief that
23 city government must operate as effectively
24 and efficiently as possible, but not to the
25 detriment of the overburdened taxpayers that

1 I represent. I am still of the belief that
2 all five members of council and the mayor
3 need to sit down and discuss a Recovery Plan
4 that will work for the betterment of our
5 great city."

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Dispense
7 with the reading of the minutes, please?

8 MS. KRAKE: 3-A. MINUTES OF THE
9 COMPOSITE PENSION BOARD MEETING HELD MAY 23,
10 2012.

11 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
12 If not, received and filed.

13 MS. KRAKE: 3-B. 2011 COMBINED AUDIT
14 REPORT FOR THE SCRANTON LACKAWANNA HEALTH
15 AND WELFARE AUTHORITY.

16 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
17 If not, received and filed.

18 MS. KRAKE: 3-C. TAX ASSESSOR'S
19 REPORT, HEARING DATE FOR JULY 11, 2012.

20 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
21 If not, received and filed.

22 MS. KRAKE: 3-D. AGENDA FOR THE
23 ZONING HEARING BOARD MEETING TO BE HELD JULY
24 11, 2012.

25 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

1 If not, received and filed. Do we have any
2 clerk's note this evening?

3 MS. KRAKE: No, Mrs. Evans.

4 MS. EVANS: Do any council members
5 have announcements at this time?

6 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes, I have a couple.
7 I just want to remind everyone that the
8 benefit for "Give Jim Lance a Second Chance"
9 will be conducted on July 14 from 5 to 10
10 p.m. at Holy Rosary Center on West Market
11 Street. This is a benefit for Jim Lance who
12 was in a serious motorcycle accident and
13 while he was recuperating his wife has
14 passed away. So if anyone has any questions
15 or would like to make donations they can
16 call Nicole Lance at 575-6752.

17 On June 30 there will be a benefit
18 in honor of the late patrol canine Grizzly
19 at the 20th Ward 2028 Pittston Avenue from 6
20 to 11 p.m. Tickets are \$10 for an adult and
21 \$5 per child. There will be raffle
22 drawings, buffet dinner and a cash bar.

23 And on July 14 the Fraternal Order
24 of eagles, Lodge 314 is having it's fifth
25 annual ribfest serving from 2 to 6 p.m. for

1 \$15. You get a full rack of ribs, corn on
2 the cob, a baked potato, homemade baked
3 beans and dessert and, let's see, the
4 proceeds will be -- there will be a pie
5 throwing contest and canine demos, music and
6 the proceeds will benefit prostate cancer in
7 the area. Thank you.

8 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else?
9 Mrs. Krake?

10 MS. KRAKE: FOURTH ORDER. CITIZENS'
11 PARTICIPATION.

12 MS. EVANS: Before we begin
13 citizens' participation tonight, I wanted to
14 say that I am aware that Mayor Doherty held
15 a meeting yesterday afternoon with heads of
16 the municipal unions to inform them that he
17 is cutting salaries to minimum wages
18 effective with the July 6, 2012, pay and to
19 urge them to lobby council members to
20 approve his revised Recovery Plan.

21 I see union heads in the audience
22 tonight. I also see city employees, who I'm
23 told were asked this afternoon to come by
24 Mr. McGoff. It's truly ashame that the
25 mayor put you in this position, but now I

1 have a question for the mayor, will Mr.
2 Scopelliti and the management of the
3 Scranton Parking Authority earn minimum
4 hourly wages for running the Scranton
5 Parking Authority into the ground. The
6 savings can be used toward the SPA's bond
7 payments.

8 Finally, I'd like to wish everyone a
9 very safe and enjoyable Fourth of July
10 holiday now, in case I forget later, and
11 that's it. Our first speaker is Bob Martin.

12 MR. MARTIN: Good evening, city
13 council. Bob Martin, President of the FOP
14 and with your permission we are going to
15 address council collectively. We will, you
16 know, respect the time limit on our
17 presentation because it's short and sweet.
18 We are here to request that city council
19 along with the mayor sit down and work out a
20 viable Recovery Plan that includes
21 everyone's benefit, citizens, our members.
22 It's important that that get worked out
23 because it's up to this -- the most
24 important thing is the safety of the
25 citizenry and, of course, it affects us as

1 members and the members that we represent,
2 and we are not here to advocate any
3 particular Recovery Plan, we don't advocate
4 the mayor's Recovery Plan, we don't have
5 advocate yours, we are not sure, we have
6 seen what's in the mayor's Recovery Plan, we
7 just ask that you sit down with the mayor
8 and work out something that is viable.

9 You know, we just only caution that
10 seeing the mayor's Recovery Plan, PEL, and
11 DCED's participation in that that, you know,
12 we caution that there are work mandates in
13 there that we would absolutely be against
14 and that we will and, you know, we will
15 fight and go back to Court if necessary.

16 I mean, there is some work mandates
17 in there and I understand they are intended
18 for cost savings, but they are very -- very
19 open, open-ended, and those kind of things,
20 I mean, if it's legal we will take you back
21 to Court, you being the city and the
22 administration, back to Court and I want to
23 avoid that at any possible cost that we have
24 gone through for the past ten years. It's
25 been a toll on the citizens, it's a toll on

1 us, it's a toll on the council, and I'm sure
2 a toll on the mayor and his administration.

3 So we just ask that you please,
4 please, sit down and work out some kind of a
5 viable -- I mean, it's down to economics
6 now, I understand the plight with the banks
7 and, you know, they want to loan us money,
8 but they are not going to loan us money
9 until they know where the payment is going
10 to come from. That's an every day --
11 anybody just walks into a bank to borrow
12 money to buy a car they want to know where
13 the money is going to come back to repay
14 that loan.

15 So, again, we just ask that you sit
16 down and work out a viable Recovery Plan
17 that includes everybody, and in that I want
18 to introduce President Judge of the
19 Firefighters Association. We have done our
20 part, this part really isn't so much about
21 us as it is about council and the mayor
22 working this out, we have done what we can
23 and President judge is going to unveil
24 exactly what we have tried to accomplish to
25 participate in this.

1 MS. EVANS: Are the union heads
2 aware, however, that Councilman Joyce and I
3 met for over five months with Mayor Doherty
4 regarding the revised Recovery Plan? He was
5 well aware of all of our recommendations and
6 provided verbal agreement to each and every
7 one of them. He then turned around and
8 produced a Recovery Plan that was quite the
9 opposite.

10 Now, I would think that particularly
11 the police and the fire would understand
12 what I'm saying here better than anyone else
13 because for ten years you went through very
14 similar circumstances, negotiations,
15 agreements were made, and then they walked
16 away from that. I think actions now speak
17 louder than words, and what the mayor needs
18 to do is quite simple, he is aware of it, he
19 has all of council's recommendations, he
20 needs to incorporate them into the plan
21 because I think otherwise what the unions
22 are saying to us is give the people a 78
23 percent tax increase.

24 MR. VITRIS: I said she was going to
25 say that.

1 MR. MARTIN: No, that's not what we
2 are saying.

3 MR. VITRIS: That's not what we're
4 saying.

5 MR. MARTIN: That's not what we're
6 saying at all. We are not -- again, we
7 don't advocate the mayor's Recovery Plan, we
8 agree with you wholeheartedly, and as you
9 are about to find out and the public is
10 about to find out what we have to done to
11 actually thwart any, you know, the tax
12 increases that he deems necessary. I don't
13 know where these numbers come from, but we
14 do not support that. We are not supporting
15 any monstrous, unbearable tax increases.
16 Not at all. We just want a workable, viable
17 Recovery Plan, and so we don't run over
18 time --

19 MR. JUDGE: Good evening, City
20 Council. John Judge, president of the
21 Scranton Firefighters Union. Let me start
22 by saying, we came here, we are basically --
23 the timing of this was very suspicious. We
24 are notified a day before you guys go to
25 Court, the day before the hearing, I have

1 been told by the mayor several times over
2 the past month to six weeks health care is
3 getting shut off next week, kept kind of not
4 threatening but advising me of very bad
5 conditions that are going to happen so that
6 myself and our membership would come here
7 and push you in the right direction. His
8 right direction, what he considers the right
9 direction.

10 I agree 100 percent with you. To
11 take him at his face absolutely would not
12 advise it. I think that there needs to be
13 cooperation between council and the mayor,
14 but I think it's a lot more give on the
15 mayor's part at this point in time. I was
16 aware of the meetings that -- I go to PEL
17 and PEL meetings every week. I was aware of
18 the meetings that Mr. Joyce and yourself had
19 had with him and for him to incorporate them
20 and they still tout that -- or your
21 recommendations are in there, yeah, only as
22 recommendations and we have seen over the
23 past how he -- what he does with
24 recommendations. He just won't implement
25 them and then the city will have dramatic

1 tax increases which is unbearable.

2 I want to get to this real quick.
3 This is not something that I want to do
4 here, but you know what, it's about time.
5 Over a month ago myself and members of my
6 bargaining unit and members of the police,
7 three state mediators, a couple of council
8 members up here, the mayor, the business
9 administrator and the city solicitor, the
10 human resource director had several meetings
11 over the course of several weeks. A lot of
12 long days spent at the University of
13 Scranton, some days spent here, trying to
14 hash out a workable agreement to mitigate
15 this 30 plus million dollar suit that -- or
16 Court award that the police and fire have.

17 We went in there, the mayor for the
18 first time actually sat down with good
19 intentions we thought and we put together
20 what I have here and I brought it tonight
21 because it's been locked in my safe and,
22 unfortunately, my members are finding out
23 for the first time tonight. I have a signed
24 contract and the FOP president has a signed
25 contract as well. This is the pen I

1 actually used to sign it and I have the
2 mayor's signature on the contract, which
3 some day hopefully I'll frame because I
4 never thought it would come to true.

5 Both of these awards were done in
6 good faith and they mitigate the \$30 million
7 award probably to the tune of less than
8 half, a lot of giveaways in this award.
9 There was one condition that was put in
10 here, it was for DCED to sign off on this
11 because the mayor had touted contracts that
12 we had previously or possible contracts that
13 we had had previously and the mayor had said
14 DCED killed the deal.

15 We said, "Fine, get DCED to sign off
16 on these and we'll bring it back to our body
17 to ratify it."

18 My signature is on it, the mayor's
19 signature is on it, Councilman Loscombe's
20 signature is on it and we understand that it
21 needs to go to my body for ratification and
22 needs to come back to council for
23 ratification as well and approval. DCED is
24 holding this hostage, literally holding this
25 hostage, much like they are holding the city

1 hostage and you hostage to drive the
2 Recovery Plan through. I was told
3 specifically in no uncertain terms by the
4 mayor, quid pro quo, his words exactly, "You
5 help me get a Recovery Plan and you'll have
6 your deal."

7 That's a bunch of crap. He wants us
8 to come here and pressure you guys into
9 passing an exorbitant tax increase and a
10 Recovery Plan that has parts in it that have
11 nothing do with the financial stability of
12 this city and it's ridiculous. He needs to,
13 and Councilman McGoff wants me to demand
14 that you guys meet with him. What I demand
15 is that he come here and sit down and meet
16 with you and the five of you hash this out.
17 It's time. My members cannot endure more
18 pain. They have endured ten years of pain
19 and now you want them to work for minimum
20 wage. They will be there. Those fire
21 houses will be open, those trucks will be
22 manned, my members will be there like they
23 always have in the past.

24 But you know what? You want them
25 thinking about all of the stresses that this

1 financial problem is going to put on their
2 families while they are trying to run into a
3 burning building to put your fire out or to
4 save your kid? No. You want them of good
5 sound mind, just like you want the police
6 officers and just like you need DPW and
7 clerical to concentrate on their job because
8 their numbers have been slashed as well.

9 It needs to happen. I demand that
10 he comes here. It's that simple. It needs
11 to be figured out, I understand that there
12 is some give that council needs to give on a
13 little bit, but the majority of it is his
14 stake. This is a deal that DCED is holding
15 hostage much like they are holding you
16 hostage and it's time for it to end. For
17 somebody that DCED touts that they don't
18 want to get involved in small municipality
19 matters, it's a bunch of bull. I have been
20 told more times than once that this will not
21 be signed or approved until such time that
22 there is a Recovery Plan. They need that
23 before they can address that. I feel like
24 I'm being used as a pawn.

25 When we came out of the meeting with

1 the mayor the other day all four union heads
2 had the same basic premise, we all thought
3 we are being used. We are being used as a
4 pawn again. What better way to force you to
5 go ahead and drive through that crap
6 document Recovery Plan than have four union
7 heads come in here and start to go, "You
8 need to do this, my members can't endure
9 this."

10 You do what you need to do for the
11 welfare of this city because I know you will
12 keep the interest of all of these bargaining
13 unit members and all of these employees at
14 heart as well. That's all I have.

15 MS. EVANS: I just wanted to verify
16 what President Judge has stated because I,
17 myself, participated in two of those
18 negotiation sessions with the municipal
19 unions and the mayor when my mother became
20 gravely ill i was no longer able to
21 participate and I asked that Councilman
22 Loscombe and Councilman Joyce would continue
23 with the meetings and take my place and keep
24 me abreast of what was occurring and today,
25 just again to justify what you said this

1 evening, I received an e-mail from Thomas W.
2 Jennings, the attorney for the police and
3 fire unions, and it was sent to Paul Kelly
4 and myself and I'd like to read it now. "It
5 is now regretfully self-evident that DCED
6 has again blocked the city acting this time
7 through both its mayor and council from
8 entering into an agreement with the unions
9 that would have achieved labor peace for the
10 foreseeable future and saved the citizens
11 somewhere in the area of \$15 million.

12 This is the second time in which the
13 city has been prevented from resolving
14 issues. We know that first ill-advised
15 occasion has now had disastrous consequences
16 for the citizens of the city and I believe
17 that this second occasion will be even
18 worse.

19 In view of the foregoing, we have
20 decided to advise the American Arbitration
21 Association to move forward with issuing the
22 award in the audit case. I would hope that
23 DCED has agreed to hold the citizens
24 harmless against any loss that may occur as
25 a result of it's interference with the

1 agreement of the parties. I do wish to
2 thank the mayor and city council for their
3 un precedented efforts in seeking and
4 achieving what could have been a mutually
5 satisfactory agreement on these complex
6 issues.

7 I am at a complete loss to
8 understand DCED's rationale in executing an
9 effective veto of these efforts and trust
10 that ultimately whoever made that horrendous
11 decision will be held accountable for it."

12 And, ladies and gentlemen, this the
13 same DCED and Pennsylvania Economy League
14 who have been interfering with the banks,
15 they have no concern for the finances of
16 this city but more so they have no concern
17 for each and every one of you and the
18 taxpayers of this city need to band together
19 and run them right out of this town and the
20 mayor and city council need to insist that
21 DCED has nothing to say about this
22 agreement, just like the mayor should have
23 said years back in those negotiations to
24 DCED. You have nothing to do with this.
25 You are not elected officials, you are

1 appointed officials. The elected officials
2 of this city wish to settle and we would not
3 have been facing over a \$30 million Supreme
4 Court award, so the mayor needs to tell
5 DCED, "Hit the road with this," and then the
6 mayor needs to put council's recommendations
7 into his Recovery Plan.

8 And I'm going to give you a second
9 example of another negotiation with this
10 mayor, back in 2010 when he took this
11 council to Court over cuts to city
12 government that we wished to make because
13 this city was teetering on the brink of
14 financial insolvency and, of course, we were
15 ruled against, but the judge asked before
16 anything began, "I want the mayor and the
17 council to sit down and negotiate this."

18 And that's what we did, and we
19 worked very hard with Solicitor Hughes and
20 we came up with an agreement that, ladies
21 and gentlemen, I can even tell you now it
22 wasn't 50/50, it gave the mayor 70 and it
23 gave council 30, and what happened is very
24 simple, when he was given that document at
25 the 11th hour he said, "No, I'm going to

1 Court," and back into the courtroom we went.

2 So it is very, very difficult to be
3 told you need to sit down with someone who
4 says one thing and does another and in the
5 process wastes your time, your life, your
6 work and your efforts. Actions speak louder
7 than words.

8 And, Mayor, you and I need to make
9 this agreement a reality and save the people
10 of this city \$15 million and you need to
11 incorporate into the Recovery Plan those
12 revenue generators that will cut down that
13 78 percent tax increase that you and DCED
14 want and bring it down to a level that is
15 manageable for the taxpayers by bringing in
16 the revenue sources that this council has
17 been urging you about for two years now.

18 And I have had -- I have had
19 meetings in person, I have had countless
20 phone calls where the mayor has told me,
21 "Oh, yes, I'm doing that parking tax."

22 Was it enacted yet? No.

23 "Oh, what do you want, StreetSmart?
24 I'll get right on it."

25 That is since February. There is no

1 parking meter program and I can go down the
2 list of everything that council has put
3 forth as revenue generators. They have
4 thumbed their nose at us, but worse when
5 they are doing that they are thumbing their
6 nose at you because they just want to hand
7 you the bag of bills and say, "You pay that
8 28 percent you little people --" or 28, I'm
9 sorry, I wish it were, "78 percent you
10 little people of Scranton."

11 And it's not going to stop there
12 because the full Supreme Court award isn't
13 included in that plan and the debt of the
14 Parking Authority isn't included in that
15 plan, but they figure they'll just sock you
16 with those tax increases in the future, so
17 that really you are looking at 100 percent
18 plus tax increase and the only people who
19 have been standing between you and all of
20 these sources for making that happen are the
21 three people sitting up here right now. We
22 are work horses. We have been doing our job
23 here and behind the scenes and this is where
24 it stands and this is what the mayor needs
25 to do for everyone who lives in this city as

1 of tonight.

2 MR. JUDGE: So just so everybody is
3 aware of what that letter is, that was one
4 of the cases in this contract that's signed
5 we were willing to dispense with and it was
6 a concession in this contract.

7 MS. EVANS: I understand that you
8 made a number of concessions.

9 MR. JUDGE: Yes, and that was one of
10 them that's now going to be pushed forward,
11 we have now waited a month, we were
12 originally when we left we were -- this was
13 supposed to be signed off by DCED, I believe
14 within seven days, and it's now been over a
15 month and if the banking community wants a
16 Recovery Plan here's \$15 million we'll save
17 you right now if they are looking for some
18 recovery so when Attorney Hughes is speaking
19 with the banks and he gets that chance or
20 opportunity he could tell them the unions
21 are willing to give you \$15 million in
22 savings to the city to protect the fiscal
23 stability of this city. So that's a start.

24 MR. VITRIS: Naturally, the police
25 and fire problems are very complex, they

1 have been for a long time. We have been
2 fortunate over the years to be able to
3 negotiate contracts, maybe not the greatest
4 contracts, but nonetheless they were
5 contracts and job security for our members.
6 And what concerns me the most is on behalf
7 of my members and all of the employees of
8 the city is that we are really not going
9 anywhere right now except to a minimum wage
10 and I had a conversation with Janet, and she
11 will verify it --

12 MS. EVANS: Yes, you did.

13 MR. VITRIS: -- and with the mayor
14 and also Mr. Hughes and Mr. Kelly today at
15 the courthouse where I feel that it's in the
16 utmost importance that somehow we address
17 the problem at hand, and the problem at hand
18 is how do we continue to provide the
19 services because we are going to keep
20 showing up to work, but how do we avert this
21 train that's coming on July 6?

22 MS. EVANS: Well, I think you have
23 the answer now, Mr. Vitris, and you should
24 go back to the mayor and tell him this is
25 what he needs to do.

1 MR. VITRIS: Okay. And, also, has
2 the mayor reached out to council in the last
3 24 hours regarding resolution of this
4 problem, in the last 24 hours?

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: No.

6 MS. EVANS: Not that I'm aware of.

7 MR. JOYCE: Not to me.

8 MS. EVANS: But I haven't been home
9 all day today, I had quite a number of
10 appointment.

11 MR. VITRIS: All right.

12 MS. EVANS: I have only been able to
13 speak with our attorney.

14 MR. VITRIS: So I'm told that he has
15 and I'm not advocating for his Recovery
16 Plan, I have never been in favor, like, any
17 of the union heads here for a Recovery Plan,
18 I would rather call it a financial plan for
19 the future of the City of Scranton, but just
20 like they said we will fight when our
21 contract is up anything that is in this
22 Recovery Plan that's going to hurt us.
23 Plain and simple, just plain simple
24 language, and we provide a service, it's a
25 very important service, services to the

1 people of this city and I just hope that the
2 train that's coming down the track doesn't
3 just roll right all over us next Friday on
4 July 6 because it's not going to be a pretty
5 site. I don't think it's fair to have all
6 of the employees making minimum wage. I
7 mean, collective bargaining as always been
8 very important to me, it always has been
9 and, Janet, you were a union member, Jack,
10 you are a union member, you now how
11 important it is when you negotiate a
12 contract that you see those contracts
13 through until the next one, and it's
14 important to us that if there is a way to
15 stop this, and we do it.

16 And I would just, you know,
17 appreciate if there is any way that we can
18 sit down even if has to be the unions, also,
19 the unions have to be involved, the mayor,
20 the city council, everyone together has to
21 be involved in this even if it means you
22 people in the meetings with the bankers,
23 because for some reason the banker's seem to
24 have this hand in all of this.

25 MS. EVANS: Well, that's because

1 Pennsylvania Economy League and DCED have
2 put their hand into everything and it
3 doesn't belong in there.

4 MR. VITRIS: But I understand what
5 you are saying and what everybody is saying
6 here, but how do we fix it? Is it fixable?
7 Is this fixable, and we all need to know as
8 400 employees, 600 retirees, whatever it is,
9 is this problem fixable or is there no hope
10 before we -- this train comes down and just
11 runs us all over, are we are going to be
12 lied to for the next six weeks and say we
13 are at \$7.25 an hour and eventually end up
14 bankrupt anyway because we need to know are
15 we going to work together to fix this
16 because we want to, and let's just hope it
17 happens for all our sake.

18 MS. EVANS: Well, the ball is, as I
19 said, is in the mayor's court. He can do
20 the right thing or he can continue to push
21 along in the courtroom and --

22 MR. VITRIS: The ball is in all of
23 our courts.

24 MS. EVANS: -- with your wages and,
25 you know, as you said, you don't want to be

1 lied to. Well, you have never been lied to
2 by this council. No one has been. The
3 mayor is the one that likes to tell the
4 tales, and I know because I have listened to
5 enough of them now for five months by phone
6 and in person, so I'm not concerned about
7 sitting down and talking to him unless he
8 wants to come here because if he wants to
9 talk with five council members this is the
10 only venue in which it can happen because of
11 the Sunshine Act, so if that -- if that
12 pleases him, we can do this publically. If
13 not, he needs to put pen to paper, call his
14 friends at DCED and PEL and get this
15 straightened out right away. It's up to
16 him.

17 MR. VITRIS: Okay, and I'll leave
18 it, but, Mr. McGoff, one question if there
19 is -- and all -- any council or Mr. Hughes,
20 \$16 million is needed to fill the budget; is
21 that correct? Yes or no, a simple question?
22 Is it 16 million or is it --

23 MR. MCGOFF: I would say, yes.

24 MR. VITRIS: 16 or is it 9? Which
25 one is it?

1 MR. MCGOFF: There is a \$16.5
2 million in unfunded borrowing.

3 MS. EVANS: No. It's \$9.85 million
4 in unfunded debt borrowing and that was
5 passed by this council, signed off by the
6 mayor, and the tax increase that was ordered
7 by the Court in Lackawanna County that was
8 passed by this council and signed by the
9 mayor yet nobody wants to go out and get
10 that money. They sent money e-mail to a few
11 banks and they said -- -

12 MR. MCGOFF: That's untrue.

13 MS. EVANS: Well, that's what --

14 MR. MCGOFF: It is not true. You
15 know that that's not true.

16 MS. EVANS: I know --

17 MR. MCGOFF: The administration has
18 been working to try and secure that since
19 January.

20 MS. EVANS: The
21 administration also -- well --

22 MR. VITRIS: This the exact reason,
23 exactly what I'm talking about.

24 MR. HUGHES: I can answer the
25 question. There is \$9.85 million that was

1 approved by the Court provided for your tax
2 increase. All of the legislation has been
3 adopted for that. Two weeks ago, it will be
4 two weeks ago tomorrow, I called Dennis
5 Kozalanski, who is the bond counsel for the
6 city and the Scranton Parking Authority,
7 coincidentally. I told him that the \$9.85
8 million has absolutely nothing to do with
9 the Recovery Plan. The bond counsel, the
10 bond people they put that together with the
11 other 6.6 million.

12 I said you should separate that out,
13 that's standalone borrowing that has nothing
14 to do with the Recovery Plan. There is a
15 guaranteed amount of tax increase next year
16 millage to pay that. Separate it out.
17 Float that. Go back to M & T and float
18 that. In two weeks I've never heard from
19 them. They should be able to do that
20 because it has nothing to do with the
21 Recovery Plan. That's a guaranteed amount
22 of segregated taxes. I know when the
23 legislation came down here I was the one
24 that drafted the formulas as to how to do
25 that to separate out, to separate out the

1 taxes that are going to come in next year on
2 real estate so that that would be paid.

3 They took my formula, they brushed
4 it up a little bit, refined it, but that was
5 in the legislation. If that were -- it was
6 my understanding that that was always to pay
7 last year's bills. I haven't investigated
8 it, but I have been told that a lot of those
9 bills have been paid with these year's money
10 instead of waiting for the bond issue, and
11 that's why if that were floated and that
12 \$9.85 million came into the city we have no
13 idea how much of that is already been paid
14 for last year's bills, but whether it's --

15 MR. VITRIS: But whether it's 9.8 --

16 MR. HUGHES: Whether it's 2 million,
17 5 million, I don't know, but that money
18 would then be available to the city because
19 those bills have been paid and that money
20 would be available to pay the outstanding
21 bills, and I don't know why the mayor --
22 this is not council's responsibility.

23 MR. VITRIS: Right.

24 MR. HUGHES: Council's function is
25 legislative. It's up to the mayor as the

1 executive to go out and do that and be
2 talking to the banks. Dennis Kozalanski
3 should have talked to the mayor, he should
4 have gone back to M & T and said, "Here,
5 this is what council came up with and
6 they're right."

7 I know I'm right. It has nothing to
8 do with the Recovery Plan, and there is
9 \$9.85 million that right there could have
10 been underwritten and floated in a bond
11 issue within a short period of time. Now, I
12 don't know how long it would take, but I
13 certainly believe it would be -- it's not a
14 public offering, there is no SCC
15 registration there is no state registration,
16 that could be a private placement, one
17 investor could take it, that money could
18 come into the city.

19 MR. VITRIS: And I certainly respect
20 your answer and it sounds like a reasonable
21 answer, but that's my point. This has been
22 my point, nobody is on the same page, and if
23 we don't get on the same page that's the
24 only reason I'm here tonight, and usually
25 it's us fighting with the mayor, us fighting

1 with the council over contracts. Now we got
2 the legislative body, this is a big twist
3 for us. We got our bosses, because you are
4 our bosses, and the mayor, fighting with
5 each other and we are not going to get paid.
6 So that's the only -- I respect Boyd, I
7 think he is an excellent attorney, I think
8 all of you people are excellent, I respect
9 the mayor, but we all have to get -- we are
10 all in this together, all of the people in
11 this city are in this. We need to get on
12 with this.

13 MS. EVANS: I absolutely agree and I
14 sympathize with all of the workers who do a
15 very good job and show up each and every
16 day, but you've got to remember the bottom
17 line here is that 78 percent plus tax
18 increase.

19 MR. VITRIS: We are not advocating
20 that.

21 MS. EVANS: And council is not
22 rolling over for it, Sam.

23 MR. VITRIS: And just so everybody
24 is on the -- I agree. I'm a homeowner for
25 30 years in the City of Scranton, I lived in

1 the city all of my life in West Scranton,
2 and I agree city council should have their
3 recommendations put directly into the
4 Recovery Plan. I don't even like to say
5 Recovery Plan, I like to call it a financial
6 plan because I'm so sick of saying recovery.
7 A financial plan for the future of the City
8 of Scranton and they should -- you are the
9 legislative body and they should, but there
10 is no way to do this. It's just like the
11 police and fire contracts that went on for
12 ten years, there is no way to settle it
13 unless we sit down and you fix it.

14 So, I mean, all of these meetings
15 for the next two, three, four weeks, six
16 weeks if this is going to continue on well
17 into the summer this isn't going to be good,
18 so I would just hope that, you know, we
19 could resolve this. I'm not going to say no
20 more, I've said enough and I appreciate it.
21 Thank you.

22 MR. HUGHES: Mrs. Evans, if I could?
23 Sam, if you go back there, please, I mean,
24 all of the unions members because I was --
25 before I got on the elevator with all of you

1 today Paul Kelly and I had a conversation
2 and I told him, I said, "It's my opinion
3 that the mayor and council should tell PEL
4 and DCED where to go," because he told me
5 that he had just gotten a letter from
6 Jennings and I said, "I think it's time that
7 the city tells them get lost and we do our
8 own deal."

9 MR. VITRIS: We have been saying
10 that for 20 years.

11 MR. HUGHES: Look at, I'm just
12 saying right now because if it's DCED that
13 goofed up that settlement, you know, they
14 are not doing -- they are not doing the
15 unions, they're not doing the city, they're
16 not the taxpayers or the citizens of this
17 city any good and it's my opinion to tell
18 them to get lost.

19 Now, I'm not involved in that
20 negotiation, it's not up to me, but as a
21 lawyer that's what I said to Paul Kelly, and
22 I think that they should really consider it
23 and that should be put in the Recovery Plan,
24 and I'll tell you what I think about the
25 Recovery Plan from a legal standpoint. I

1 think -- if that Recovery Plan, forget the
2 procedural deficiencies, and I told Judge
3 Mazzonei that today, you were in Court, I
4 said, "If that were adopted any one of these
5 citizens out there could go file a lawsuit
6 and they could void it out because the
7 proper procedures were not followed by DCED,
8 PEL or the mayor."

9 And that's why that's not on
10 council's agenda on my advice and that's
11 going to be in my preliminary objections to
12 the mayor's lawsuit against this council.
13 It's going to be bring it to a dead stop,
14 and the thing is that when it comes to that,
15 that PEL and DCED shouldn't interrupt in
16 this. They are costing us \$15 million, that
17 could all be put together, that's not in the
18 Recovery Plan. The fact of the Parking
19 Authority and their deficit, the \$2 million
20 for the next 23 years, their deficit, that's
21 what's going to cost those city on those
22 bonds, that's not in the Recovery Plan. Any
23 banker would take that Recovery Plan and
24 say, "Hey, this isn't any good because we
25 are looking at liabilities that you have

1 that aren't put in here and how are you
2 going to address them?"

3 And certainly if they were in there
4 you could take a look at all of the debt of
5 the city and then figure something out
6 structurally as to how to refinance it maybe
7 in today's rates. That's up to the mayor.
8 That's not up to council. I mean, I have
9 ideas on it, I told council what they are,
10 but that's up to them to implement.

11 MR. VITRIS: Thank you and just
12 like, you know, Boyd, I understand and hear
13 everything you are saying, but I think to be
14 perfectly honest with you I think you play a
15 major role with Mr. Kelly in resolving this
16 with city council and the mayor. I mean, I
17 think you are intelligent people and we need
18 to look at for everybody here because there
19 is train coming and it's coming Friday, July
20 6. Thank you.

21 MS. HERCHICK: Just to sum up, we
22 realize, all of our brothers and sisters and
23 all of the unions, we do realize you have a
24 daunting task and we would just appreciate
25 anything that can be done to help not only

1 the citizens of the city, because we are
2 citizens of the city, but for the workers of
3 the city that lay their lives on the line,
4 do public service, and the clerical workers,
5 we would appreciate anything and from the
6 bottom of our hearts thank you very much.
7 Thank you for entertaining us and letting us
8 speak. Thank you.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

10 MS. EVANS: Ozzie Quinn.

11 MR. QUINN: Good evening.

12 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

13 MR. QUINN: Ozzie Quinn, Scranton
14 Taxpayers' Association. You know, I guess
15 you would say in a miniscule way about
16 saving face with the mayor, some years ago I
17 met with Mayor Doherty in his office when I
18 was the executive director of Habitat for
19 Humanity of the county and I asked him if he
20 would possibly consider selling a piece a
21 parcel of vacant land in the City of
22 Scranton that was weed overgrown, nontax
23 producing for years and he says,
24 "Definitely," and I told him it would go
25 back on the tax rolls and he says,

1 "Definitely," and he stood up and he says,
2 "I wish all meetings were like this and I
3 hope we can do future business."

4 The next week I went before the SRA,
5 the -- what's the -- the board of directors
6 and I was shot down. Shot down. Now, I'm
7 not a fool or naive, I know who appoints the
8 SRA and the vacant land property committee
9 and Sara Hailstone who was the OECD director
10 who was the coordinate and shot right down,
11 so this just goes to show you that how you
12 can talk to the mayor and as soon as he
13 turns his backs he tells the others go the
14 other way, small or not, that is what
15 happens.

16 Now, I looked at editorial this
17 morning and, you know, the mayor and
18 Scranton Times are not holding itself
19 accountable for what's going on here, and it
20 says here, "Scranton's problem is that it
21 might require a Federal Court intervention
22 to overcome the political dysfunction
23 brought by a city council that will not
24 approve the administration's Recovery Plan
25 while refusing to produce one of it's own."

1 Now, what they are doing, they are
2 going out and they are doing the big public
3 relations, and the mayor, he is sitting down
4 and meeting with the TV and giving these
5 interviews and sort of putting everything on
6 your back, and I had a person come up to
7 here me that I know doesn't read the paper
8 all the time and all they do is listen to
9 the radio and what not and said, "What is
10 council doing?"

11 And you have to explain, and this is
12 their game. They get you people driven down
13 so that, you know, the people think that are
14 you to blame. Well, I want to tell you
15 something, I could write a Recovery Plan
16 today and put a 78 percent tax in there and
17 add 22 more percent -- \$22 more dollars in
18 the garbage tax, it's all academic, you
19 know. You can be like a Scranton Times and
20 run it through a political science professor
21 and say, "Here, don't you think this will
22 solve the problem?"

23 And they'll say, "The man in the
24 books says that will solve the problem," but
25 being the realists, as you people are, you

1 know that the City of Scranton the median
2 income is \$35,000 and you know what a median
3 income is, it means of the 30,000 households
4 15,000 households are making less than
5 \$35,000 --\$35,000 or less, so how could they
6 ever put a 21 percent poverty rate and
7 ever listen to it or, you know, even
8 consider a tax raise. It would kill the
9 city.

10 And I just want you know that I'm
11 behind you people 100 percent, I know that
12 the Scranton Times, and I'm going to tell
13 you I have the documentation that shows that
14 they monetarily contribute to the mayor's
15 election every time he runs for a campaign
16 and it is not only immoral, it's a illegal
17 for them to, you know, under the social of
18 journalism to do something like that and
19 yet, you know, how can they say that they
20 are supporting this here city and community.
21 They have turned their backs on the
22 community. They want to put you people out
23 so they can save their laced curtain
24 Mr. Doherty, okay? And it's ashame and I
25 want to let you know that anything I can do

1 to help you I would appreciate it. You call
2 me. Thank you.

3 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Andy
4 Sbaraglia.

5 MR. SBARAGLIA: Andy Sbaraglia,
6 citizen of Scranton. Fellow Scrantonians.
7 I realize they are going to have trouble
8 living on the minimum wage, but is this
9 going to go on for ten years this minimum
10 wage or not? But your tax increase will.
11 That will saddle us forever.

12 I'm a union person, I always said I
13 was there is no way I could live on -- I
14 live on an union pension and I would hate to
15 see anybody, you know, do without or one way
16 or the other, but now we have to get down to
17 basics. The basic is Scranton is in a cash
18 flow problem. When the mayor was down
19 touting his sales tax increase or down there
20 crying for a commuter tax why didn't he ask
21 the legislature to allow Scranton to collect
22 their own wage tax, which would have helped
23 us tremendously for our cash flow. He
24 didn't do that and he didn't care to do it
25 and it didn't even get down there and talk

1 to the people when they were thinking of
2 doing it. You got to look at things
3 realistically and things further out.

4 Government doesn't stop at your
5 nose, it goes on. What you do up there
6 effects all of us in the city, 76,000 of us,
7 and not just for today or tomorrow it's for
8 years and years and years and our children
9 and grandchildren. Does anybody here ever
10 contact Carbondale up there to see how that
11 plan they got with the fire taken out of
12 their taxes and charge extra for it and if
13 the nonprofits are paying for that? I mean,
14 you got to look at things to get the
15 nonprofits to pay. There is no way out of
16 it. There is no way the common man in this
17 city can come up with all these taxes. We
18 are charged 2.4 for every dollar we earn.
19 We are charged \$52 just to work in the city
20 and you are charging everybody else even
21 outside of the city \$52 bucks, and it hasn't
22 made a dent in our problems and it never
23 will make a dent in our problem because
24 these bills will keep growing and growing
25 and growing.

1 Buildings fall apart, engines fall
2 apart, even people fall apart, that's why
3 they have health insurance. All of these
4 problems are there, but nobody cares.

5 I'll mention Brian Reap again
6 because I was here when they are were
7 passing that deal where if you retired you
8 get lifetime medical, okay? Brian Reap at
9 that time said, "Hold on, why don't we just
10 take them until their 65 and then let them
11 get on medical care and so forth and that
12 would save a lot of money to the city," but
13 he didn't do that. Now, you claim we can't
14 pay the medical bill. Did anybody ever look
15 other than Brian about what was going to
16 happen in the future?

17 Government isn't something present,
18 unfortunately, I wish it was. I wish we
19 would say we could vote somebody out of
20 office in a year, but it doesn't work that
21 way. In this state you are there for four
22 years and there is no way to change what was
23 going to know happen. Too much damage can
24 be done in four years in office.
25 Unfortunately, it's that way.

1 And I wish people get out there and
2 look at what's happening within your
3 community or anywhere and I know some poor
4 people paying a commuter tax to the city and
5 I don't support them anyway -- anyway
6 contributing to the city other than the 52
7 bucks, I mean, they got their own community
8 to take care of. It's ashame that we have
9 to go back and say, "We are going to tax you
10 on top of whatever taxing our poor people of
11 Scranton."

12 But I suggest you contact Carbondale
13 and see how that plan up there is working
14 and that the nonprofits have to pay up
15 there. I mean, that's as simple as only a
16 phone call to the mayor up there to find out
17 what's going on there with the tax because I
18 come up here many times and told you split
19 off the services. You got to force the
20 nonprofits to pay.

21 I don't have anything to get from
22 all of this. Really, I didn't -- I'm old
23 enough now where my future home is up the
24 Cathedral, too, but you guys to do something
25 for the children of Scranton. If you want

1 to get here and you have to raise a family
2 in here I suggest get out there and try to
3 get some way to keep people here so they can
4 live here. It's bad enough we don't have
5 our jobs here. Thank you.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Our next
7 speaker is Bernie Passat.

8 MR. PASSAT: Good evening, everyone.
9 Within this last week I took it upon myself
10 to, I wrote a little note and I went around
11 and I only got to a few streets in West
12 Scranton area, I'm from West Scranton and my
13 note is to Mayor Doherty and it says, "Does
14 Mayor Doherty think that money grows on
15 trees? Tell Mr. Doherty that you cannot
16 afford more taxes. Tell him to find other
17 ways to finances the city's debt that has
18 resulted from business mismanagement,
19 delinquent taxes, inflated pensions with
20 salary, unnecessary appointments and general
21 disrespect for taxpayers. Our taxes are
22 high enough. No more, Mr. Doherty. No
23 more."

24 And then I have a place for people
25 to sign. Well, I'm telling you it was -- it

1 didn't take me any time at all. I went
2 maybe a half hour after summer, a half hour
3 in the afternoon. Coming home from the
4 store I said, "I think I'll stop on this
5 street" and people were like, "Give me that.
6 Give me that."

7 But one thing I did have to amend it
8 because they said, "It's not only Mayor
9 Doherty, it's also city council."

10 This is what -- and I'm prepared to
11 hand over a copy of those names, too, that
12 signed, I only hit a few streets in West
13 Scranton, I'm going to continue. I didn't
14 get to South Side yet, Tripps Park, North
15 Scranton, the Hill Section, East Mountain,
16 I'm going to keep going. People are
17 disgusted. It's the council, the mayor,
18 lawyers, the unions, council, mayor,
19 lawyers, unions, and people they just
20 feel -- they said, "I'll sign it, but they
21 are probably not going to look at it,
22 they'll just toss it. They don't care how
23 many names you get."

24 And I said, "Well, you know what,
25 I'm so aggravated reading the paper I just

1 feel I have to do something."

2 And I started this and I'm going to
3 keep going with, and I just wrote down a few
4 things that I kept hearing the same thing
5 over and over and over, that it's the mayor,
6 as well as the city council, and both sides
7 are to blame, and I understand, you know, I
8 read, I'm up on what's going on and so are a
9 lot of these people, in fact, a couple of
10 people I told them, I said, "Would you run
11 for mayor?" I said, "I'll back you up 100
12 percent."

13 Good ideas, good sincere, not
14 political people, and I think that's what
15 you need in there, so it was the city and
16 the mayor both responsible. Taxpayers feel
17 like they have no say. I think that's why
18 they were happy to sign this because at
19 least they are going their two cents in.
20 The mayor and city council do not care about
21 the taxpayers. There is that big feeling
22 out there and the people are -- many people
23 are destitute.

24 Now, I feel very bad for -- and I'm
25 also upset that all of those union people

1 left. They don't really care what the
2 taxpayers have to say. That's how I feel
3 when I saw them all go out the door. If one
4 or two them stayed, you know, it would have
5 been nice. But people are destitute. So
6 many people I talked to that signed this
7 they don't have a job. They can't make
8 their mortgage payments. They want to leave
9 Scranton, they really do, and you can see it
10 by the "For Sale" signs going up.

11 They are destitute, lost their jobs
12 and they cannot pay a tax increase,
13 especially of 78 percent. I don't care if
14 it is over three years. Increases in
15 garbage fees. Different permits. I hear
16 about people trying to fix their houses and
17 they say the permits have gone up sky high.
18 They also feel that too many people are not
19 paying their taxes. They feel that there
20 might be people out there, maybe you know, I
21 hear rumors, other people, that they got
22 some kind of a connection and they don't
23 have to pay their taxes, they don't have to
24 pay their garbage fees. So, you know, just
25 raise the taxes let those that are paying

1 let them pay, and a lot of these people are
2 people that can afford to pay.

3 The mayor, here's the big thing, the
4 mayor, why isn't he at these city council
5 meetings? I hear that over -- other almost
6 every one of the 237 people said that. Why
7 isn't the mayor at the those meetings to
8 discuss with council?

9 And there is just a general feeling
10 of disgust and distrust with all of the city
11 officials and really politicians in general,
12 and I want to say I feel very bad those
13 people if they are going to have live on
14 their minimum wage with their benefits and
15 job security, but a lot of these people I
16 talked to they would give their right arm to
17 have one of those positions at minimum wage
18 working for the city.

19 And, like I said I just got started,
20 it took me a couple of hours going here and
21 there and, boy, they just grabbed that
22 paper, "I'll sign it. I'll sign that
23 paper," because people are disgusted. Thank
24 you.

25 MS. EVANS: I hope that as you can

1 continue to make your rounds for signatures
2 that you can explain to people who have been
3 mislead by the newspaper or other sources
4 that city council is working for them.

5 MS. PASSET: A lot of them agree,
6 yes.

7 MS. EVANS: And we are the ones
8 standing between you and that 78 percent tax
9 increase.

10 MS. PASSET: Oh, I know that, yeah,
11 and I agree with that and I told them, but a
12 lot of them wouldn't sign it unless I put,
13 you know, that -- put that in there and I
14 said, "Okay," you know, but I agree with
15 that. And I told them, I said, you know,
16 the taxpayers need to crowd this room and
17 they need to get the mayor here. That
18 was -- I would say almost every one of those
19 237 people said, "How come he doesn't go to
20 the meetings? Where is he at?"

21 And a couple of people mentioned
22 Mrs. Novembrino, the city controller
23 because, I mean, they said, "Maybe she
24 should be at that meeting too because she
25 has to approve payments," I guess and there

1 are maybe four people that wouldn't sign it
2 for different reasons, you know, but that
3 was it. And it didn't take me any time at
4 all so I'm going to keep going. I'm not
5 discouraged yet.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Doug Miller.

7 MR. MILLER: Good evening, Council.
8 Doug Miller, Scranton. You know, sitting
9 back here tonight listening to a lot that
10 goes on here earlier, I'd just like to
11 address some of the comments made by the
12 previous speaker and we talked about why the
13 mayor hasn't come here. It's very simple
14 why the mayor doesn't come here, he doesn't
15 care. It's that simple. His arrogance he's
16 spewed over the last ten years speaks
17 volumes and you are not going to see this
18 man here he just doesn't care.

19 You know, if I hear one more time
20 that this council majority refuses to sit
21 down and negotiate with the mayor one more
22 time I think I'm going to become even more
23 sick to my stomach that I already am. I
24 can't tell you how tired I am of hearing
25 that in the newspaper and on TV that the

1 council majority refuses to negotiate with
2 the mayor. This council majority had five
3 months of negotiations with this mayor in a
4 room and with this man promised that he
5 would include your proposal in his revised
6 Recovery Plan and yet again it's time and
7 time where you negotiate with this man and
8 you think you are going somewhere and you
9 walk out of the room and it's not knives in
10 the back and he just continues to drive them
11 down your spine. The man's word is no good.
12 He can't be trusted. He is incompetent and
13 he needs to be held accountable.

14 But I would like to begin tonight by
15 addressing his recent decision to pay all
16 union and nonunion city employees the
17 minimum wage requirement of \$7.25 an hour
18 beginning on July 6, 2012. The mayor's
19 decision, which is clearly illegal, as it
20 violates union contracts, is simply an
21 attempt to lead the council supermajority
22 down his path of destruction. This is all
23 being done because the council majority
24 won't pass his flawed Recovery Plan that
25 places astronomical tax increases on the

1 residents of this city.

2 With all of this in mind, the
3 council majority has yet again put it's foot
4 down and refusing to place these burdens on
5 the taxpayers. This is just another example
6 of the council majority watching out for the
7 little guy that has continued to take blow
8 after blow by the Doherty administration.

9 In an attempt to put a political
10 spin on the financial situation, the mayor,
11 his administration and his lone rubber stamp
12 member of council want to place blame on the
13 council majority for "not having a plan" and
14 to refusing to sit and negotiate.

15 Well, once again I'll state it for
16 the fourth consecutive week now, this
17 council majority does have a plan, however,
18 the mayor has arrogantly ignored it time and
19 time again. Let us remember for the last
20 ten years it's Chris Doherty who has been
21 captain of this ship. In the past, his
22 rubber stamp councils sat back and did
23 nothing. They allowed the reckless
24 borrowing and spending policies to just
25 continue. They allowed him to take care of

1 the good ole' boy club rather than doing
2 what was right for the residents of this
3 city.

4 Now it's time to pay the piper,
5 Chris. Four people were elected to council,
6 better known as the supermajority, and they
7 have called you out and they have put you in
8 your place and your time of irresponsible
9 borrowing and spending is over and you need
10 to get that through your head. You can no
11 longer intimidate or attempt to extort
12 through your threats of scare tactics when
13 you don't get your way.

14 I truly believe that the time has
15 come now for law enforcement officials above
16 the city to file appropriate extortion
17 charges against Christopher A. Doherty for
18 his recent actions that clearly jeopardize
19 the health, safety and welfare of the
20 residents of this city.

21 And finally this evening, I would
22 like to take the time to address a few
23 comments, I normally don't respond to
24 irrelevant people, but I do want to take the
25 time to respond to a few comments made by

1 Chris Kelly of the Scranton Times in his
2 Sunday, June 24, column titled "Words Over
3 Deeds."

4 In this week's column by Mr. Kelly
5 he continues his tradition of making insults
6 and personal attacks towards the council
7 majority. Tonight I would like to say to
8 council, stay the course and don't let Chris
9 Kelly drag you in and drag you by your nose
10 down to his level of, oh, let's have another
11 cold beer and a cigarette as he blindly
12 types behind his smoke-filled room at his
13 computer.

14 In this article he goes onto attack
15 Councilman Frank Joyce by stating,
16 "Mr. Joyce resembles a dog watching
17 television who says very little as he waits
18 for Mrs. Evans to yank on his leash."

19 I think it's important for Chris
20 Kelly to know that Councilman Joyce's
21 comments are self-motivated, but more
22 important, Mr. Kelly, Councilman Joyce knows
23 something that he was taught at a young age
24 that evidently you weren't and that is that
25 you engage the brain before you put your

1 mouth in gear.

2 Councilman Joyce speaks each week
3 were professional and authoritative opinion.
4 He is a man of his convictions as can be
5 said of his three other colleagues on
6 council.

7 He then finds time to go on and
8 immaturely attack Councilman Loscombe, a man
9 who woke up every day putting his life on
10 the line to defend the residents of this
11 city, including Mr. Kelly himself, and today
12 he has been unfairly revoked of his pension
13 while serving on council when in the past
14 members of the council is up there
15 collecting hefty pensions, but yet we don't
16 want to say anything about that, we just
17 want to sweep that under the rug as we
18 continue to play politics.

19 I just have to say tonight to
20 Councilman Loscombe keep fighting and
21 standing up for the people of Scranton, you
22 need to know that the criticism is coming
23 from a complete clown.

24 Mrs. Evans, I have here tonight with
25 me a leash since Chris Kelly seems to be

1 fascinated with dogs and leashes and since
2 Mr. Kelly wants to sit behind his computer
3 and tell us how to run the city since he is
4 just so well educated on finance, well, then
5 perhaps we should invite him in, drag him in
6 on his leash, maybe even consider a muzzle
7 because to be honest with you he has yet to
8 have anything intelligent come out of his
9 mouth at this point and let him tell us how
10 we should run the city and, you know, if he
11 is a good dog we may even consider throwing
12 him a couple of treats.

13 But the bottom line here is really
14 simple, we are in this financial situation
15 due to the actions of our ship captain Chris
16 Doherty, and tonight we need to send a
17 message loud and clear across this city that
18 we will take our city back and Chris Doherty
19 and the Pennsylvania Economy League and DCED
20 will be held accountable once and for all
21 whether they like it or not. Thank you.

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Ron Ellman.

23 MR. ELLMAN: Hello, everyone.

24 Hello, Council. I just don't know where to
25 start listening to everybody.

1 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

2 MR. ELLMAN: They are all just such
3 good speakers and I come up here and I see
4 sideways and upside down and backwards and I
5 just try to kind of say some things like
6 last week that people tell me to relate to
7 you. You know, I often talk about people
8 holding onto their property by their
9 fingertips year after year, this is like the
10 coup de' grace, it's over with for a lot of
11 people. It's just -- it's impossible to pay
12 this new tax base, you know, for -- I don't
13 know percentage wise, for a lot of people
14 that I talk to.

15 Last week the Lackawanna Heritage
16 Valley Authority bought a property on
17 Railroad avenue for \$700,000. \$700,000.
18 That's \$12,000 a year taxes. That's one of
19 you alls salaries that's off the -- how many
20 times have I stood here and related about
21 property left and right being taken off the
22 tax rolls by these universities and all of
23 these phoney nonprofits like this?

24 You know, if they can pay \$700,000
25 they can pay \$12,000 a year taxes. It's

1 every one of you the very best. You guys
2 got to pull a rabbit out of a hat somehow
3 and I don't know how you are going to do it.

4 I talked to some successful business
5 people in the morning when I have coffee and
6 they don't see -- they don't see you coming
7 out of it. Bankruptcy is not going to help.
8 They is just no tax base left because of the
9 nonprofits and the city and you people and
10 the council just refuse to attack them.
11 That's it.

12 MR. JOYCE: Thank you, Mr. Ellman.

13 MR. ELLMAN: Hundreds of nonprofits
14 that aren't doing one thing for this city.
15 Tell me how that sign that's supposed to be
16 a religious ornament welcoming people to the
17 University of Scranton, there was I think it
18 was a lawyer's office in that big building.
19 That sign is costing us a \$100 a week in
20 lost taxes.

21 MR. JOYCE: Thank you, Mr. Ellman.

22 MR. ELLMAN: A big empty lot with a
23 sign on it. This goes on all of over the
24 city with these nonprofits, you are just
25 afraid of them or something. But until you

1 people solve these nonprofits problems,
2 well, I'm going to join them. I'm not
3 paying no more house taxes. I just give up.

4 MR. JOYCE: Thank you, Mr. Ellman.

5 MR. ELLMAN: I'll put it in escrow
6 or something, but I'm not paying no more
7 house taxes to have absolutely fools like
8 running the SPA take my land.

9 MR. JOYCE: You are out of time.
10 Just out of respect --

11 MR. ELLMAN: I work too hard for my
12 money to have it squandered away like this.
13 Three or four million dollars down there.
14 That doesn't make sense to anybody. Thank
15 you and good luck to everybody and God bless
16 you all. I'm through. I'm through with the
17 council, I'm through with the mayor, I'll
18 just go my way.

19 MR. JOYCE: Thank you, Mr. Ellman.
20 Our next speaker is Bob Jones.

21 MR. JONES: Boy, he is a hard act to
22 follow, I'll tell you. Hi. Bob Jones,
23 member of the Taxpayers', resident of
24 Scranton. Hello, Mayor Chris. Lowering
25 city employees' salaries to minimum wage

1 does that not require that they are eligible
2 for unemployment benefits, the reason that
3 you fought against the firefighters in
4 giving that money back after of that \$8
5 million? You don't want to pay unemployment
6 to the firefighters, but now they are
7 eligible for unemployment, so think about
8 that, Chrissy. Are you looking at me? So
9 that's your excuse.

10 Seems every time we turn around you
11 are doing something against the people of
12 this city, between raising taxes, laying off
13 firefighters, giving the shaft to city
14 employees, oh, that's nice.

15 I wanted to mention the good Chris
16 gave me this sheet, I was looking at the
17 website today as well and Chris printed it
18 out, half the fire stations are still closed
19 today, four of them, as I can count, and I
20 will show everyone. Our other Chris is out
21 there, the good Chris, and if I could
22 approach council I'll show it to Jack and
23 everybody. This is as of the 29th. I don't
24 what excuse you have for that, too. You
25 haven't hired back any firefighters. You

1 have done nothing.

2 But anyway, I would like to -- if
3 anybody wants the remainder of my time I
4 wrote a lot of things down but it's all
5 curse words towards Mr. Doherty. If anybody
6 wants the remainder of my time with
7 council's permission they can have it. It
8 not, thank you.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thanks, Bob.

10 MR. JOYCE: Our next speaker is Lee
11 Morgan.

12 MR. MORGAN: Good evening, Council.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

14 MR. MORGAN: Gee whiz, you know,
15 where did you start? I guess at the
16 beginning, but we are at the end, so we'll
17 start there. I'm a person who makes my
18 decisions basically based on fact and
19 documents that I can collect or have access
20 to. Right here, so that everybody can
21 understand this, I do have a copy of the
22 Recovery Plan with me here today, so I do
23 have that.

24 The one thing that has been
25 troubling here is that I called council to

1 ask for a copy of their -- I won't call it a
2 plan, because you don't have a plan, and
3 that's not a criticism, but, you know, a
4 copy of anything that you had proposed.

5 I don't go to the Scranton Times, I
6 don't go to the Times for information, but
7 as a concerned citizen who has come to these
8 meetings for over a couple of decades,
9 hopefully a couple of more, I would like
10 council to give me a copy of their
11 proposals, Mr. Joyce, and since you are the
12 president here tonight I'm asking you
13 personally to present me with a copy of your
14 proposals because I'm not going to say that
15 I support the mayor's plan because I haven't
16 read yours, and I don't like to make
17 decisions based on sound bites and partial
18 information, and I would like to ask if you
19 would authorize that this evening.

20 MR. JOYCE: During motions I will go
21 over what we -- or what has been proposed to
22 the mayor for the Recovery Plan.

23 MR. MORGAN: Okay, but could I come
24 to council tomorrow and pick up a copy of
25 that proposal?

1 MR. JOYCE: I could type out a list,
2 yes.

3 MR. MORGAN: That would be fine. I
4 would just like to having that I can read
5 and research and come to my own conclusions
6 and that's what I'm asking for tonight. I
7 would like to know if that would be
8 possible.

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I'll send a list to
10 our secretary and she can print it out.

11 MR. MORGAN: I appreciate that.
12 Now, I want to move to something else here.
13 The Home Rule Charter gives the power of
14 subpoena. It hasn't been used even as of
15 now for anything, whether it has to do with
16 the Parking Authority or anything else for
17 that matter that's financial in scope, but
18 the one that really troubles me the most is
19 I don't understand how being a city
20 councilman, how council can meet with the
21 mayor and, you know, I don't know if you
22 bring your solicitor or if he is informed,
23 but as these negotiations progress I can't
24 understand why they weren't put in writing
25 as the progress was allegedly made and

1 signed.

2 And, you know, I think that if I'm a
3 negotiations with somebody, especially
4 somebody that I don't trust, I want
5 everything in writing and I'm just -- I
6 think there is something else here we are
7 not talking about either and that's the
8 shortfall in the city's pension plans. I
9 mean, I haven't heard them discussed tonight
10 and they are the real gorilla in the closet.
11 I mean, my opinion is, like I said, I don't
12 know everything and I haven't come to any
13 super firm conclusion, but I think we need a
14 200 percent or 300 percent tax increase to
15 be real honest with you, because I don't
16 know where the \$100 million alleged
17 shortfall in the pension plan is going to
18 come from, and to be really honest with you,
19 you know, it's not a secret that we have had
20 trouble with the PEL for an extended period
21 of time, and like I said before, you know,
22 all of the easy solutions have been taken
23 and now we are pressed.

24 It's also my understanding that some
25 firemen are coming back to work soon. I

1 don't know if that's true or not either, but
2 that's what I have been lead to believe
3 here, but I'd really like to say that the
4 process needs to be open and in my opinion
5 the Recovery Plan, as late as it is now, not
6 that I don't have any faith in the
7 administration or council, this thing really
8 needs to go on the ballot, and I agree with
9 what the lady said who collected all of
10 these signatures because, look at, I only
11 campaign like I told you for 16 hours, eight
12 hours Minooka, eight hours in West Side and
13 there is just no faith in council, the mayor
14 or the government, and I'm not surprised by
15 the signatures she has collected because
16 they are just disgusted and there is no more
17 money left here.

18 And I have talked to people, and
19 pathetic as it may sound, and not that I
20 agree, if we lost the fire department and
21 their house burned down they wouldn't care.
22 They just can't pay anymore. They don't
23 want to pay any more taxes, they just have
24 nothing more to give, okay? And I said to
25 this person, "What do you mean?"

1 And he said, "Well, if we laid off
2 every fireman, I'd take my chances."

3 I mean, that's how pressed people
4 are. They have no money, no jobs. You read
5 page after page of houses for sale. But,
6 look at, I won't take anymore of your time,
7 but I would like to stop tomorrow and pick
8 that up, Mr. Joyce, please. Thank you.

9 MR. JOYCE: Thank you. Our next
10 speaker is Les Spindler.

11 MR. SPINDLER: Good evening,
12 Council. Les Spindler, city resident and
13 homeowner and taxpayer. I, too, want to
14 comment about the mayor lowering the
15 salaries of city workers to minimum wage. I
16 mean, I'm not a lawyer, but he can't do
17 that. These people have contracts. He
18 can't break contracts like that. These
19 people have to be paid what's written in the
20 contract and he has a nerve to come on the
21 news last night and say, "Let me sue me,
22 where are they going to get the money from?"

23 That's the arrogance that he has
24 shown for ten and a half years now and
25 that's why we are in the trouble we are in

1 now. He is arrogant. It's his way or the
2 highway and that's why we are in the trouble
3 we are in, and he'll never come to these
4 meetings like people want to because, like I
5 said, he has shown up here three meetings
6 two to ask for money and one to put his
7 puppet Mr. McGoff up there. So he will
8 never show up here for any other reason.

9 Moving on, it was in the Doherty
10 newsletter the other day I guess we are at
11 126 firefighters and because the mayor
12 returned \$3.1 million of the SAFER grant we
13 won't be going any higher than that. If the
14 40 people that are eligible to retire in two
15 years we are going to be down to 86
16 firefighters. You think you had bad fires
17 in this city before, you ain't seen nothing
18 yet. With 86 firefighters this city is
19 going to burn to the ground and you can
20 blame the man downstairs for that.

21 Everybody, please, I'm begging you,
22 you cannot reelect this man next year. Tell
23 your friends, relatives, we have to have a
24 new mayor in this city next year or like a
25 business owner told me downtown last week if

1 naming all of the lies he has done over the
2 years. He said he would be the sixth
3 councilman, that's a lie. He said he
4 wouldn't close firehouses, that's a lie. I
5 could go on and on and on. This man has
6 nothing but lied. He had a handshake
7 agreement with the unions and he backed out
8 on that. There is another -- the man has
9 done nothing about lie and Mr. McGoff
10 supports him. It's pathetic.

11 And the next thing, an article about
12 the Parking Authority in Tuesday's paper.
13 Attorney O'Brien wants to meet with the
14 mayor and council and other officials, I
15 hope council isn't going to take that
16 invitation. I hope they let the Parking
17 Authority drown in their own debt and let
18 them get taken over like Attorney Hughes
19 suggested.

20 One thing, I don't know if this
21 would be legal, but I have an idea to try to
22 get money out of the nonprofits. Just tell
23 them, you know what, if you don't give us
24 anymore money in lieu of taxes we are not
25 going to provide services anymore. Let the

1 University of Scranton burn down. Then
2 maybe they will give us more money in lieu
3 of taxes. I don't know if that's legal, but
4 maybe you could talk to your solicitor and
5 find out because nothing else is working so
6 I wouldn't provide services to these
7 nonprofits.

8 Lastly, a streetlight on my corner
9 has been burned out for about three weeks.
10 It's pitch dark, you can't see anybody
11 standing in front of my house. Two Fridays
12 ago I had to call 911, it woke me up,
13 somebody was breaking into cars on our
14 block. Luckily someone on the block saw
15 this person, they were in my daughter's car.
16 One police officer was in the area and he
17 drove up and arrested the person, but I
18 called the number that's on the pole, they
19 say it's out of service now because I guess
20 MEM doesn't do it anymore.

21 MR. JOYCE: No, it's a different
22 provider. If you could get a copy of the
23 streetlight number and --

24 MR. SPINDLER: You know, I do have
25 that, but I forgot to bring it tonight. I

1 called DPW and they said they would let
2 somebody know, so far -- that was a couple
3 of days ago and it's still dark.

4 MR. JOYCE: Okay.

5 MR. SPINDLER: I don't know who is
6 taking care of that now.

7 MR. JOYCE: If you can get a copy of
8 the streetlight number and to call our
9 office we could handle that for you.

10 MR. SPINDLER: Thank you because it
11 goes to prove it's not safe. Thank God a
12 police officer was in the area. Thank you
13 for your time.

14 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.
15 Our next speaker is Fay Franus.

16 MS. FRANUS: Fay Franus, Scranton.

17 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

18 MS. FRANUS: Good evening. I'd like
19 to thank Mr. Judge from the firemen's union
20 and Mr. Martin from the policemen's unions
21 for expressing their thoughts to council and
22 really saying it like it was. They didn't
23 have to come forward and say all they did.
24 They took a chance and they went overboard,
25 meaning, they took a risk because there is

1 lot of retaliation when you speak against
2 the mayor, and they were wonderful and I
3 want to thank them working for minimum wage
4 for the time period they will be doing.
5 They are really doing us a great service and
6 they should be thanked.

7 Another thing, Mr. McGoff, I'd like
8 to ask you something, would you prefer the
9 mayor's 78 percent tax increase plus the
10 other that's for the 30 million for the
11 firemen --

12 MR. MCGOFF: I'm sorry, I didn't
13 hear the end of that?

14 MS. FRANUS: Would you prefer having
15 the mayor's Recovery Plan with 78 percent
16 plus tax increase over your own council's
17 recommendations to the mayor that were
18 ignored? What would you rather, which one?
19 Are you fighting for council's
20 recommendations?

21 MR. MCGOFF: I would like to see a
22 plan that is viable. I don't want to see a
23 massive tax increase, but I think some of
24 the recommendations that were made by
25 council do not have hard numbers with them

1 and I was going to address that as well. We
2 need to get some hard numbers so that we can
3 mitigate what is an excessive -- maybe an
4 excessive tax increase.

5 MS. FRANUS: I also have a problem
6 with Pat Rogan's statements that was on
7 Channel 16 when he said that the reason
8 there is no Recovery Plan is because the
9 president of city council and the mayor are
10 fighting. That's an out and out lie.
11 Mrs. Evans, the president of council, has
12 been meeting with the mayor for five months.
13 No one has been working any harder than she
14 and the other two councilman have to get a
15 Recovery Plan that would decrease the tax
16 increase that the mayor would like to have
17 on the people and he knows this but yet he
18 said this. And then WNEP never put
19 Mrs. Evans side of story on. It's very
20 biased. And then he goes onto say in Mr.
21 Kelly's article that he is not part of the
22 supermajority. That's true, but when he was
23 running for election he sure ran under the
24 coat tails and made sure he was at every
25 campaign party to get elected. He used them

1 to get elected, once he is in there he
2 doesn't want to be part of it. It's
3 outrageous.

4 He also said he thought city council
5 should meet with the mayor and come up with
6 solutions. I'd like to see Mr. Rogan --
7 maybe you, Mr. McGoff, get together with the
8 mayor and see if he would -- if Mr. Rogan
9 had any suggestions to the mayor. I wonder
10 if Mayor Doherty would implement anything
11 Pat Rogan wanted. I doubt it very much.
12 Just like he ignored everything that
13 Mrs. Evans has suggested and Mr. Joyce.

14 Five months they talked back and
15 forth and Mayor Doherty promised Mrs. Evans
16 StreetSmart, Parking Authority garages sold,
17 da, da, da, da, Mrs. Evans and Frank Joyce
18 can probably tell you who listed them maybe
19 this evening. He lied to them. And you
20 went along with -- you, Mr. McGoff,
21 Mrs. Gatelli and Mrs. Fanucci everything you
22 gave him, every borrowing you voted for,
23 that's why we are in the shape we are in.

24 That's like if I had a Mastercard
25 bill of \$15,000 and I expected my neighbors

1 to pay for it. That's what the mayor has
2 doing. He buried it and we can't do it.
3 I'm a senior citizen and I can't handle this
4 too much more. I'm thankful that I have a
5 sister that helps me and my children that
6 are always there for me because if I didn't
7 have them I would have to move out of town.
8 Most people don't have what I have.

9 Unfortunately, what about the people
10 that don't have that? How are they going to
11 live here? I'm sure they are very upset and
12 very worried and I'm sure they are very
13 thankful Mr. Loscombe, Mr. Joyce and
14 Mrs. Evans for fighting and fighting and
15 fighting.

16 And, Mr. Hughes, very much so
17 Attorney Hughes saying that they will fight
18 this as long as they have to, and even go to
19 the Supreme Court, thank you so much for
20 doing this. I know it's hard because you
21 are under so much pressure. The people in
22 this city are ill-informed, unless they see
23 these council meetings the Scranton Times
24 lie and they don't say the truth, and the
25 television stations they had Mayor Doherty

1 on here today saying -- yesterday, rather,
2 saying that you don't have a plan. That's
3 and out and out lie.

4 So thank you and I hope you stand --
5 I know you will stake to your guns, I know
6 you will. I just hope the people in this
7 city know, and they do, that you are
8 fighting for them more than ever before and
9 I hope you stand by them. And, Mr. Hughes,
10 I appreciate you standing by council, too,
11 and doing all the hard work you are going to
12 be doing because you have a tough road ahead
13 of you and thank you for going today.
14 That's all I can say and thank you very
15 much.

16 MR. HUGHES: That's the most fun
17 I've had for \$7.25.

18 MS. EVANS: Our next speaker is
19 Francis Tyson.

20 MR. TYSON: Francis Tyson, resident
21 of Scranton, member of the American Flag
22 Committee. Good evening, ladies and
23 gentlemen.

24 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

25 MR. TYSON: Madam President, council

1 members, I wish to invite you to join with
2 us along with the members here this evening
3 and your viewing audience to be with us on
4 the Fourth of July up at Nay Aug Park, that
5 will be this coming Wednesday Fourth of
6 July, Independence Day.

7 We plan on having a ceremony that's
8 presented by veterans, military veterans
9 conduct this ceremony every year with the
10 assistance of some boy scouts and what we do
11 is principally try to teach good citizenship
12 to our youngsters, so all of those in
13 attendance if you could bring your
14 youngsters, children or grandchildren, we'd
15 appreciate that and show them how we as
16 adults are celebrating Independence Day and
17 this is what we like to pass on to your
18 young people.

19 As I said, it's on Wednesday, it
20 will 10:30 in the morning sharp and we start
21 the ceremony off with a patriotic music by
22 the Green and Gold band and then proceed
23 into our regular program. And as I
24 indicated, it's done principally by your
25 military veterans.

1 What I would also like to say is we
2 are very fortunate to be here at this
3 particular time of the year because this
4 happens to be the 250th year anniversary of
5 the constitution. We are celebrating that
6 this year and if anybody might be interested
7 and you should browse through it from time
8 to time to see our local representative your
9 senator and your congressman and stop by his
10 office he will be glad to give you a free
11 copy. Any questions?

12 MR. LOSCOMBE: What time did that
13 start, Mr. Tyson?

14 MR. JOYCE: 10:30.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Every year that I have
16 gone the speakers have been very good, is
17 there a principal speaker this year?

18 MR. TYSON: Yes, we have a principal
19 speaker. His name is Mike Semian. He is
20 the commandant down here at the Gino Merli
21 Veterans' Center this year.

22 MS. EVANS: Very good. And I thank
23 you for coming to make this announcement
24 because I had actually received several
25 e-mails in the last week from city residents

1 who went on these Scranton government
2 website looking for information about this
3 particular event because they enjoy it so
4 much and they said they were very, very
5 disappointed at the lack of information
6 provided on the city website and so your
7 coming here tonight I'm sure provided all
8 the information that you were looking for.

9 MR. TYSON: And I'm glad because you
10 have a wide viewing audience. Thank you
11 very for having me.

12 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.

13 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Charlie
14 Newcombe, Sr.

15 MR. NEWCOMBE, SR.: Good evening,
16 Council, just a few -- I haven't been here
17 in awhile, but I'm going to touch on some
18 things I brought up when I was here before.
19 We have all of these money problems and I
20 believe in 2011 we are going to be getting
21 some money in from the Tripps Park
22 development, you know, like the housing we
23 are getting more money but there is nothing
24 left to show for it.

25 I want to touch on a few things, but

1 what I'm going to touch on is probably about
2 a year ago if you I remember I came in here
3 and talked about a family member of mine
4 that was involved with an incident in this
5 city. Well, it's no secret now,
6 Mr. Spindler brought it up last week and it
7 was my son. Now, if you read that lawsuit
8 the Scranton Times had in the paper that
9 there was no settlement made, totally false.
10 There was a settlement made in March 9 of
11 this in the federal courthouse with a city
12 attorney and the things that were supposed
13 to come out of that, I'm not going to
14 disclose the amount of money, but it was a
15 very large sum of money, handshake agreement
16 that they are sorry for what happened and
17 the police officers involved were supposed
18 to go for training because they were 100
19 percent wrong.

20 So they were supposed to get -- the
21 deal was supposed to get done next week,
22 they got a call like everybody else did and
23 said, "We are not going to pay your money
24 because we have no money to do this."

25 They are asking for another 60 days.

1 Well, I'll tell you what, we are checking
2 with our attorneys now, and I told my son I
3 believe this happened to you because of what
4 your last name was, and then when this Chief
5 Duffy said if he had to do it all over he
6 would do it again, so what you are telling
7 me what you would do again, you would pull
8 people over, assume they did something
9 wrong, hold them down in police headquarters
10 for about four hours, make them take their
11 clothes off, strip search them, do
12 everything else, never arrest them, and then
13 say, "Well, sorry for your troubles. "

14 So that's what you would do again?
15 Terrible, terrible police chief. So I think
16 what we are going to have to do is we're
17 going to pull back out of the deal, we'll go
18 with the original plan. These police
19 officers are supposed to be charged with
20 sexual assault and abuse and all of this
21 other kind of stuff, it's in the original
22 report. I think the best thing to do is
23 have them arrested, go to Court and let a
24 jury decide, and I'm sure a jury will decide
25 much more of an award. We did a favor

1 because we know the city was in trouble, but
2 now they don't want to pay that either so I
3 think that's going to end up going to court.

4 But the point of it is it was
5 settled, Scranton Times had it wrong. It
6 was on Channel 28 about two days before it
7 came out in the Scranton Times and they got
8 it right that there was a settlement reached
9 so they always was a settlement reached, the
10 Scranton Times, as usual, was wrong.

11 And I want to talk about the
12 Recovery Plan a little bit. What happened
13 today I believe in the Supreme Court, what
14 was made, was a far reach of government to
15 expand government and I think it's going to
16 make this country in worse shape than it is
17 and I think what's what happening in the
18 city here. We cannot afford a 78 percent
19 tax increase on top of what you have
20 already, you know, the 10 percent that's
21 already in there.

22 And when I read the paper this
23 morning, you know, I have been a laborer for
24 30 years, but I've also got some common
25 sense when it comes to doing contracts, I

1 think it's a disgrace that these men and
2 women have to work for \$7.25 an hour, but I
3 was coming to council here many times when
4 Mrs. Gatelli was up there and I was saying
5 when they gave the police chief raises and
6 the fire chief like \$15,000, \$10,000 and I
7 said years ago, "Every raise you give them
8 you got to give the retired guy 50 percent."

9 So that means for that 15 grand in
10 his pension he gets other \$7,500. That's a
11 five or six-hundred dollars a month extra in
12 your pension, and that goes for the fire
13 chief, whether it's given to -- they get 50
14 percent of that. She said, oh, well I don't
15 think it was true. Fine. She called me on
16 her cell phone and she goes, "Oh, boy, you
17 were right."

18 I said, "Well, I know I was right,
19 you should have listened."

20 So the point of this is how much did
21 that cost you? I cannot believe in this
22 morning's paper that I read that we have 400
23 employees and we are paying for 2,200. I
24 mean, I'm about as pro labor as you can get
25 but I'm also pro taxpayer and common sense

1 as you can get. Whoever negotiated a deal,
2 whether it's Mayor Connors or how far back
3 it was, obviously these kind of things are
4 Democratic proposals, but whoever decided to
5 do this I can't believe that they made a
6 deal to go out that far. I mean, I worked
7 at a company for 30 years and when I retired
8 and for those three years I had no copay on
9 my insurance whatsoever. My company paid a
10 100 percent, but the thing was when I left
11 it left with me. I don't want to -- that's
12 what happened in the auto industry and
13 that's why they went bankrupt and the
14 taxpayers had to pay it out, but I just
15 can't believe that, when I read that number
16 this morning's paper, we will never -- I
17 know it doesn't happen now, since 1993's
18 contracts, but if we don't do something with
19 the language and we don't do something with
20 the Recovery Plan we are never going to
21 sustain these bills.

22 When Mr. Hughes was talking before
23 about \$9 million, and you mentioned,
24 Mrs. Evans, about what we needed for last
25 year's bill, we should never be walking into

1 a bank, any fiscal person should tell you,
2 you should never be walking into the bank
3 and saying, "I need to borrow \$9 million for
4 last year's bills," because if I was the
5 banker I would tell you to the hit road. If
6 I went in the bank tomorrow and I wanted to
7 borrow \$10,000 and the banker said, "What do
8 you need?"

9 And I said, "Oh, I got four months
10 behind on my mortgage payments and my
11 utilities," he is going to tell me, "Are you
12 crazy?"

13 We should never spend more than we
14 bring in. If we continue to do this with
15 the country and this city the last one on
16 the city shut the lights out because there
17 will be nobody left.

18 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And Charlie
19 Newcomb, Jr.

20 MR. NEWCOMB, JR.: Good evening,
21 city council.

22 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

23 MR. NEWCOMB, JR.: Before I get into
24 the nuts and bolts of what I want to speak
25 on, I haven't been here in awhile, as we all

1 know I was adamant on the Washburn Street
2 Cemetery and getting that cleaned up and it
3 seems to be this summer that it is cleaned
4 up and being taken care of pretty good.

5 Also, we all know about the flooding
6 problem in the Keyser Valley, I have been
7 working with Mr. Skeleton from the Sewer
8 Authority and hopefully there will be a
9 remedy to this situation as much as they can
10 soon and I'll keep you updated on that and I
11 want to publically thank him for all of the
12 work and the phone calls that he got back to
13 me on.

14 Now, the following people:
15 Mr. Pocius, Mr. Hazzouri, Mr. Gilhooley, Mr.
16 McTiernan, Mr. McCormick, Ms. Fanucci, Ms.
17 Gatelli, and Mr. McGoff, along with Mr.
18 Doherty, PEL, DCED, and believe it or not,
19 the Waverly Times, these are the people that
20 put us in the situation that we are in
21 today, not the four people sitting before
22 me. These people that I just read are the
23 reason we are in the situation we are in
24 today. These people are the reason.

25 Mr. McGoff, how can you shake your

1 head? I mean, I didn't see --

2 MR. MCGOFF: I didn't shake my head.

3 MR. NEWCOMB, JR.: They are the
4 reason why the people of this city, the
5 hardworking employees of this city, you
6 included, will be getting paid \$7.25 an
7 hour. Not because of Mr. Loscombe, not
8 because of Mr. Joyce, not because of
9 Mrs. Evans and not because of Mr. Rogan,
10 because of the ten people along with PEL,
11 DCED, and the Scranton Times for putting the
12 spin on it are the reason why we are in the
13 situation that we are in today.

14 I pay thousands of dollars to this
15 city on a monthly and a yearly basis for my
16 property taxes and the 3.4 ridiculous wage
17 tax that I pay. I get zero in return for
18 it. Unless I use the fire department or the
19 police department, I get zero. Do I
20 complain? No. I will be the first person
21 to stand here and tell you that I am one of
22 the many people in any 30s that are raising
23 children in this city that actually want to
24 stay here, but if this mayor puts forth a 78
25 percent tax increase I am the first one to

1 go.

2 I have a contract that I had with
3 somebody to put an addition on my house and
4 the city would have thousands of dollars
5 that I would pay in permit fees and I refuse
6 to do it unless this guy downstairs figures
7 how to get the city under control. I stood
8 at this podium, I pulled up the minutes
9 on-line, and I'm going to read you exactly
10 what I said in October before the last
11 mayoral election, "If this city reelects
12 Chris Doherty as its mayor and Mrs. Gatelli
13 and Mrs. Fanucci on council, four years from
14 now this city will be beyond help."

15 I told you, the people that came
16 before this told you, and I sat here and I
17 watched Mrs. Evans the first day she took
18 her seat when she beat thank God
19 Mr. McCormick and sat where Mr. McGoff is
20 and she sat here relentlessly and said, "No,
21 no, no," and she went on deaf ears.

22 That is the reason why we are in the
23 condition that we are in. The water slides,
24 the tree houses, the flower pots, the
25 electric city sign. Remember the "Restoring

1 the Pride" slogan? Whose pride is being
2 restored now? Not mine. Sure as heck not
3 the people who are going to make \$7.25 an
4 hour for God knows how long. They were put
5 all of the over the city. There were signs
6 all over of the city, they were put on every
7 garbage truck, "Restoring the Pride."

8 I don't know whose pride is
9 restored. Please do not budge to this
10 mayor. Somebody said it before and I'll say
11 it again, it's extortion. Do it my way or
12 this is what's going to happen." And
13 previous before you people came and saved us
14 he got his way all the time. All the time.

15 I support the unions, I have always
16 did it, I've always gone forward, went to
17 bat for them, got intimidated because I went
18 to bat for them by this administration, but
19 I'll do it again. What right is right and
20 what's wrong is wrong. I commend them for
21 making \$7.25 an hour, and I don't care how
22 long they have to make \$7.25 an hour until
23 this city gets fixed, and I ask you from
24 somebody like me who is stupid enough to
25 stay in this city because they want to make

1 it a better place, please do not give into
2 this man.

3 On a final note, my HR director when
4 I started my job called me on the phone and
5 said, "I did everybody else's income tax and
6 they are between 1 on 1.5 percent, are you
7 sure that the City of Scranton has their
8 information correct and that you pay 2.4
9 percent wage tax of the City of Scranton?"

10 He told me that I was crazy, but I
11 will not stay in this city if I am hit with
12 a 78 percent tax increase. My children are
13 already paying for next 25 or 30 years
14 because of the people's names that I just
15 read before you. Mrs. Gatelli sat on
16 council when I was here and showed a picture
17 of her grandson and said that she doesn't
18 want him to have to pay, well, because of
19 her along with Mr. McGoff and everybody else
20 they are. Please do not cave into this man
21 and I thank you and next time people say
22 council they are the names that they need to
23 read, not this council.

24 MS. EVANS: Luanne Hennahan. Is
25 there anyone else who cares to address

1 council?

2 MR. JACKOWITZ: Bill Jackowitz,
3 South Scranton resident and member of the
4 Taxpayers' Association, founder of the
5 Legion of Doom.

6 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

7 MR. JACKOWITZ: I told you so. I
8 told you so years ago that this was going to
9 happen, so did a lot of other people. It
10 fell on deaf ears. Mr. Loscombe, Mr. Joyce,
11 Mr. Rogan and were not here. Mrs. Evans
12 was here and Mr. McGoff was here along with
13 Mrs. Gatelli, Mrs. Fanucci and the other
14 list of the names that Mr. Charles Newcomb,
15 Jr., just mentioned and I brought that up
16 months ago also, so those are the people who
17 are responsible for this. Someone has to
18 accept responsibility because it happened.
19 It's as simple as that. It's a fact. It's
20 not -- it's not speculation, it's not --
21 it's a fact. The City of Scranton is doomed
22 and, you know, we are in ruins and crises or
23 whatever you want to call it.

24 And I guess the thing that bothers
25 me more than anything right now is the fact

1 that I still believe that the taxpayers are
2 being left out of the loop. The unions are
3 meeting with the mayor, city council is
4 meeting, everybody is meeting with the
5 mayor, everybody except for the citizens.
6 We can't see the mayor because he is a
7 coward, okay? He is a coward. He won't
8 come here. He won't hold a meeting at the
9 Scranton High School where citizens can come
10 there and pepper him with questions for
11 about four or five hours and bring along his
12 business administrator and a city treasurer
13 who can't even keep track of the garbage
14 fees for God's sake.

15 You want to know why we are ruined
16 and doomed and gloomed and everything else,
17 because we have had incompetent people
18 running this city and the mayor has been in
19 charge, Mayor Christopher A. Doherty,
20 Scranton Prep graduate, Holy Cross graduate,
21 has been in charge for 15 years. Four years
22 as Finance Chair on the city council and 11
23 years as the mayor. He is the one who
24 appointed these people. He is the one who
25 said you got to pay big money and good money

1 to get the best. Look at what we got. Stu
2 Renda, what's her name who had a degree in
3 fashion design from Marywood College who was
4 the HR director, Chief Elliott who was
5 responsible for the city being sued, now we
6 got Chief Duffy who is responsible who
7 possibly might be responsible for the city
8 being sued. These are all of the people
9 that Christopher A. Doherty appointed.

10 I wish the Scranton Times would get
11 it straight for once. They weren't
12 appointed by you four, they weren't even
13 appointed by Mr. McGoff. Mr. Doherty
14 appointed Mr. McGoff and look at what we
15 got. No baseball game tonight? I guess
16 not, you are here.

17 MR. MCGOFF: No there was, I missed
18 it.

19 MR. JACKOWITZ: I didn't ask for
20 your input, please. Don't interrupt me.

21 MR. MCGOFF: You asked me if there
22 was a game.

23 MR. JACKOWITZ: No, I didn't -- I
24 was being facetious. I don't know if you
25 understand what that word is.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Excuse me, I went to
2 high school with you, Mr. Jackowitz.

3 MR. JACKOWITZ: But anyway, it was
4 these people who caused these problems and
5 that's just the way it is, and now the
6 taxpayers got to take it in the shorts again
7 and again and again and again, you know? We
8 have firehouses closed. Why do we
9 firehouses closed? Why do we have fire
10 stations and rescue units and everything
11 else closed and not available? Why?

12 I have been told that the swimming
13 fee has going up to \$5, is that true,
14 Mr. McGoff?

15 MR. MCGOFF: I'm sorry?

16 MR. JACKOWITZ: I was told that the
17 swimming fee went up to \$5, is that
18 accurate?

19 MR. MCGOFF: I have no idea.

20 MR. JACKOWITZ: Well, that's what I
21 was told. It was two dollars and now it
22 went to three, then it went to four and I
23 was just told recently that it was up to \$5
24 this year. I don't know if it's true or not
25 because quite honestly I'm going to adopt

1 Mayor Doherty's philosophy, I don't care.
2 Don't care anymore. You know, I'm tired of
3 people laughing at me because I live in
4 Scranton. You know, we're the laughing
5 stock of the entire state. I get calls and
6 e-mails from everybody laughing at us, like,
7 what the hell are you people in Scranton
8 doing? Where did you get this mayor from?
9 What hole did he crawl out of it -- from
10 under?

11 I mean, I get e-mails and phone
12 calls from people out of state who I know
13 from my connections and they say, "I was
14 on-line, I'm reading your newspaper, that
15 can't be true."

16 I say, "Oh, yes, it is true. I'm
17 sorry to say, but it is true."

18 You know, I'm tired of it. And as
19 far as tax increases go, you know, if you
20 raise taxes, hey, the city is a ghost town
21 already. There is too many people in the
22 city that don't pay taxes, too many people,
23 and there are going to be more. So, I mean,
24 we are talking about millions of dollars, we
25 are not talking about hundreds of thousands

1 of dollars, we are talking about hundreds of
2 millions of dollars, and it was all caused
3 by the list that Mr. Newcomb read off. I
4 read that list off a couple of months ago.
5 It was a big joke back when Fanucci, Gatelli
6 and McGoff were here. They used to sit up
7 there and eat candy and chew gum. I don't
8 know if people remember those days, but I
9 do, I remember them very well. It was
10 everything was funny. We used to get
11 lectured from Fanucci and Gatelli every week
12 about how right they were and how wrong we
13 were. Where are they? Have they attended a
14 council meeting since they got voted out of
15 office? Come to a meeting, Gatelli and
16 Fanucci wherever you are, and bring the
17 mayor with you.

18 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Is there
19 anyone else?

20 MS. SCHUMACHER: Good evening. I
21 came tonight with the intent to share only
22 one thing, but I guess I can't stay away
23 from financials. So, Mrs. Evans, tonight
24 you said the agreement that you all
25 negotiated in private saves \$20 million, so

1 how much is left?

2 MS. EVANS: Which agreement now?

3 MS. SCHUMACHER: The one that was
4 revealed tonight by the unions.

5 MS. EVANS: According to the e-mail
6 that I read from Attorney Jennings it saves
7 approximately 15 million.

8 MS. SCHUMACHER: And how much is
9 left?

10 MS. EVANS: At least 15 million.

11 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay. I'm shocked
12 that if you negotiated we don't have a
13 precise figure, but we don't.

14 MS. EVANS: Maybe we could ask
15 Mr. Loscombe for that because, as I said, I
16 was not present at the two final meetings, I
17 was at the present two initial meetings.

18 MS. SCHUMACHER: You did, and then
19 also I would like to ask Mr. Joyce if he
20 would also share the data that is he going
21 to provide to Mr. Morgan, I would also like
22 that.

23 MR. JOYCE: Yes, the recommendations
24 for the Recovery Plan I will make them
25 available to the public. I will send them

1 to our secretary and she can make copies for
2 everyone who would like them.

3 MS. SCHUMACHER: Thank you. Now,
4 I'll get back. I originally intended to
5 talk about the cities revenue shortfall
6 tonight, but I couldn't quite get my eyes
7 and my arms around it, so I did what I
8 always did, before I went to bed last night
9 I prayed about some inspiration so that I
10 would know how to do it. I do that a lot,
11 and when I got up this morning I didn't have
12 a solution but I did what I always do and
13 that is to turn on my computer and read a
14 daily devotional by Dr. Charles Stanley in
15 Atlanta, and I thought it sort of was the
16 answer and so I decided that what I was
17 called to do was to share it with you all
18 tonight, so I will, even though it's
19 copyrighted I consider this a personal use.

20 "Everyone faces challenges in life.
21 Whether our struggles are financial,
22 vocational, relational or physical we can be
23 certain that nobody is exempt. Fortunately,
24 we serve a God who is both interested in our
25 problems and able to take care of them.

1 When trouble looms, prayer is always
2 a good first step to take, but having a
3 foundation upon which to build prayers also
4 makes a difference. Jehoshaphate, King of
5 Judea, faced an enormous challenge. Three
6 different tribes, the Moabites, the Amonites
7 and the Meunites, simultaneously waged war
8 against him. Most leaders would have
9 crumbled under such pressure, or at the very
10 least taken drastic measures, but
11 Jehoshaphat was a wise king. Through
12 afraid, he did not strike out against his
13 enemies. Instead, knowing God was
14 interested in his dilemma he turned his
15 attention to seek the lord and proclaim a
16 fast throughout the land.

17 Jehoshaphat also knew that God, who
18 was greater than any earthly problem, had
19 done miraculous things for Abraham, Issac,
20 Jacob, Moses, David and Daniel. That same
21 God would help, too, in his hour of need.
22 We should never underestimate the Lord's
23 interest in our affairs. He helped our
24 ancestors in the Bible and he can and will
25 help his children today.

1 It's easy to think our problems are
2 unimportant in the eyes of God but he
3 doesn't feel that way at all. Whatever
4 concerns us concerns him. If we like
5 Jehosaphat turn right to God and proclaim
6 his power. He will intervene. And no
7 matter how great our challenges are, God is
8 greater. He has promised if my people who
9 are called by my name will humble themselves
10 and prayer and seek my face and turn from
11 their wicked ways then I will hear them from
12 heaven and I will forgive them and their
13 sins and heal their land."

14 And so I ask for you to select a day
15 and ask the citizens of this city to have a
16 day of prayer and fasting for our city and
17 the resolution of the many problems, and I
18 trust he will answer. Thank you.

19 MS. ROSKY: Good evening, Council.
20 Marry Ann Rosky, homeowner for 38 years in
21 this -- I was going to say something, in
22 this city. I'm frustrated, I have things
23 jotted down, I may go in different
24 directions, so please bear with me, and I
25 commend our council, four members of

1 council.

2 Now, Mr. McGoff I don't want to go
3 back to you because you have been the with
4 the Gatelli and the Fanucci and it was
5 always three to two. The mayor's a 1,000
6 percent wrong and it's three to two, okay?
7 Prior to you, you got Pocius, McTiernan and
8 the other ones, three to two. So when did
9 this start with the mayor and the Muppets?
10 How many years ago? Why are we in this
11 position now? 78 percent hike in taxes?
12 That's unreal.

13 I hope and I do, I trust four
14 council members, I think Mr. McGoff is not
15 going to vote for this, but you four council
16 members I know you will do and you have done
17 a lot for us taxpayers. And you know what I
18 think, I know how maybe the mayor and the
19 city can make money? This is like a reality
20 show starring Chris Doherty and you got the
21 Times, you got Chris Kelly, how dare he.
22 How dare he make fun of Councilman Loscombe.
23 Who raised him to make fun of somebody who
24 can't walk right or who says something wrong
25 or who criticizes the way they talk, they

1 speak? How dare he. As far I'm concerned,
2 in my opinion he is a scumbag Chris Kelly.
3 Scumbag. And he should be making \$7.25 an
4 hour.

5 And now another thing, you know, I
6 have to get the number for CNN because this
7 is like national news, police and firemen
8 making \$7.25 an hour, I mean, there is a lot
9 of people making minimum wage and they are
10 happy for it, but our police and our firemen
11 going down that low and putting their lives
12 on the line?

13 So, I mean, like, this has to be
14 like a city in depression. It has to be.
15 The only city that I -- I never heard of
16 anything like that. Your police and firemen
17 are getting \$7.25 an hour and they are
18 blaming council. Everybody is blaming
19 council. This is what I don't understand.
20 It's the mayor and he is spoiled rotten. He
21 is spoiled -- he is a spoiled brat. You
22 know, people raise their kids three, four
23 years old, five years old that teach them
24 not to spoil them, this man has been spoiled
25 rotten for years and you people are going to

1 correct it, and I know you will. I trust
2 you. Councilman Loscombe, Joyce, Janet
3 Evans and Mr. Rogan.

4 Mr. McGoff, whatever way you decide
5 is whatever way you are going to decide.
6 You know, in your opinion and my opinion,
7 you know, you are going to do whatever you
8 feel that you have to do. And I want to
9 know is there going to fireworks in the city
10 on the Forth of July. I want to know where
11 the money is coming from if they are going
12 to have fireworks? Does anybody know?
13 There better not be. Oh, there better not
14 be because I want to know where that money
15 is coming from.

16 And there is so many things, there
17 is just so many things, and the mayor -- now
18 I heard on the news tonight that the
19 paychecks in August comes whatever,
20 whatever, whatever, they will go back to the
21 regular paychecks the city work employees
22 retroactive, you know who is going to fight
23 for that? The mayor won't give it to them.
24 Mr. Martin will be here fighting for it,
25 somebody else will be here fighting for it.

1 He won't give it to them. He is going to
2 give them -- he will give them a hard time,
3 going to give you a hard time.

4 Now, another thing I need to address
5 is -- okay, yeah, the 3.4 wage tax, will
6 that ever, ever, ever change. Is that in
7 a law that's going to be here forever, the
8 people that work in this city?

9 MS. EVANS: Well, 2.4 percent goes
10 to the city and the remainder goes to the
11 Scranton school district, which is beyond
12 our control.

13 MS. ROSKY: Right.

14 MS. EVANS: But with the historic
15 debt amassed by the Doherty administration
16 and the city authorities I don't see that
17 there is going to be any movement in the
18 earned income tax for many, many years to
19 come because the weight of the debt that's
20 been amassed is just too extensive.

21 MS. ROSKY: Thank you. Attorney
22 Hughes, I want to applaud you as well
23 because I think you should be getting all of
24 the city solicitor's money. All of it.
25 That he should go, the mayor has got to go,

1 PEL has got to go, DCED has got to go, and I
2 can see the Parking Authority as well, but
3 we know where we are at with them, but I
4 think that's it for now and we can't
5 afford -- I can't afford, I don't where,
6 like, everybody is. There is people that do
7 live in the city and own homes, I don't know
8 where they are at, like, somebody has got to
9 appear when your taxes are going to be
10 hiked. They have to be. I don't know. I
11 don't know. If they go up I'm out of here.

12 Thank you, Council. I trust you and
13 God bless you in your decision. We need
14 you. We need you.

15 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who
16 cares to address council?

17 MR. HETMAN: Good evening, Council.
18 Gerard Hetman from the Lackawanna County
19 Department of Community Relations. First, I
20 have to apologize for being a little bit
21 late, I had to attend by Leadership
22 Lackawanna class graduation this evening.

23 MS. EVANS: Oh, congratulations.

24 MR. HETMAN: So, Mrs. Evans, I'm now
25 have the Honor alongside of you as being

1 Leadership Lackawanna alums, so good to be
2 here to get in time to speak so thank you
3 for accommodating me.

4 One announcement -- a couple of
5 announcements that we do have. First, at a
6 recent meeting I spoke about the drive-in
7 downtown outdoor movies series that's taking
8 place on courthouse square during the months
9 of June and July. Since my last
10 announcement regarding the movie series,
11 there has been decided that the fifth movie,
12 which was yet to be announced at the time of
13 my last announcement, will be decided by a
14 poll that's currently running on the
15 Lackawanna County website at
16 www.LackawannaCounty.org. I believe there
17 is five or six movies. They are all 1980s
18 genre movies and people can go on a vote as
19 many times as they wish, I believe, via
20 www.LackawannaCounty.org, and the fifth
21 movie will be chosen by public vote. The
22 link is also available on our Facebook and
23 Twitter pages and the public can vote for
24 whichever 1980's movie they wish to see on
25 courthouse square so the voting is open and

1 vote away.

2 Also, I believe with council the
3 updated schedule for the 2010 summer events
4 on courthouse square, which includes the
5 Friday afternoon concerts and also the
6 Saturday evening concerts which are said to
7 begin July 7 with Daddy'o and the Sax
8 Maniacs and, of course, the June list of
9 noon concerts continue from this Friday John
10 Quinn through August 4, so every Friday
11 there will be entertainment there.

12 I know several regular visitors and
13 speakers have either asked me for a copy of
14 themselves and I have also seen the ones
15 that you have put up outside, so we
16 appreciate your cooperation with getting the
17 word out on those events.

18 And lastly, we would just like to
19 remind everyone of the Scrantastic
20 Spectacular celebration which will be taking
21 place on Tuesday evening, July 3, right
22 there again on courthouse square. The
23 entertainment starts at 4 p.m. and includes
24 the Northeast PA Philharmonic's annual July
25 4 show and then the fireworks start at dusk.

1 It's going to be a great time, lots of fun
2 out there for everyone, and we would like
3 everyone to come down and have a great time.
4 I was there last year purely as a spectator,
5 I have been at major baseball games and
6 major sporting events and walking downtown
7 was very much like walking out after a big
8 sporting event so it was great to see. So
9 that's all we have for this evening and
10 thank you for accommodating me. Thank you.

11 MR. SLEDZENSKI: Jack, you handsome
12 devil you.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Chrissy.

14 Ms. Evans: Hi, Chrissy.

15 MR. SLEDZENSKI: Jack, those games
16 this year it's going to be August 4 this
17 year. August 5 this year. Support the
18 team. Thank you.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: All right, Buddy.

20 MR. ANCHERANI: Good evening.

21 Nelson Ancherani, resident and taxpayer and
22 recording secretary of the FOP and
23 exercising my First Amendment Rights with my
24 opinion, and please excuse me, I wrote this
25 here, so does this sound familiar?

1 "Doomsday scenario. Recently
2 Gerald Cross, PEL director, warned the
3 residents of this city about a Doomsday
4 scenario if city council doesn't approve the
5 \$44 million borrowing plan."

6 Stacy Brown, the staff writer for
7 the tabloid wrote, "Scranton is facing a
8 grim financial future."

9 That was 2006. Here we are in 2012.
10 Dire financial straights. What changed?
11 Are we in a time lapse? We, police and
12 fire, along with the mayor and city
13 representatives were involved in weeks of
14 negotiations at the University with three
15 state mediator as witnesses. We had
16 something to bring it back to our bodies and
17 DCED all they had to do was sign off on
18 that. They didn't in the time limit agreed
19 upon by the city unions. DCED has not
20 signed off on it yet. They basically threw
21 the mayor, the city and the taxpayers under
22 the bus. DCED and PEL basically left the
23 city and taxpayers high and dry. The mayor
24 trusted DCED and they gave them the shaft.
25 They basically sanctioned the city and there

1 will be no money coming in to help us out.

2 I will say the mayor should have
3 taken his own advice when he trusted the
4 DCED and PEL. He should have listened to
5 himself, don't take the bait. PEL has been
6 involved with the city for 20 years in Act
7 47.

8 The city, in my opinion, basically
9 fired me, I had 36 years of service, so they
10 fired me basically because of my age, but I
11 believe it's retaliation. DCED and PEL,
12 it's time for them to be fired. We are \$300
13 million in long-term debt and another 100
14 million if we add in the Scranton Parking
15 Authority. 400 million long-term debt.
16 That's on their watch.

17 And, as I said, we are basically
18 sanctioned by the state. No bank money, no
19 state money. We have to do it on our own.
20 So sell the Scranton Sewer Authority. Sell
21 the Scranton Parking Authority, sell the
22 garages, lease the garages. Sell Park
23 Gardens. Incorporate all of council's ideas
24 to raise money and use the 35 ideas that the
25 fire department gave the city years ago as

1 revenue producers. Example, start our
2 ambulance service.

3 So, in conclusion, fire DCED and
4 PEL. They left us to fare on our own and
5 for ourselves. We are on our own. We will
6 have to do it on our own.

7 And one question, will there be fire
8 works on the Fourth of July? Anybody know?
9 Thank you.

10 MS. EVANS: Anyone else? Mrs.
11 Krake? 5. MOTIONS.

12 MS. EVANS: Councilman McGoff, do
13 you have any comments or motions tonight?

14 MR. MCGOFF: Please. A couple of
15 responses. First of all, it was a tough
16 choice between Princess Bride and ET, but
17 please put my vote in for Princess Bride and
18 Dread Pirate Robert for the fifth movie.
19 There were two of the choices.

20 As far as the word facetious, since
21 I'm being questioned as to my English
22 knowledge, perhaps since Mr. Jackowitz and I
23 went to high school together maybe we could
24 go back and take a look at our report cards
25 and compare and decide who is more likely to

1 know the meaning of the word facetious, but
2 serious business.

3 MR. JACKOWITZ: You went to Hofstra,
4 didn't you?

5 MR. MCGOFF: Yes, I did, on an
6 academic scholarship if you really want to
7 know.

8 MR. JACKOWITZ: Yeah, okay.

9 MS. EVANS: Please continue,
10 Mr. McGoff.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Yes, to more serious
12 business. We are looking at a revenue
13 crisis. We have -- the city has no money.
14 It's living day by day and while the recent
15 announcement and the reduction of the
16 salaries for minimum wage I don't know if
17 it's a necessary thing. I don't know -- it
18 certainly is another step toward a
19 catastrophic event, but the city needs to
20 pay its bills and one of the things that I
21 think we need to do is to continue to pay
22 Blue Cross and Blue Shield for health
23 insurance.

24 I think the more catastrophic event
25 would be if health insurance were to lapse.

1 That would effect people I think to a
2 greater extent than temporary loss of some
3 salary. Lapse off the health insurance
4 would do no one in the city any good,
5 including the city itself which would have
6 to find a new carrier, probably cost a
7 premium that we couldn't afford, but the
8 simple fact is that we need to pay some of
9 these bills and there is no money or very
10 little money.

11 There is a hole in our budget that
12 needs to be filled. We budgeted, and we can
13 argue the amount whether it's 9 million, 16
14 million, whatever the amount is, that needs
15 to be filled with the cooperation of the
16 lending community. It's the only way it's
17 going to be filled and over the past couple
18 of months I think our actions or inactions
19 have made some of these institutions
20 skeptical about whether we have the ability
21 or the will to repay the debts that we may
22 have.

23 I know Attorney Hughes mentioned
24 before that some of this should be separated
25 out. I know that business administrator

1 McGowan contacted banks seeking to do just
2 that and there was no one that was
3 interested at that time, even though we have
4 a guaranteed tax millage increase. There
5 was simply no one that wanted to take up
6 that challenge.

7 The banks are looking for a plan, an
8 economic plan. I don't -- I won't call it a
9 Recovery Plan, they want a viable economic
10 plan for the future. The banks are telling
11 us very simply they want some assurance that
12 they will be secure in loaning us money
13 going forward, and if that requires a
14 Recovery Plan then I think we need to do
15 that.

16 Yes, I did talk to one person about
17 coming to the meeting tonight. I felt it
18 was important that people be here. There
19 are two decision makers in this city right
20 now, the mayor and the council president,
21 and this problem is not going to be resolved
22 until the two decision makers get together
23 and make those decisions that are necessary
24 for the well-being of the city.

25 Did I ask that someone demand that

1 the council president or council meet with
2 the mayor? Yes. I also went to the mayor
3 and made that same demand. I think that we
4 should demand of everyone that they meet and
5 resolve this problem. The crisis is not
6 going to be settled until there is an
7 agreement, and we are looking at minimum
8 wage, possible payless paydays going forward
9 until the problem is resolved.

10 I have never voiced support for all
11 of the mayor's Recovery Plan. I asked that
12 it be put on the agenda so that we could
13 discuss the plan. I think it needs
14 discussion. I think it needs to be
15 implemented, something needs to be
16 implemented so that we can go to the banking
17 communities and to the banking community and
18 say, "We have a plan. This is it. Now that
19 we have this plan in place can we secure the
20 revenues that we need to keep the city
21 solvent?"

22 Council has made some proposals to
23 the mayor for the Recovery Plan. For a
24 number of weeks it was asked not to discuss
25 these, that they weren't for public release.

1 Tonight, you know, Mr. Morgan asked, you
2 know, what were they? Can we see them? I
3 think it's time that we do discuss these and
4 that they become, you know, sort of part of
5 the public discussion.

6 Many of the proposals, despite
7 what's been said, many of these proposals
8 are in the mayor's plan. If we want to
9 mitigate the proposed action increases in
10 the mayor's Recovery Plan then what we need
11 to do is to provide some hard numbers for
12 how those -- for how that percent can be
13 decreased, and in the proposals that were
14 made through council those hard numbers
15 aren't there, and that is something that I
16 think that need to discussed between the
17 decision makers in this event.

18 Things that were in the proposal,
19 and I know Mr. Joyce said he was going to
20 mention these, maybe I'm stealing his
21 thunder somehow, but maybe we can discuss
22 them as we go along here. Sale of the water
23 conveying system. It's in the mayor's plan,
24 page 42, but in the proposal there is no
25 projected revenue. We don't know what that

1 could bring to the city. We can't just put
2 into a Recovery Plan some nebulous amount.
3 There has to be something that's, you know,
4 a hard number.

5 Refuse fees, will not increase
6 refuse fee and real estate taxes
7 simultaneously. I think that's something
8 that probably may be sudden included, but if
9 we are not going to put the refuse in for
10 2013 then that amount we need as a council
11 to determine where that difference is going
12 to come from.

13 Commuter tax. It's in the Recovery
14 Plan, page 44 of the mayor's plan. Again,
15 I'm not sure what the amount is that we can
16 generate from the commuter tax, but I
17 certainly believe that we need to come to
18 some hard number, at least a hard projection
19 on what that would be.

20 Sale or lease of the parking meters,
21 delete this section. Okay, if we are going
22 to delete the sale of these parking meters,
23 again, where is the revenue that this would
24 have generated? Where is it going to come
25 from and how much?

1 Proposed real estate taxes. Council
2 says it would only approve the Court-ordered
3 tax increases. Fine, but again, if we are
4 only going to do the 10 percent increase
5 then how do we makeup the difference? Where
6 will that come from?

7 Parking theater enhancement program.
8 I agree that should be in the Recovery Plan.
9 I think it's something we should do.
10 Supposedly, I know that there is a RFP being
11 prepared for doing that soon. But again, we
12 need to -- what are the revenues that can be
13 projected from the implementation of the
14 parking meter program.

15 Sale or lease of the parking
16 garages. It's mentioned in the Recovery
17 Plan, on the mayor's Recovery Plan on page
18 49, but again, it's only a possibility. And
19 also, we don't know what the dollar amounts
20 from that would be. There are no
21 projections in council's proposals.

22 Number eight was dealing with the
23 IAM unions, Local 2462, again, I think this
24 is something that could be negotiated and
25 easily settled. Although, it's not in the

1 Recovery Plan I think that that's something
2 that could be handled easily.

3 Payments in lieu of taxes will be
4 increase by \$300,000 per year. That's nice
5 to say, but as we know any attempts to
6 increase PILOTS has met with a refusal.
7 There is no guarantee and you can't make a
8 guarantee that the institutions involved
9 will increase their donations. Donations or
10 payments, whatever you want to call it.
11 Yes, should they -- should we pursue it?
12 Absolutely. And in the past it has been
13 pursued. It's been pursued by council and
14 they were rebuffed, so into the future can
15 we guarantee that we are going to get
16 \$300,000 from this? I don't think so. It's
17 nice to put in there, but it's not a hard
18 revenue.

19 The others, workforce mandates,
20 fine, you know, the last was the amendments
21 to the Recovery Plan should be approved by
22 city council. Absolutely. No problem.

23 These are things that can be
24 implemented. Other things we have talked
25 about revenue generators that aren't --

1 market based revenue opportunities on page
2 42. Amusement tax, page 44. Payroll tax,
3 page 49. The union award, while it's in
4 there at 14.5 because that was the number
5 that was available from the audit, 14.5 five
6 million and it's there, and then there were
7 some revisions given to PEL or worked with
8 PEL if, in fact, that amount were to be
9 greater than 14.5, so it's there.

10 The sales tax that we have talked
11 about, that's been talked about, again, that
12 needs state approval. We can't guarantee
13 that that will ever occur. Hopefully, I
14 think that that's something that should be
15 looked at, but it can't be included if we
16 don't have an amount, if we don't know that
17 the state is going to implement it or allow
18 us to implement it.

19 As far as the things that were
20 mentioned last week by Mrs. Evans, the
21 governor certification of the last two US
22 censuses, I think they should be put in
23 there, that would be fine.

24 And the other three dealing with
25 Parking Authority, I don't know why they

1 would need to be in there, but I don't see
2 why they would be excluded. They really
3 don't add anything to the revenue, it just
4 maybe explains some of the issues with the
5 Parking Authority, but as far as the
6 Recovery Plan I don't necessarily see that
7 they need to be in there, although, it would
8 be -- I don't see why they couldn't be
9 included.

10 We have gone back and forth or it's
11 been talked about that the mayor's Recovery
12 Plan is not acceptable. Fine. We can't go
13 through the process of the mayor sending
14 another Recovery Plan and then having
15 council say, "No, we don't like that one.
16 Send it back to the mayor," then another one
17 and another one.

18 What we need to do is council,
19 council president, council financial
20 director is sit down and go through the plan
21 and agree, come to an agreement and then
22 present it to PEL, DCED, whoever it has to
23 be presented to, but there should be
24 agreement before it gets to us. We should
25 agree on what's going to be in there and we

1 need to do it quickly. This isn't something
2 that we can push week after week after week.

3 Yes, there were people here talking
4 about, you know, the problems that minimum
5 wage salaries were going to present, we
6 can't allow that to continue. We can't
7 allow it to continue to August 3 when we go
8 before a judge. I think that was -- I see
9 no hope in that either. I don't know why
10 that was ever done, but before that Court
11 hearing takes place we need to deal with the
12 problem ourselves. We don't need some judge
13 to tell us to do that. We all know that we
14 need to deal with our own problems and the
15 only way that is going to come about and the
16 only way is resolution is going to come
17 about is when council president and the
18 mayor sit down together and hammer out an
19 agreement and do not do not stop until that
20 agreement is reached, and that's all. Thank
21 you.

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

23 Mr. Loscombe, if you don't mind, I'd just
24 like to respond?

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: Sure.

1 MS. EVANS: I have already done
2 that, Mr. McGoff, with very, very
3 disappointing, troubling results. But, you
4 know, I would certainly like you or
5 Councilman Rogan if you would like to sit
6 down with the mayor and try to work
7 something out that's better than what we
8 have proposed.

9 Now, as Mr. McGoff said some of
10 these revenue generators are contained in
11 the plan, but as optional alternatives not
12 requirements. Now, for the water conveyance
13 system the mayor wanted that sold. Council
14 agreed to that. A number appears to have
15 been picked out of the air and so council
16 asked, and this is what was Mr. McGoff
17 doesn't tell you, that the city conduct an
18 appraisal of the water conveyance system
19 prior to the sale of this city-owned asset
20 and then the projected revenue from the sale
21 would be adjusted following the required
22 appraisal.

23 As for the refuse fee, again,
24 Mr. McGoff did not tell you that any refuse
25 fee increase in 2014 and 2015 will be

1 dependent upon reductions in the Department
2 of Public Works. There have been no
3 reductions in the Department of Public
4 Works. As soon as an employee retires,
5 resigns or is fired they are replaced.

6 As for the commuter tax, the
7 administration did include it as a figure of
8 about \$1 million to \$1.2 million, whereas
9 according to the report provided by PEL from
10 the institute for public policy, they're
11 projecting \$4 million would be collected in
12 year one.

13 Sale or lease of parking meters
14 should be deleted and you don't have to make
15 up that \$6 million because what Mr. McGoff
16 is forgetting is that \$6 million when you
17 sell those parking meters to the Scranton
18 Parking Authority the city has got to
19 guarantee that debt, and just like the city
20 right now had to make a bond payment because
21 the Parking Authority is upside down it's
22 expenditures exceed it's revenues. The city
23 is responsibility for that for the next, I
24 don't know, it's at least 24 years.

25 Now, you might want to pretend that

1 doesn't exist or that they are not really on
2 the hook for it, but they are. We have seen
3 that already. We just paid them a million
4 dollars. Well, we paid the million dollars
5 because they can't.

6 Then we have the parking meter
7 enhancement program. Well, I refer the
8 administration to the presentation made by
9 Mr. John Miskel the Spring of 2011, he put
10 in writing, and each council member has it,
11 the proposed revenue that would be brought
12 in by the implementation of the parking
13 meter enhancement program.

14 As for the IAM union Local 2462,
15 yes, it's in the plan actually, but the
16 administration lists it as having a contract
17 and that the cuts to this union aren't going
18 to begin to occur until 2015, but that union
19 has no contract right now. It was never
20 approved by city council and so if the mayor
21 wants to follow his own Recovery Plan here
22 from the get go he needs to sit down and
23 start negotiating that 10 percent reduction
24 in their union that he proposed in his very
25 own plan rather than covering it up in his

1 plan and pretending to have a contract and
2 putting it off until 2015 because they do
3 not.

4 Then the payment in lieu of taxes,
5 well, as we all know the mayor doesn't enjoy
6 trying to pursue any of that, and it's
7 amazing to me though because, you know, as I
8 said last week, I talked about the mayor of
9 Providence Road Island and how he has
10 brought in tens of millions more in 2012
11 from the biggest nonprofits in this city and
12 you know why? The mayor went to them and
13 said, "Providence is going bankrupt. We
14 need your help. You have got to step up to
15 the plate or we are going under."

16 And they did and then we have the
17 mayor, it's mayor Vaughn D. Spencer of
18 Reading, he is also been working on PILOT
19 payments, he sent letters out in April to
20 the property tax exempt organizations, 240
21 of them, asking them to contribute or to
22 increase their contributions. They have
23 been responding. One, for example, who used
24 to give a \$1,000 a year increased it to
25 \$5,000, so since the end of April he has

1 brought in an additional \$38,000.

2 Now, in the big scheme of things in
3 Scranton I know that's not a lot of money
4 with what we are facing, but you know what,
5 that's a good effort. In addition to that,
6 he has asked them -- he sent more letters
7 out this month asking them to help the city
8 conduct a hundred cleanups around the town
9 or adopt a block or a park and maintain it
10 and they are answering that, too, but in
11 Scranton nothing happens and the only reason
12 any nonprofit was ever approached is because
13 this council did it and as a result we got
14 it.

15 MR. MCGOFF: That's not true either,
16 because when I was president of the council
17 we did go to many of the nonprofits.

18 MS. EVANS: Well, not that I was
19 aware of and I was here, but this council
20 went and every University slammed the door
21 in our faces, so I think what you need is a
22 mayor on board acting as other mayors do and
23 reaching out to all of these nonprofits,
24 explaining the situation and asking for
25 their help and putting it in writing and

1 then publicizing who gives and who turns
2 their cheek, just as was done in Providence
3 and just as is being to know in Reading.

4 And as for DCED and PEL, according
5 to a lawsuit filed by the mayor against
6 council they have already approved the
7 mayor's Recovery Plan so they are not
8 interested in our suggestions. They had
9 them, they were aware of them, they have no
10 interest in them.

11 And on that note, I'm going turn it
12 over to Councilman Loscombe.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you. Just a
14 couple of comments. First some good news,
15 someone asked me before about the
16 firefighters, I received a letter as of
17 Saturday the SAFER grant will be in effect
18 and 17 firefighters will be brought back on
19 the job. As I stated though it's still
20 going to be -- there are still going to be
21 some brownout situations. They were looking
22 for the full amount and they returned three
23 and a half million, so we'll discuss that
24 another time.

25 But I would like to commend the

1 union presidents that were here representing
2 their members and, you know, the courtesy
3 they showed and I believe they see the whole
4 picture especially, you know, police and
5 fire who have had negotiations with this
6 administration many times and walked away
7 happy and then the next day found out that
8 the deal fell through as they alluded this
9 evening to a possible savings of \$15
10 million, which is very close to falling
11 through at this point and another
12 arbitration that will be coming up shortly
13 that they agreed to let go. And Mrs. Evans
14 read a letter from Attorney Jennings, that's
15 back on the table. That could be a
16 considerable amount of money. I just don't
17 understand it.

18 But I do want all of the city
19 employees and retired employees, it's hard
20 to get the message out, as someone mentioned
21 before, because they believe everything they
22 read in the print and, you know, sometimes
23 it's right and sometimes they use sound
24 bites and maybe tweak it a little bit
25 differently, but, you know, I believe those

1 who observe the meetings live or who are
2 here in person can see the whole picture.

3 As I have stated many times, we are
4 not perfect, we don't have all of the
5 answers, but we have worked hard, we have
6 opened up our time to meet with the mayor
7 and different administration officials and
8 stuff like that, but I do want to say to all
9 of those employees, it was the mayor who
10 unilaterally changed their wages. I found
11 out from the news media.

12 You know, it's okay to sit there on
13 TV and the newspaper and blame council for
14 everything, but, you know, don't count us in
15 when there is decisions to be made, but
16 still blame us and the leveraging that's
17 been going on, you know, I have been doing a
18 lot of thinking the last week or so and I
19 have to agree, not that I'm a friend of PEL
20 or DCED, but I could see it. They are
21 looking for their own longevity. That's why
22 they are pushing for a plan. I find it
23 interesting that the plan expired in 2005
24 and we have never had a problem getting a
25 bank to give us money all the way up until

1 now until this council tightened the purse
2 strings, and I said it before and I'll say
3 it again, a smart bank would feel more
4 confident now, I don't understand, but I
5 think it's a conspiracy with DCED and PEL to
6 force a plan for their longevity here, and I
7 have agree with many of the comments, kick
8 them out. I'm not in favor of them, they
9 haven't helped us, we are farther and
10 farther in debt after 20 years with them
11 here, and even with the plans in place they
12 have let the mayor pick and choose, yet
13 under a prior administration they sanctioned
14 him for minimal infractions. So as
15 Mrs. Evans said, the only plan that would
16 work is one that has teeth, and I still
17 don't see one having teeth.

18 It just amazes me that, you know,
19 all of a sudden they need a plan. We have
20 the agreement in place, as Mr. Hughes said,
21 for the borrowing which is outside of the
22 Recovery Plan, the bank approved the tax
23 increases there, did DCED and PEL going
24 knocking on the bank's door and say, "Hey,
25 hold up, we are going make them come up with

1 a plan."

2 We want to protect your taxes going
3 up. That's the only plans they have ever
4 come out with, raise your taxes, raise your
5 garbage fees. They haven't been creative in
6 anything, and that's a disappointment to me
7 because we get blamed just as much and we
8 have nothing to do with that, and we are
9 holding strong here to fight.

10 Obviously, i believe there will be a
11 tax increase but we've got to keep it to the
12 minimum and a plan that doesn't include the
13 funding for -- they didn't even include the
14 parking garage so that was a wrong situation
15 there, but as I stated many times here, if a
16 plan does not have the full agreement that
17 was reached with the unions to save us that
18 money we don't know where we are going
19 forward. If we don't have a signed
20 agreement in that plan what are we going to
21 guess at, 14 million? 30 million? You
22 know? That's a big significant difference.
23 That's not a plan. A plan should show
24 everything right up-to-date and we know
25 where we are going forward.

1 And I agree if, you know, the mayor
2 wants to be part of this, he is the head man
3 here. He is the head man when he wants to
4 be. When he doesn't want to be it's us,
5 it's our fault, but what I'm saying is he
6 has us on the precipes right now and he is
7 going to the newspapers and the news media
8 every day, I welcome the mayor to come here
9 and sit with us as a body at any time. Any
10 time. He is the head of this city. He has
11 to come here and sit with us if he wants to
12 get a Recovery Plan together, not one or
13 renege people because we see what happens
14 when you go in one-on-one, one or two. No
15 more of that. It's got to be done here in
16 public with all council people, and if he
17 fails to do that that's his problem. That's
18 his fault.

19 We are here trying to work for you,
20 and again, as someone stated before the
21 comments from people on the streets and
22 stuff like that, yes, they are observing the
23 printed media because it's, you know, it's
24 all one-sided. It's his way or no way and
25 people have to realize that at this point,

1 and I'm getting frustrated myself. I'm
2 telling you, it's wearing me out. I can't
3 imagine my colleagues, especially my
4 president here.

5 I don't know where I'm going. I
6 don't know where this city is going, but we
7 have met with the mayor, I have met with him
8 personally, every one of us has met with him
9 personally and we are no farther ahead at
10 this point. Let's all meet together then,
11 the mayor in front of everybody. Show the
12 people what he is doing here. Show him why
13 he is the mayor.

14 Again, that bank should have given
15 us that loan, it was already approved, so
16 use that as a poor excuse, but secondly, we
17 haven't had a plan since 2005 and the banks
18 have given us money freely every year and
19 all of a sudden they want a plan, but enough
20 said on that because we have discussed that.

21 But it was alluded to tonight, and I
22 wasn't going to comment on it, but Chris
23 Kelly pointed out in his Sunday slam, I may
24 not be the most eloquent speaker, but my
25 comments come from my heart, my experience,

1 and from those of you who I meet on the
2 street or through e-mails I address your
3 situation, your problems. I'm one of you.
4 I'm not the country club set. I'm an
5 average Joe in this town, I'm not a
6 politician, never planned on being a
7 politician, I don't plan on going any
8 further, I'm not looking for any additional
9 office, I just came to this position at the
10 urging of my family to try and help with
11 this city and, you know, we are accused of
12 being a super majority and all of that,
13 again, I take that with respect because
14 finally there is a majority of people
15 fighting for the average citizen in this
16 town. That's the way I feel.

17 And I run into people all the time
18 grocery stores, drug stores, on the street
19 walking, and they are all telling me to keep
20 up the fight, we have to keep up the fight
21 for them and we see that and we know that
22 they can't handle the 78 percent tax
23 increase, and some of the comments made
24 about the revenue sources that we put in,
25 oh, well, you know, there's no hard numbers,

1 it's a little too late, we don't have this
2 and that, these ideas were given years ago
3 to them, you know? Don't wait until we are
4 falling off the cliff and use that excuse,
5 that's exactly what's happening.

6 But again, you know, I didn't have
7 -- just like I was talking about Chris Kelly
8 and his article Sunday, you know, I just
9 have to say up here I don't have the luxury
10 of sitting at computer with my dictionary
11 and thesaurus. What you see is what you get
12 and, you know, I'm not apologizing for that
13 and I'm working for you. Thank you.

14 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Councilman
15 Loscombe. Councilman Joyce, do you have any
16 motions or comments?

17 MR. JOYCE: I have a few comments,
18 as one knows there has been a great deal of
19 talk about the mayor's proposed Recovery
20 Plan. It has been the goal of Scranton City
21 Council to achieve a Recovery Plan that
22 works for everyone. Both Mrs. Evans and I
23 met with the mayor a number of times for
24 months to discuss the construction of a
25 Recovery Plan that works for everyone.

1 However, the mayor left out many of
2 council's recommendations and ideas for
3 revision or at least in their entirety.

4 It should be the goal of council and
5 the mayor to have a joint plan, not a
6 one-sided plan. It is still the goal of
7 council to have a joint plan that works in
8 the best interest of the residents of the
9 city. For instance, Mr. McGoff offered some
10 ideas than were e-mailed to Mayor Doherty in
11 regards to the Recovery Plan, those were
12 some requirements by city council and I'll
13 just go over some of them again.

14 One, the sale of the water
15 conveyance system, this was in the mayor's
16 plan, however, it was council's intention to
17 that the city should conduct an appraisal of
18 the water conveyance system prior to the
19 sale of the system to the Scranton Sewer
20 Authority and, furthermore, that the
21 projected revenue from the sale must be
22 adjusted following the required appraisal.

23 The refuse fee, an increase in the
24 refuse fee is in the mayor's Recovery Plan
25 however, it was council's intention that in

1 2013 council would not increase refuse fees
2 and real estate taxes simultaneously and
3 that any refuse fee increase in 2014 and
4 2015 would be dependent upon reductions to
5 the Department of Public Works.

6 Three, the commuter tax. This was
7 included in the Recovery Plan and projected
8 at about \$1.5 million for the first year.
9 However, according to the study provided to
10 PEL by the Institute for Public Policy, it's
11 projected that \$4 million may be collected
12 by instituting a commuter tax.

13 The sale and lease of the parking
14 meters. This was a part of the mayor's
15 Recovery Plan, however, it was the intention
16 of the city council that the parking meters
17 not be sold or leased to the Scranton
18 Parking Authority.

19 Parking Meter Enhancement Program.
20 This was not the part of the mayor's
21 Recovery Plan, however, it was the intention
22 of city council that the city shall
23 implement a parking meter enhancement
24 program in 2012, and that projected revenues
25 for fiscal years 2012 through 2015 shall be

1 included in the Recovery Plan. This was not
2 done.

3 The sale or the lease of the parking
4 garages. Because the City of Scranton is
5 unable to fund the Parking Authority's
6 annual financial obligations, SPA parking
7 garages must be sold or leased either in
8 part or in their entirety.

9 Tax increases. In 2013 the tax
10 increase should only be what the
11 Court-ordered millage was for the borrowing
12 and subsequent years no more than 10
13 percent.

14 Payments in lieu of taxes. It was
15 the intention of the city council to require
16 tax exempt contributions to be increased by
17 \$300,000 per year in the revised Recovery
18 Plan. As the previous Recovery Plans, the
19 mayor and the business administrator would
20 be charged with the collection of such
21 payments.

22 IAM Union Local 2462, which is the
23 clerical union, to this date the union
24 doesn't have a contract. The legislation
25 was tabled by city council and remained so.

1 With this in mind, it was Scranton City
2 Council's intention that the city negotiate
3 with the union to achieve immediately a
4 reduction of 10 percent as mandated by the
5 Pennsylvania Economy League.

6 Work force mandates, city council's
7 requirement was that it was -- is the
8 intention of the city to negotiate good
9 faith with the bargaining unit
10 representatives of its employees to decrease
11 city expenditures, provide for the health,
12 safety and welfare of all of its citizens
13 and produce stability for the city, its
14 residents and municipal unions.

15 Any settlement that is mutually
16 agreeable to the elected leadership of the
17 city and it's municipal leaders shall be
18 implemented and shall supercede any related
19 provisions and mandates enumerated
20 throughout the Recovery Plan.

21 City council approval that was
22 another thing that wasn't included. It was
23 city council's intention that any and all
24 amendments to the 2012 Recovery Plan shall
25 be approved by Scranton City Council because

1 currently the way it stands any adjustments
2 to our Recovery Plan can only be approved by
3 PEL and DCED.

4 And with that, I have a few
5 citizens' requests: Daron Northeast,
6 residents of lower Greenridge have voiced
7 their concerns that property owned by Daron
8 Northeast contains grass and weeds and has
9 not been cut this summer. Residents have
10 informed that this is leading to rodent
11 infestation in their back yards and would
12 like to see the problem resolved as soon as
13 possible.

14 Mrs. Krake, can you please contact
15 Director Seitzinger and ask him to handle
16 this situation in the best way that he sees
17 fit.

18 Kane Street, Minooka residents have
19 voiced their concern with Scranton City
20 Council that there are huge potholes on Kane
21 Street that need to be filled. Residents
22 fear that the situation is causing a
23 dangerous situation since motorists are
24 veering in the opposite lane to avoid the
25 potholes.

1 Mrs. Krake, will you please contact
2 Director Dougher and ask him to handle the
3 situation in the best way that he sees fit.

4 And Scranton's City Council's office
5 has been notified of large potholes in the
6 following locations that need to be filled.
7 These locations are the 300 block of
8 Mulberry Street, the corner of Wyoming and
9 Spruce Street across from the bank, 100
10 block of Meadow Avenue in front of the CVS
11 pharmacy, the 300 block of Meadow Avenue in
12 front of Wells Fargo Bank.

13 Mrs. Krake, please add these to the
14 issues to contact Director Dougher about,
15 and that is all for tonight much.

16 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Good
17 evening. First, I ask for your prayers for
18 Arlene Devine who passed away this week.
19 Beloved mother, sister, friend and cherished
20 grandmother, affectionately known as "Ween."
21 Arlene worked here in city hall in the
22 Treasurer's Office where her keen wit and
23 tireless commitment to continue to work long
24 as she was able will be sorely missed. God
25 bless you and keep you, Arlene.

1 This morning Mayor Doherty through
2 his solicitor Paul Kelly presented a
3 Petition for Special Relief and Rule to Show
4 Cause and motion -- or, excuse me, in motion
5 Court before Judge Mazzoni. Council
6 Solicitor Boyd Hughes was present to
7 represent the four members of Scranton City
8 Council whom the mayor has taken to Court.

9 At this time, I ask Solicitor Hughes
10 to inform the public regarding the
11 proceedings.

12 MR. HUGHES: Yes, Madam President.
13 Ordinarily it would only take a few minutes
14 to go in, I didn't have to be there, I just
15 went in to inform the Court as to what my
16 position was regarding this lawsuit. After
17 a petition and rule was presented, Attorney
18 Kelly wanted to present Judge Mazzoni with
19 some material regarding the financial
20 condition of the city and Judge Mazzoni told
21 him that the only purpose of this was to
22 establish a date for council to answer the
23 petition and set a hearing date for the
24 rule.

25 I told Judge Mazzoni that while we

1 had been served the complaint last Thursday,
2 due to my schedule I have been very busy, I
3 have perused it. I informed him that in my
4 opinion this complaint and the legal issues
5 presented would be akin to Arizona Senate
6 Bill 1070 that raises substantial
7 constitutional issues. I will be presenting
8 preliminary objections to this complaint.
9 There is -- I won't state exactly what they
10 are tonight. It will be filed and I believe
11 that our position will be meritorious to
12 have this unfounded complaint dismissed.

13 I have appellate cases in our favor
14 that the Court cannot grant an injunction
15 against council, it can't issue a mandamus
16 as requested by the mayor, after which
17 discussion back and forth, Judge Mazzone
18 stated that he had reviewed the entire
19 lawsuit preparation for the presenting of
20 the petition today. My notes reflect that
21 he stated that he has doubts about the
22 validity of the lawsuit. He said the city
23 is asking this Court to instruct a
24 legislative body to legislate. I don't know
25 if that request is appropriate.

1 In my opinion it's not, it's
2 contrary to the law, that's what why I'm
3 going to file preliminary objections. They
4 will be filed and when it is the rule will
5 be no hearing on -- it was set for today --
6 or today that was set for August 3 because
7 the preliminary objections that I filed will
8 be the same preliminary hearing objections I
9 filed to the answer which was due July 16.

10 Once the preliminary objections are
11 filed, they will have a briefing schedule
12 and there will have to be argument on that.
13 I would say that will probably be after
14 Labor Day.

15 Judge Mazzone, wanted to know why
16 the Recovery Plan was not introduced by
17 council. I stated that was on my advice on
18 the basis that there were people present
19 there from PEL and DCED. Based on the fact
20 that, and I stated this before, that the
21 procedural requirements of Act 47 for the
22 amendments to the plan were not complied
23 with that had this been introduced and
24 adopted that any member of the public could
25 file a taxpayers' suit and challenge it and

1 I believe they would win, and as a result
2 that's I think that is going to be part of
3 my preliminary objections from a procedural
4 standpoint is to why the Recovery Plan could
5 not be introduced.

6 That's pretty much what happened.
7 To go on, we had to go down to the Court
8 Administrator and Mr. McLane, you know,
9 looked at the Court schedule. Pursuant to
10 the local rules of Court I would have 20
11 days to answer the petition and that's
12 pretty much what it comes down. I believe
13 it was 19 days, maybe 18 days the 16th, in
14 two days the 28th, tomorrow is the 29th and
15 the 30th, so I don't mind that, but we will
16 be filing preliminary objections to the
17 complaint and they will have to be argued.

18 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Attorney
19 Hughes. Tonight, I state for the record
20 once again that refinancing at a \$5 million
21 figure was included in the mayor's proposed
22 budget and business administrator Ryan
23 McGowan and Mayor Doherty asked city council
24 to increase the dollar amount to 6.4
25 million. Mr. McGowan stated that because

1 the city would pursue refinancing early in
2 2012 and an additional \$1.4 million would be
3 realized from the transaction. Council
4 cooperated.

5 In addition, city council never
6 proposed unfunded debt borrowing. That was
7 the brain child of the Pennsylvania Economy
8 League and the administration. Council was
9 not even aware of such a possibility for the
10 city and what it would entail until we were
11 advised by the administration to include
12 such borrowing in our amendments, and in the
13 spirit of cooperation we did so. These are
14 the facts, try as Chris Doherty might to
15 twist them in the local media.

16 Further, council followed through on
17 its actions and approved legislation in 2012
18 for up to \$26 million in unfunded debt
19 borrowing, refinancing and a Court-ordered
20 tax increase to repay the 9.85 million in
21 unfunded debt borrowing. These are facts.
22 Mayor Doherty is a desperate man using
23 desperate measures to bully city council and
24 to hand all of his debt to you, the
25 taxpayers.

1 However, Councilman Joyce,
2 Councilman Loscombe and I are standing
3 strong together against the mayor's 78
4 percent tax increase. This is unequivocally
5 not a personal fight between the mayor and
6 council or the mayor and me, as some have
7 suggested. This is purely about you, the
8 people. We don't want you to lose your
9 homes and blacken your credit ratings
10 because you can't pay monstrous tax
11 increases.

12 After nine years in this council
13 seat, you know how hard I have worked for
14 you, fought for you, exposed the
15 mismanagement and secret financial
16 transactions of this administration, PEL and
17 DCED and stopped wasteful spending. You
18 elected a council supermajority because you
19 trusted me and you wanted a council to
20 create a balance of power, not act as a
21 rubber stamp. Rest assured that we three
22 will continue to stand firm and strong for
23 the people of Scranton, not merely in our
24 words but in our work and our actions.

25 We attended negotiations with the

1 change it's classification to a Third Class
2 city. Governor Corbett certified the census
3 reports of the city. The city will
4 immediately enforce the 15 percent parking
5 tax. The city will immediately adopt and
6 enforce a parking meter program. PEL, which
7 acts as a lobbyist in addition to its role
8 as Act 47 coordinator for distressed
9 Pennsylvania municipalities and DCED will
10 lobby for a payroll tax immediately. The
11 administration will negotiate immediately a
12 10 percent reduction with IAM Union Local
13 2462 because it has no new contract.
14 Immediately increase PILOTS from large tax
15 exempts and aggressively peruse payments,
16 and Councilman Rogan strongly recommends the
17 privatization of the Scranton Sewer
18 Authority.

19 Now, all of this could have been
20 happening all of these months, but the mayor
21 has done nothing. The solution is clear and
22 reasonable, the mayor must include council's
23 recommendations plan into his revised
24 Recovery Plan in order to generate new
25 revenue and cut his 78 percent tax increase.

1 Mayor Doherty's 78 percent tax
2 increase is out of the question because the
3 taxpayers can't afford it. They don't have
4 incomes or salaries that can support a 78
5 percent increase, therefore, the city won't
6 realize those monies. So if we want to talk
7 about fabricating revenue and revenue that
8 can't be counted on, a 78 percent tax
9 increase is not revenue that can be counted
10 on because it's not going to come in and I
11 don't know what city council now or in the
12 future is ever going to even vote for a
13 budget that includes a 78 percent tax
14 increase, and in January raise the millage
15 to meet that tax increase. I don't think
16 are going to find four or five Scrantonians
17 who are going to do that.

18 What the mayor will create, however,
19 is blight and flight. Blight in our
20 neighborhoods as Scrantonians lose their
21 homes, and flight from our city by those who
22 can still afford to get out.

23 City council wants the tax increase
24 cut by alternate revenue generators, yet the
25 mayor has done nothing to bring an extra

1 dollar into our city except through taxes,
2 of course. No parking meter program, no
3 enforcement of the parking tax, no
4 enforcement of the rental registration
5 program, no attempt to increase PILOT
6 payments, unlike the mayors of Reading and
7 Providence, Rhode Island, who took immediate
8 action in 2012 and met with success, and no
9 cuts to his spending habits.

10 As per the June 22, 2012, news
11 release from the Pennsylvania League of
12 Cities and Municipalities, he remains a
13 member of PELCM, a very costly membership,
14 which entitles him to sit on it's board of
15 directors. He is listed among them. He
16 keeps his city-owned vehicle, as do all of
17 other employees with nonemergency vehicles
18 despite councils call to return all such
19 vehicles to the city.

20 Employees who are cut in council's
21 budget amendments continue to work because
22 the mayor kept them, but Chris Doherty has
23 no problem raising your taxes 78 percent, in
24 fact, he even has help. His friends at DCED
25 and PEL have approved his revised Recovery

1 Plan to crucify the taxpayers as included in
2 his lawsuit against council and convinced
3 local banks that his plan is the answer to
4 all of the problems. Without the mayor's
5 Recovery Plan DCED and PEL don't want the
6 banks to give the city a penny. Thus, we
7 are told that no bank anywhere in the
8 country wants to lend 9.85 million to
9 Scranton, a loan which is fully guaranteed
10 by a tax increase that was already legally
11 approved and adopted by the mayor and city
12 council. Does this make sense?

13 Simultaneously, the banks are asked
14 to believe that the revised Recovery Plan
15 will be followed. Despite Mayor Doherty's
16 naked record of failure to follow a Recovery
17 plans. The mayor makes and follows special
18 rules that apply only to him. As he says,
19 "Just make a Recovery Plan and pass it. You
20 don't actually have to abide by it."

21 And he certainly lived up to his
22 word because he violated his own plan
23 countless times since 2002. Perhaps the
24 best and fairest solution is to allow the
25 taxpayers of Scranton to vote on the mayor's

1 Recovery Plan in the next election,
2 particularly since DCED and PEL don't want
3 any public input regarding this particular
4 plan. They seem to think that the Act 47
5 process doesn't need to be followed at this
6 time for this select revised Recovery Plan.
7 They appear to want to avoid public hearings
8 and prevent written public comments on the
9 mayor's plan as required by Act 47.

10 Thus, it might well be best for you,
11 the people, to vote on the mayor's plan and
12 his 78 percent tax increase, and if you do
13 remember that Chris Doherty's plan also
14 sells the city-owned parking meters to
15 itself and doesn't include the full Supreme
16 Court award for the SPA bond payment, which
17 will put you on the hook for even more tax
18 increases because the mayor doesn't want
19 professional management of the Parking
20 Authority or a sale of its garages to pay
21 down it's debt. He wants you to pay that
22 debt.

23 Equally important, PEL and DCED are
24 holding this city hostage through its
25 actions involving a negotiated settlement

1 between elected city officials and the
2 municipal unions and by pouring poison into
3 the ears of local banks in order to ensure
4 that the Pennsylvania Economy League will be
5 employed by Scranton for another 20 years.

6 Ladies and gentlemen, again I say,
7 let the mayor include council's
8 recommendations for revenue generators in
9 his revised Recovery Plan. Implement and
10 enforce them as soon as possible and cut the
11 78 percent tax increase, follow the Act 47
12 process and let the taxpayers be heard then
13 city council will adopt a revised Recovery
14 Plan.

15 And finally, I have citizens'
16 requests for the week. A city resident
17 reports that Scranton police cite anyone
18 using M-80s and other illegal fireworks
19 throughout the Fourth of July holiday. Many
20 Scranton homes are older and being
21 constructed of flammable materials residents
22 fear that fires may occur to their homes and
23 wooded areas within city limits.

24 City residents ask if the DPW could
25 install a sign at the intersection of Parker

1 Street and Bailey Avenue. Plot residents
2 state vehicles block this intersection while
3 awaiting the traffic light to change at the
4 one-lane bridge over Parker Street. They
5 request a sign to indicate that the
6 intersection must remain open at all times,
7 and that's it.

8 Oh, and just one final thing, the
9 information that I cited regarding Mayor
10 Vaughn D. Spencer of Reading comes from the
11 Reading Eagle newspaper. Mrs. Krake.

12 MS. KRAKE: 5-B. AUTHORIZING THE
13 MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS
14 TO APPLY FOR AND EXECUTE A GRANT APPLICATION
15 AND IF SUCCESSFUL A GRANT AGREEMENT AND
16 ACCEPT THE FUNDS RELATED THERETO THROUGH THE
17 BJA FY 12 EDWARD BYRNE JUSTICE ASSISTANCE
18 GRANT ("JAG") PROGRAM LOCAL SOLICITATION IN
19 THE AMOUNT OF \$24,354.00.

20 MS. EVANS: At this time I'll
21 entertain a motion that Item 5-B be
22 introduced into its proper committee.

23 MR. JOYCE: So moved.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Second.

25 MS. EVANS: On the question? All

1 those in favor of introduction signify by
2 saying aye.

3 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

4 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

5 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

6 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
7 have it and so moved.

8 MS. KRAKE: 5-C. AMENDING FILE OF
9 COUNCIL NO. 53, 2011, ENTITLED, "AN
10 ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND OTHER
11 APPROPRIATE OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF
12 SCRANTON TO TAKE ALL NECESSARY ACTIONS TO
13 IMPLEMENT THE CONSOLIDATED SUBMISSION FOR
14 COMMUNITY PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS
15 (AS AMENDED) TO BE FUNDED UNDER THE
16 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT (CDBG)
17 PROGRAM, HOME INVESTMENT PARTNERSHIP (HOME)
18 PROGRAM AND EMERGENCY SHELTER GRANT (ESG)
19 PROGRAM", BY TRANSFERRING \$500,000.00 FROM
20 THE COMMERCIAL INDUSTRIAL REVOLVING LOAN
21 REPAYMENT FUND TO PROJECT 12-04
22 RECONSTRUCTION OF ROADS AND HANDICAP CURB
23 CUTS.

24 MS. EVANS: At this time I'll
25 entertain a motion that Item 5-C be

1 introduced into its proper committee.

2 MR. JOYCE: So moved.

3 MR. MCGOFF: Second.

4 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
5 those in favor of introduction signify by
6 saying aye.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

8 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

9 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

10 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
11 have it and so moved.

12 MS. KRAKE: SIXTH ORDER. 6-A. NO
13 BUSINESS AT THIS TIME. SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A.
14 FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES
15 FOR ADOPTION - RESOLUTION NO. 25, 2012 -
16 AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE
17 CITY OFFICIALS TO EXECUTE AND ENTER INTO A
18 MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WITH THE
19 COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, DEPARTMENT OF
20 AGRICULTURE, BUREAU OF RIDE AND MEASUREMENT
21 STANDARDS REGARDING THE SEALING OF WEIGHTS
22 AND MEASURES AND ALSO RESPONSIBILITY WITH
23 RESPECT TO JEWELERS SCALES IN THE CITY OF
24 SCRANTON.

25 MS. EVANS: As Chair for the

1 Committee on Rules, I recommend final
2 passage of Item 7-A.

3 MR. JOYCE: Second.

4 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll
5 call, please?

6 MS. CARRERA: Mr. McGoff.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

8 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Loscombe.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

10 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Joyce.

11 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

12 MS. CARRERA: Mrs. Evans.

13 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
14 Item 7-A legally and lawfully adopted.

15 If there is no further business,
16 I'll entertain a motion to adjourn.

17 MR. JOYCE: Motion to adjourn.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Once again, before we
19 adjourn just again, please, a safe and happy
20 Fourth of July and please attend the
21 ceremonies at Nay Aug, a very nice
22 attendance would be appreciated.

23 MS. EVANS: Thank you and good
24 night.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR
OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER